

THIS PRINT COVERS CALENDAR ITEM NO. : _____

**SAN FRANCISCO
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY**

DIVISION: Muni Service Delivery and Operations

BRIEF DESCRIPTION:

Staff will present a resolution asking the SFMTA Board of Directors to endorse the recommendations for the purpose of initiating any required environmental assessment.

SUMMARY:

- The Transit Effectiveness Project (TEP) completed a comprehensive review of the Muni system, which included rigorous technical analysis, extensive stakeholder input and research of best practices from other municipalities. The TEP aims to strengthen Muni’s ability to respond to current travel needs, provide a blueprint for future service, apply best practices to service delivery and promote the system’s long-term financial stability.
- The TEP developed staff recommendations, which include three key initiatives that will transform Muni so people can get where they want to go, when they want to get there, reliably and safely.
- An Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee of the SFMTA Board of Directors reviewed 18 of the more controversial route proposals, and either supported the staff recommendation or suggested modifications.
- Staff is seeking Board of Directors’ endorsement of the recommendations for the purpose of initiating required environmental assessment.
- The City Attorney has reviewed this calendar item.

ENCLOSURES:

1. Project Overview including Appendices

APPROVALS:

DATE

DIRECTOR OF DIVISION
PREPARING ITEM _____

FINANCE _____

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/CEO _____

SECRETARY _____

ADOPTED RESOLUTION
BE RETURNED TO Julie Kirschbaum _____

ASSIGNED SFMTAB CALENDAR DATE: _____

PAGE 2

PURPOSE

Launched in May 2006, the Transit Effectiveness Project (TEP) is a joint effort by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) and the City Controller's Office to comprehensively review and evaluate Muni's transit system. The study was designed to strengthen Muni's ability to respond to current travel needs, provide a blueprint for future service, apply best practices to service delivery and promote the system's long-term financial stability. The project budget of approximately \$3 million is funded jointly through the Controller's City Services Auditor and SFMTA¹.

The TEP process prioritizes transparency and balances rigorous technical analysis, extensive stakeholder input and research of best practices from other municipalities. TEP objectives include:

- Making Muni service more reliable, convenient and attractive to our customers;
- Contributing to SFMTA's long-term financial stability; and
- Developing a five-year roadmap to transform Muni service and better meet customer and employee needs.

On September 16th, the Board heard a brief presentation and public comment on the TEP's key initiatives. TEP staff will return on September 30th to request that the Board of Directors endorse the staff recommendations for the purpose of initiating any required environmental assessment of the.

GOAL

The TEP specifically addresses four of the SFMTA's Strategic Plan goals:

- Goal 1: To provide safe, accessible, clean and environmentally sustainable service, and encourage the use of auto-alternative modes through the Transit First Policy;
Objective: 1.1 Improve accessibility across transit services
- Goal 2: To get customers where they want to go, when they want to get there;
Objectives: 2.1 Improve transit reliability to meet the 85% on-time performance standard
2.2 Ensure efficient transit connectivity and span of service
2.4 Reduce congestion on major corridors
- Goal 3: To improve the customer experience and community value, and enhance the image of the SFMTA, as well as ensure that the SFMTA is a leader in its industry;

¹ A November 2003 ballot measure (Proposition C) established created the City Services Auditor (CSA) within the Controller's Office. CSA is funded by roughly two-tenths of one percent (0.2%) of the City's overall budget (including SFMTA's) to conduct Audits, City Projects, and Performance Management functions.

PAGE 3

Objective: 3.2 Pursue internal and external customer satisfaction through proactive outreach and heightened communication conduits

- Goal 4: To ensure financial stability and effective resource utilization.

Objective: 4.2 Ensure efficient and effective use of resources

DESCRIPTION

Overview of Staff Recommendations

Over the past two years, the project team gathered an unprecedented level of ridership data, studied best practices from other transit systems and conducted extensive stakeholder outreach. As a result of this work, the following three key initiatives emerged that aim to transform Muni so people can get where they want to go more quickly, reliably and safely: (1) reliability initiatives, (2) travel time improvement initiatives, and (3) Muni route updates.

1) Reliability Initiatives. These initiatives are intended to stabilize existing Muni service and build customer confidence before implementing the Muni route updates. Muni's reliability challenges require a variety of solutions to achieve the kinds of improvements our customers demand. The TEP will focus on these five areas to make Muni service more reliable:

- More realistic schedules;
- Less missed service;
- Improved vehicle and infrastructure reliability;
- Improved service delivery management; and
- Improved congestion management.

2) Travel Time Improvement Initiatives. By reducing travel time, Muni will be able to reinvest savings into more service on the highest-demand routes, thereby making service more attractive to customers. The TEP has a goal of five percent to 30 percent reductions in travel times based on the type of route. As a pilot project, Muni selected four segments of busy routes to study potential delay reductions. These segments are:

- Mission Street (11th Street to 24th Street);
- San Bruno Avenue (Silver Avenue to Arleta Avenue);
- N-Judah (Judah Street/Sunset Boulevard to Carl/Cole Streets); and
- Market Street (Castro Street to 1st Street).

This Fall and Winter, the Department of Parking and Traffic will hire a team of traffic engineers and planners to systematically evaluate every major Muni corridor to make recommendations on how to reduce unnecessary travel delays. This team will work with Muni operators, supervisors and other frontline staff to identify and implement low cost and more capital intensive strategies.

3) Muni Route Updates. The TEP developed a comprehensive package of route change proposals to get people where they want to go more quickly and efficiently. Draft Proposals were released in February 2008 and vetted through dozens of meetings with external and internal stakeholders.

PAGE 4

The staff recommendations presented in the Project Overview were revised based on the extensive stakeholder feedback.

After hearing public comment from more than 100 stakeholders at the September 16th SFMTA Board Meeting, an Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee of the SFMTA Board was formed to review the staff recommendations and consider modifications. The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee was chaired by Director Jerry Lee, and included Directors Cameron Beach and Bruce Oka. The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee met on September 24 and October 1, 2008 with TEP staff to review 18 of the more controversial route proposals, and either supported the staff recommendation or suggested modifications, as detailed in the memorandum from Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee Chairman Director Lee (sent under separate cover).

Staff developed the attached “budget neutral” proposals to ensure that the route improvements could be implemented under the two-year adopted SFMTA operating budget. To fully implement the recommendations, up to a \$200 million one-time capital investment will be needed over the five-year implementation window. However, many of the changes can be realized without significant capital resources. Additional work is required to fine-tune the plan’s capital recommendations, identify funding sources and integrate the recommendations into the SFMTA’s Capital Improvement Program (CIP).

The project team also developed a set of “enhanced” proposals, which would require up to \$150 million in additional operating dollars annually, and that are designed to set a longer term roadmap for the SFMTA to grow Muni service. The enhanced proposals will also require capital investments including additional vehicles. A detailed cost estimate for the enhanced plan has not been developed and will be informed by follow up studies.

Both sets of recommendations are based on a service policy framework that identifies four route categories: Rapid, Local, Community Connector and Specialized Service. The highest level of investment would go into the Rapid Network, which the majority of Muni customers use regularly. These four categories are defined below:

- Rapid Network (service at least every 5 to 10 minutes): These frequent, heavily used lines make up the backbone of the Muni system and would be prioritized for premium service and improved customer amenities.
- Local Network (service every 10 to 15 minutes): These somewhat less utilized but still essential routes complement and connect to the Rapid Network, allowing customers to get to most destinations in San Francisco with no more than one transfer.
- Community Connectors (service every 15 to 30 minutes): This category includes lightly-used bus routes that circulate through San Francisco’s hillier neighborhoods, filling gaps in coverage and connecting users to key transit hubs.
- Specialized Services: These routes are tailored to serve a particular market at limited times of day, and include express lines, commuter feeders to BART and Caltrain stations, and ballgame routes.

Route Recommendations – Budget Neutral Scenario

The operating budget neutral route proposals ensure that the route improvements can be implemented with existing resources. Highlights include:

- Establishing a Rapid Network that prioritizes high-ridership bus and rail corridors for frequency and customer amenity improvements.
- Restructuring routes to prioritize transit service in high-ridership areas, eliminating unproductive or duplicative service.
- Expanding limited-stop service on high frequency bus routes to offer time-sensitive travelers a more competitive alternative to the automobile.
- Adding a fleet of smaller, neighborhood-friendly vehicles designed to serve lighter ridership routes along some of San Francisco's narrower neighborhood streets. TEP staff are researching vehicle options that can accommodate approximately 20 to 25 passengers and will prioritize low emissions and accessibility to all Muni customers.
- Improving cross-regional travel by providing better connections between neighborhoods and regional transit hubs.

Route Recommendations – Enhancements Requiring Additional Funding

In addition to developing a set of budget neutral route proposals, the TEP project team also developed a set of enhanced proposals as a roadmap for the SFMTA to grow Muni service. The enhanced plan includes four components that would strategically bolster Muni by increasing service, adding key extensions and further improving regional connections. Each component could be implemented separately or as a package of improvements. To implement the enhanced plan, the SFMTA Board of Directors would need to identify additional funding sources; new capital investments would be needed as well, including new overhead wire and rail tracks, new vehicles, and new operations and maintenance facilities. The four elements of the enhanced plan are listed below and described in the attached enhanced plan summary:

- More Rapid and Express services;
- New network connections;
- More Local and Community Connector services; and
- More robust evening service.

Next Steps

In anticipation of the project's implementation phase, the TEP team has been moved to the Muni Service Delivery and Operations Division. Additionally, to streamline upcoming work the team has been expanded to include Muni Service Planning.

Each priority initiative will have its own implementation-critical path. Work is well underway to

PAGE 6

stabilize the reliability of the existing service. Key initiatives include hiring more operators to reduce missed runs and initiating a program to reduce early terminal departures. The Division of Parking and Traffic is currently forming a dedicated team to implement travel time improvement initiatives. This team will work with Muni operators and frontline managers to systematically evaluate every major Muni corridor and recommend delay reduction strategies. One of the team's upcoming tasks will be developing recommendations for consolidating bus stops.

The recommendations for Muni route updates, as well as other proposals of the TEP, will be reviewed by the Planning Department's Major Environmental Analysis unit for purposes of compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The Planning Department, under CEQA and Chapter 31 of the Administrative Code, will determine which recommendations may result in a project (or projects) requiring further environmental review. TEP staff will also conduct a Title VI assessment (for compliance with the Civil Right Act of 1964), as required by the Federal government, to document that the proposed route updates do not discriminate in the provision of service against minority or low income residents.

Updating Muni routes systemwide will require a phased approach. The attached route proposals reflect the TEP's vision for the Muni system five years after implementation begins, but more work is needed to determine the timeline for changes to each individual route. SFMTA is in the process of hiring a consulting firm to assist with this phasing. Consultants will work with staff to create a master implementation schedule that considers a variety of factors, including agency capacity and the timing of new capital investments (e.g. new overhead wires).

The staff recommendations for Muni route updates are based on unprecedented ridership and performance data. Moving forward, staff will analyze updated data and evaluate the routes on an ongoing basis. Staff is currently developing a set of service performance guidelines to codify this fact-based analysis and ensure that improvements prioritize the placement of resources where they are most effective.

The City Attorney has reviewed this report.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

The staff recommendations for Muni route updates evolved through a comprehensive process that considered alternatives and included extensive stakeholder input:

- The Service Policy Framework was drafted during late Summer 2007 and shared with stakeholders, including members of the TEP's Advisory Committees and the public through a series of community workshops held in October 2007. The Framework received strong stakeholder and community support and was finalized and presented to the SFMTA Board of Directors in January 2008.
- Using the Framework as a foundation, the Draft Proposals were developed and released in February 2008. Staff conducted extensive outreach regarding the Draft Proposals to inform stakeholders about the draft changes in routes and service levels. The outreach included

PAGE 7

multiple sessions with the TEP Advisory Committees, a series of 11 public workshops, and over 50 briefings to community and other civic groups.

- Finally, the Draft Proposals were modified to incorporate the feedback from stakeholders, resulting in the staff recommendations.

OTHER APPROVALS RECEIVED OR STILL REQUIRED

No additional approvals are required at this time; however, to the extent that the SFMTA Board of Directors approves route changes after the environmental review process that result in route abandonments, the Board of Supervisors may review such route abandonments in connection with their review of the SFMTA budget and may reject such route abandonments by a 7/11 vote of the Board of Supervisors rejecting the SFMTA budget as a whole.

RECOMMENDATION

That the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors endorse the Staff Recommendations for the Transportation Effectiveness Project, as revised by the Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee, for the purpose of initiating required environmental assessment.

SAN FRANCISCO
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY
BOARD OF DIRECTORS

RESOLUTION No. _____

WHEREAS, The Transit Effectiveness Project (TEP) was a joint effort by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) and the City Controller's Office to comprehensively review and evaluate Muni's transit system; and

WHEREAS, The study was designed to strengthen Muni's ability to respond to current travel needs, provide a blueprint for future service, apply best practices to service delivery and promote the system's long-term financial stability; and

WHEREAS, The following three focus areas emerged from this analysis that aim to transform Muni so people can get where they want to go, when they want to get there, reliably and safely: 1) reliability initiatives, 2) travel time improvement initiatives, and 3) Muni route updates; and

WHEREAS, Staff has outlined initiatives to improve the reliability of the transit service that the SFMTA offers its customers; and

WHEREAS, Staff has presented initiatives to reduce travel time, thereby making service more attractive to customers; and

WHEREAS, Staff has developed operating budget neutral recommendations to update Muni routes to better reflect current travel patterns and to focus resources where they are most needed; and

WHEREAS, The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors appointed an Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee, which has met and reviewed the Staff Recommendations; and

WHEREAS, The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee supported the staff recommendation for moving the outbound terminals of the J-Church and M-Ocean View pending additional study, with the recommendation that the study should also address LRV platform accessibility needs at Balboa Park; and

WHEREAS, The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee supported the staff recommendation to discontinue 3-Jackson service and recommended additional study regarding the impact of "deadheading" trolley coaches picking up passengers; and

WHEREAS, The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee recommended that the environmental assessment study both the staff recommendation and existing route structure of the 6-Parnassus

and 7-Haight; and

WHEREAS, The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee supported the recommendation for the 12-Folsom and recommended that the SFMTA Board of Directors be kept apprised of the Eastern Neighborhoods Transportation Implementation Planning Study (EN TRIPS) that will evaluate options for improving Folsom Street; and

WHEREAS, The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee asked staff to further evaluate environmental justice implications of the proposal that, while increasing overall service on Mission Street, results in diesel coaches being used on the 14 Mission in order to enable limited-stop 14L and 49L trolley coaches to pass diesel 14 local motor coaches making all stops; and

WHEREAS, The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee supported the staff recommendation for the 17-Parkmerced and 18-48th Avenue routes, with modifications to retain Route 17 service between Stonestown and West Portal along the existing route, and to retain Route 17 service on Buckingham Way; and

WHEREAS, The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee supported the staff recommendation to discontinue 26-Valencia service, and additionally recommended that Mission Street be studied after implementation to ensure adequate service, especially for people with disabilities; and

WHEREAS, The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee supported the staff recommendation for the 36-Teresita, including changing the vehicle type to a smaller, neighborhood-friendly vehicle, with the modification that the existing route on Teresita and Myra Way be maintained between Portola Drive and Monterey Boulevard; and

WHEREAS, The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee supported the staff recommendation to eliminate the 38-Geary Ocean Beach branch, and recommended additional study to improve connectivity/ transfers for the 1-California, 18-46th Avenue and 38-Geary at the intersection of 33rd Avenue and Geary Boulevard; and

WHEREAS, The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee supported the staff recommendation to extend the 39-Coit to Pier 39, with the modification that service be retained on Union Street to Montgomery Street during a pilot program, conducted by a public/private partnership to market service and otherwise build ridership on the line, with results to be reported to the SFMTA Board of Directors; and

WHEREAS, The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee supported the staff recommendation for the 48-Quintara/24th Street with the modification that Route 48 travel on Douglass Street rather than Diamond Street between 24th and Clipper streets,

WHEREAS, The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee supported the staff recommendations to keep the 54-Felton on St. Charles Avenue, and

WHEREAS, The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee supported the staff recommendation

for 30-minute headways on the 66-Quintara, with the modification that the current route structure remain to provide service on 30th Avenue; and

WHEREAS, The Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee supported the staff recommendation to discontinue service on all or portions of the 2-Clement, 10-Townsend, 37-Corbett, and 53-Southern Heights without modifications; and

WHEREAS, The TEP project team has also developed a set of enhanced proposals as a roadmap for the SFMTA to grow Muni service; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors endorses the staff recommendations for the Transit Effectiveness Project, as revised by its Ad Hoc TEP Review Committee, for the purpose of initiating any required environmental assessment.

I certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors at its meeting of _____.

Secretary to the Board of Directors
San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency