



SFMTA
Municipal
Transportation
Agency

**SAN FRANCISCO
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY
BOARD OF DIRECTORS AND
PARKING AUTHORITY COMMISSION**

MINUTES

Tuesday, March 20, 2018
Room 400, City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place

**REGULAR MEETING
1 P.M.**

SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Cheryl Brinkman, Chairman,
Malcolm Heinicke, Vice Chairman
Gwyneth Borden
Lee Hsu
Joél Ramos
Cristina Rubke
Art Torres

Edward D. Reiskin
DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION

Roberta Boomer
SECRETARY

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to Order

Vice Chairman Heinicke called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m.

2. Roll Call

Present: Gwyneth Borden – absent at Roll Call

Malcolm Heinicke

Lee Hsu

Joél Ramos

Cristina Rubke

Art Torres

Absent: Cheryl Brinkman – with notification

3. Announcement of prohibition of sound-producing devices during the meeting.

Vice Chairman Heinicke announced that the ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at the meeting. He advised that any person responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices might be removed from the meeting. He also advised that cell phones that are set on “vibrate” cause microphone interference and requested that they be placed in the “off” position.

4. Approval of Minutes

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of the March 6, 2018 Regular Meeting: unanimously approved (Borden, Brinkman-absent).

5. Communications

None.

6. Introduction of New or Unfinished Business by Board Members

Director Torres discussed issues with the “S” permit for residential parking and requested additional information.

7. Director’s Report (For discussion only)

-Update on Vision Zero

-Ongoing Activities

Director Borden arrived.

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation discussed Sonali Bose receiving a Good Government Award; the Scott Street Diverter/Wiggle project; Polk Streetscape Project, the Castro Accessibility Improvement Project; the Van Ness Improvement Project and the pedestrian fatality in Arizona involving an Uber autonomous vehicle.

Supervisor Fewer discussed concerns she has including school crossing guards, taxi drivers experiencing financial difficulties, holding a hearing regarding assessment of the commuter shuttle fee, and the lack of language access.

No public comment.

8. Citizens' Advisory Council Report

Neil Ballard, Council member, Citizen's Advisory Council (CAC), discussed various recent recommendations including etiquette, fare proposals and fund balance. The Equity Strategy is important to continue to serve residents. Capital programs should have operating funds built into the budget.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Mark Miller urged the Board to consider a hearing to consider fees for commuter shuttles. This was presented as a cost recovery program but the Agency has said the program is voluntary. The legal disclosures that fees made pursuant to a voluntary contract are not subject to cost recovery. The SFMTA has said that the special privileges enjoyed by the taxi industry are exempt from cost recovery. The information presented to the Board hasn't been seen by the public.

Bob Feinbaum expressed "Save Muni's" support for making public City Attorney documents related to commuter shuttle and private transportation vehicles. Any revenues received should be used for Muni operations. The ultimate client of the SFMTA are city residents and that perspective should be considered when discussing whether to release those documents.

David Pilpel expressed agreement with the previous speakers regarding charging shuttles and private transportation vehicles. The advice should be made public. The fees should be increased beyond cost recovery. CAC recommendations should be transmitted in the form of a letter and be made part of the Board packet. The CAC has talked about the budget but they have not finished with their work. There may be more recommendations including the service equity and service changes. He urged caution about approving those items today.

9. Public Comment

Edward Mason discussed the commuter bus fee structure. The VTA charges fees for various items such as cell tower antennae. He discussed cost recovery fees and reconciling the use of government property for private profit. The PG&E bill has a franchise fee which would be an opportunity to investigate and correlate with medallion fees. There's sufficient reason for investigation.

Robert Cesana discussed the proposal in New York to charge Transportation Network Companies (TNCs) a congestion fee. Yesterday's accident in Arizona will result in an enormous delay in pulling out unregulated TNCs and putting in autonomous vehicles on city streets. The business plan has changed for TNCs and this accident means that TNCs will be on city streets for years. If their fees were higher, the demand would drop but that would require permission from the State. The SFMTA should look into doing a fee similar to the medallion fee for TNCs.

Herbert Weiner stated that there were arguments against bikes being licensed at the last meeting. Bikes mean less pollution and less congestion but they also violate traffic signals and put pedestrians at risk. Pedestrians who take Muni also reduce congestion but they are forced to walk further distances. It's only fair for cyclists to pay for a license. Cyclists are behaving like children.

David Pilpel noted that there was a well-attended meeting about Market Street. The Twin Peaks Project had its' first shutdown last weekend. There were a few issues. The Inner Sunset Project will have its' first shutdown this weekend. In general, there has been a fair amount of turnover with project managers. The SFMTA is on its' fifth manager for the Twin Peaks project in two years. He expressed concern about staff turnover. Another example of where we train people and then have to start over.

Carl Macmurdo discussed TNCs. It's possible that these companies are here to stay. They're providing rides at below cost which isn't sustainable. People should be prepared for the day when the taxi industry gets strong again.

Kit Mei Chan discussed crime in the Haight and requested that the bus stop at Haight and Central be restored for seniors.

Ivana Kirola discussed paratransit issues. The taxis have received money to serve the paratransit industry but there has been a decline in service for paratransit users. Ramped van drivers are driving to the airport and therefore aren't available because the airport run is more profitable. People with disabilities who use wheelchairs aren't being served.

Acting Chairman Heinicke asked staff to reach out to Ms. Chan regarding the bus stop at Haight and Central and to the Police Department regarding the public safety issues.

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS BEFORE THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR ACTION AS STATED BY THE SFMTA DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION OR CITY ATTORNEY WHERE APPLICABLE. EXPLANATORY DOCUMENTS FOR ALL CALENDAR ITEMS ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. 7th FLOOR.

CONSENT CALENDAR

10. All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and will be acted upon by a single vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Board of

Directors or the public so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item.

(10.1) Requesting the Controller to allot funds and to draw warrants against such funds available or will be available in payment of the following claims against the SFMTA:

- A. Adimika Wekanah Newton vs. CCSF, Unlitigated Claim #1701551 filed on 1/10/17 for \$35,000 (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

RESOLUTION 180320-042

(10.2) Approving the following traffic modifications:

- A. ESTABLISH – STOP SIGNS – Polk Street, northbound and southbound, at Greenwich Street.
- B. ESTABLISH – NO U-TURN – Portola Drive, eastbound, at Evelyn Way.
- C. ESTABLISH – NO U-TURN – Geneva Avenue, eastbound, at Prague Street.
- D. ESTABLISH – NO TURN ON RED – Quintara St., eastbound and westbound, at 19th Ave.
- E. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING ANYTIME EXCEPT VEHICLES DISPLAYING A PERMIT ISSUED BY THE SFMTA – Turk Street, south side, from 170 feet to 370 feet west of Gough Street.
- F. ESTABLISH – 4-HOUR PARKING, 7 AM TO 6 PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY – Division Street, north side, from 9th Street to Brannan Street; Brannan Street, both sides, from Division Street to 9th Street; and 9th Street, west side, from Division Street to Brannan Street.
- G. ESTABLISH – LEFT LANE MUST TURN LEFT EXCEPT FOR BIKES – Turk Street, westbound, at Jones St.; Turk St., westbound, at Hyde St.; Turk St., westbound, at Polk St.
- H. ESTABLISH – NO LEFT TURN ON RED – Turk Street, westbound, at Jones Street; Turk Street, westbound, at Hyde Street. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution. For every parking and traffic modification that received a categorical exemption, the proposed action is the Approval Action as defined by Chapter 31 of the San Francisco Administrative Code.)

Item 10.2 D was severed from the Consent Calendar at the request of a member of the public.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing opposition: David Pilpel

RESOLUTION 180320-043

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Heinicke, Hsu, Ramos, Rubke, and Torres

ABSENT – Brinkman

(10.3) Authorizing the Director to execute Agreement No. L18-05 with the Cow Palace for the relocation of non-operative historic streetcars, cable cars and buses consisting of approximate 31,500 square feet of paved land and a covered building, in the amount of \$2,072,457.68 for a five year term with extension options of two additional two-year terms. (Explanatory documents include a staff report, resolution and agreement.)

Item 10.3 was severed from the Consent Calendar at the request of a member of the public.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing support: David Pilpel

RESOLUTION 180320-44

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Heinicke, Hsu, Ramos, Rubke, and Torres

ABSENT – Brinkman

On motion to approve the Consent Calendar (Item 10.2 D and 10.3 severed):

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Heinicke, Hsu, Ramos, Rubke, and Torres

ABSENT – Brinkman

REGULAR CALENDAR

11. Authorizing the substitution of a letter of credit to provide credit support for the issuance and sale from time to time of Commercial Paper Notes on a revolving basis in a principal amount not to exceed \$100 million in one or more tax-exempt or taxable series in connection with the SFMTA's commercial note program to finance capital improvements which may need bridge financing in the future; approving the form of Amended and Restated Issuing and Paying Agent Agreement with US Bank, the Amended Dealer Agreements with Loop Capital and Morgan Stanley, respectively, and the form of new Letter of Credit and Reimbursement Agreement, together with the Fee Agreement, with Sumitomo Mitsui Banking Corporation, and authorizing the Director of Transportation to negotiate and execute the final forms of these agreements and take related actions for the SFMTA's commercial paper program subject to Board of Supervisors concurrence. (Explanatory documents include a staff report, forms, agreements, and resolution.)

Sonali Bose, Director, Finance and Information Technology presented the item.

No public comment.

RESOLUTION 180320-045

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Heinicke, Hsu, Ramos, Rubke, and Torres

ABSENT – Brinkman

12. Adopting the Muni Service Equity Strategy Report for Fiscal Years 2019 and 2020. (Explanatory documents include a staff report, resolution and report.)

Acting Chairman Heinicke asked Board Secretary Boomer to call Items 12 and 13 together.

Sean Kennedy, acting Deputy Director, Operational Support, presented the Items 12 and 13.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing support: Peter Papadopoulos, Bob Allen, Ace, and Peter Straus

Members of the public expressing opposition: David Pilpel, and Herbert Weiner

RESOLUTION 180320-046

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Heinicke, Hsu, Ramos, Rubke, and Torres

ABSENT – Brinkman

13. Approving the proposed service and route changes for realignment of the T Third LRV line and an increase in LRV service for the N Judah; approving the Title VI service equity analysis for these changes and making environmental findings associated with the changes. (The proposed action increasing service on the N Judah is the Approval Action as defined by the San Francisco Administrative Code Chapter 31. Explanatory documents include a staff report, resolution, analysis, and environmental documents.)

RESOLUTION 180320-047

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Heinicke, Hsu, Ramos, Rubke, and Torres

ABSENT – Brinkman

14. Presentation and discussion of the FY 2019 and FY 2020 Operating Budget, including possible modifications to various fares, fees, fines, rates and charges; possible new revenue and expenditure sources and reductions; discussion of the FY 2019 and FY 2020 Capital funding through development fees and Population-based General Fund allocation included in the FY 2019 and FY 2020 Operating Budget, expanding the institutional pass program, creating a bulk sales discount, adding a single ride low income fare, one-day pass (MuniMobile only), and reducing the visitor passport fare purchased through Clipper or MuniMobile, and adding new fees for planning/development analysis review and development project review, Clipper card

replacement, travel shows promoting San Francisco, eliminating fees for television series, etc. by non-profits and government agencies, replacement of lost SFMTA badges, and recovering fees for citations referred for Department of Motor Vehicle vehicle registration holds. (Explanatory documents include a staff report, charts, comparisons, policies and reports.)

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation, Diana Hammons, Manager, Revenue, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Tara Houseman urged the Board to give direction to staff regarding taxi medallion renewal fees. This fee is not a revenue neutral item nor is it cost recovery. It's devastating to medallion holder's budgets. The SFMTA should make all riders pay at the fare box. The fare box should make an audible sound when passengers alight. The waiver of the A card fee is only for drivers of a certain age.

Herbert Weiner said that the medallion fees are medieval and are a burden on taxi drivers. Clipper cards don't register all the time when boarding a bus. The fare box should be more efficient. He asked the Board to not raise fares. One condition for increased fares was that the service had to be more efficient. This was written in Prop. E. The burden shouldn't fall on the passengers.

Robert Cesana asked the Board to reduce or waive the medallion fee for all medallion holders. Subdividing groups is not a good thing. He wanted to sell his medallion but unfortunately there was some gerrymandering in the list so there was a priority given to people who bought a medallion. This was never discussed but it was put into action.

Rachel Hyden discussed recommendations from the San Francisco Transit Riders including fares and funding for expanding service, opening Islais Creek, and service equities. To compete with private cars and TNCs, the SFMTA needs to increase service. Transit Riders support the use of Prop. E funds to fund neighborhood, late night, and weekend service.

Marcelo Fonseca stated that it's hard to not show emotion because the taxi industry is struggling. He asked the Board to reconsider the medallion renewal fee and urged them to not be oblivious to the struggles unless a level playing field can be achieved in the market. If the fee can't be waived, he expressed support for the four percent formula of what a medallion generates to an owner, which would be about \$250.

Carl Macmurdo stated that it would be good to waive the medallion fee. Traditionally medallions brought in about \$30,000 per year so the proposed fee of \$1200 would be good in a few years but not now. It is likely that TNCs will fail in a few years. He asked the Board to let them know what it was going to do rather than keep the industry in limbo.

David Pilpel stated that the public input process has been terrible for the budget. There hasn't been enough detail on the specifics nor trade-offs and efficiencies. He is still not clear on the use of Prop. E funds for operating expenses nor about the balancing plan. Sup. Tang asked the Controller to analyze the staff at the SFMTA. Over last 15 years, there has been an increase of 695 positions, a

14% increase in staff. This has been a major increase. The “Free Muni” programs aren’t sustainable over time.

Mark Gruberg expressed appreciation for the accommodations to date for the taxi industry and for the willingness to consider additional accommodations for A card fees and color scheme fees. He questioned the fees, which amount to thousands of dollars, to establish a taxi stand. These stands are a benefit to the public, the City and the environment. It’s in everybody’s interest to waive those fees so there can be a significant expansion in taxi stands.

Vice Chairman Heinicke asked staff to look into the school crossing guard and language access issues.

ADJOURN - The meeting was adjourned at 3:57 p.m.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.



Roberta Boomer
Board Secretary

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31:
For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call (415) 554-5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax: 415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the web site: sfgov.org/ethics.