



San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Citizens' Advisory Council

MEETING MINUTES • Meeting Date: February 3, 2022

REGULAR MEETING

5:30 pm

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect our Council Members, SFMTA staff, and members of the public, the SFMTA Meeting Room (Union Square Conference Room) is closed.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Council in advance of the meeting, please send an email to CAC@sfmta.com by 5pm on Wednesday, February 2nd, or call (415) 646-2388.

REMOTE MEETING ACCESS

WATCH: (link can be found online <https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/citizens-advisory-council-cac-regular-meeting-february-3-2022>)

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: (415) 915-0757 | Conference ID: 761 115 52#

SFMTA CITIZENS' ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS

Michael Chen, Chair

Aaron Leifer, Vice-Chair

Chris Arvin

Sascha Bittner

Queena Chen

Steve Cornell

John Lisovsky

Obai Rambo

Karim Salgado

Yensing Sihapanya

Susan Vaughan

Dorris Vincent

Frank Zepeda

COUNCIL LIAISON

Christine Silva

COUNCIL SECRETARY

Keka Robinson-Luqman



ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to Order

Chair Chen called the meeting to order at 5:41 p.m.

2. Roll Call

CAC members present at Roll Call: Chris Arvin, Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Obai Rambo, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

CAC members absent at Roll Call: Dorris Vincent

CAC members absent with notification: Sascha Bittner and Karim Salgado

CAC members absent without notification: Yensing Sihapanya

3. Announcement of prohibition of sound-producing devices during the meeting.

No announcement was made.

4. Approval of Minutes:

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that he had a few non-substantive corrections to the minutes and would handle them with Secretary Robinson-Luqman offline.

On motion to approve the minutes of January 6, 2022:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Obai Rambo, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Sascha Bittner, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, and Dorris Vincent

5. Report of the Chair (For discussion only)

Chair Chen reported on upcoming CAC topics and reminded Council members to submit their vaccination status.

No public comment.



6. Public Comment

David Pilpel stated that he would love to hear more about public outreach and engagement. He suggested staff provide the CAC with a monthly list of public outreach and surveys that are underway. He also suggested adding the upcoming committee meeting dates to the CAC agenda. Mr. Pilpel also spoke about the passing of Bob Planthold and said he was a tenacious transit advocate, particularly for seniors and people with disabilities.

Edward Mason stated that he knew Bob Planthold for at least 25 years and suggested adjourning the meeting in his memory.

REGULAR CALENDAR

7. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding findings under new state urgency legislation to allow remote meetings during the COVID-19 emergency; continuing remote meetings for the next 30 days; and directing the Council Secretary to agendize a similar resolution at a council meeting within 30 days. (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that the second resolved clause states that for at least the next 30 days, meetings of the SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council and its committees will continue to occur exclusively by teleconferencing technology. Which means the resolution as written, commits the CAC to continue in this manner for at least the next 30 days.

CAC MOTION 220203.01

WHEREAS, California Government Code Section 54953(e) empowers local policy bodies to convene by teleconferencing technology during a proclaimed state of emergency under the State Emergency Services Act so long as certain conditions are met; and

WHEREAS, In March 2020, the Governor of the State of California proclaimed a state of emergency in California in connection with the Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic, and that state of emergency remains in effect; and

WHEREAS, On February 25, 2020, the Mayor of the City and County of San Francisco (the City) declared a local emergency, and on March 6, 2020, the City's Health Officer declared a local health emergency and both those declarations also remain in effect; and

WHEREAS, On March 11 and March 23, 2020, the Mayor issued emergency orders suspending select provisions of local law, including sections of the City Charter, that restrict teleconferencing by members of policy bodies; those orders remain in effect, so City law currently allows policy bodies to meet remotely if they comply with restrictions in State law



regarding teleconference meetings; and

WHEREAS, On September 16, 2021, the Governor signed AB 361, a bill that amends the Brown Act to allow local policy bodies to continue to meet by teleconferencing during a state of emergency without complying with restrictions in State law that would otherwise apply, provided that the policy bodies make certain findings at least once every 30 days; and

WHEREAS, While federal, State, and local health officials emphasize the critical importance of vaccination and consistent mask-wearing to prevent the spread of COVID-19, the City's Health Officer has issued at least one order (Health Officer Order No. C19-07y, available online at www.sfdph.org/healthorders) and one directive (Health Officer Directive No. 2020-33i, available online at <http://www.sfdph.org/directives>) that continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, such as masking, in certain contexts; and

WHEREAS, The California Department of Industrial Relations Division of Occupational Safety and Health (Cal/OSHA) has promulgated Section 3205 of Title 8 of the California Code of Regulations, which requires most employers in California, including in the City, to train and instruct employees about measures that can decrease the spread of COVID-19, including physical distancing and other social distancing measures; and

WHEREAS, Without limiting any requirements under applicable federal, state, or local pandemic-related rules, orders, or directives, the City's Department of Public Health, in coordination with the City's Health Officer, has advised that for group gatherings indoors, such as meetings of boards and commissions, people can increase safety and greatly reduce risks to the health and safety of attendees from COVID-19 by maximizing ventilation, wearing well-fitting masks (as required by Health Officer Order No. C19-07), using physical distancing where the vaccination status of attendees is not known, and considering holding the meeting remotely if feasible, especially for long meetings, with any attendees with unknown vaccination status and where ventilation may not be optimal; and

WHEREAS, On July 31, 2020, the Mayor issued an emergency order that, with limited exceptions, prohibited policy bodies other than the Board of Supervisors and its committees from meeting in person under any circumstances, so as to ensure the safety of policy body members, City staff, and the public; and

WHEREAS, The SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council has met remotely during the COVID-19 emergency and can continue to do so in a manner that allows public participation and transparency while minimizing health risks to members, staff, and the public that would be present with in-person meetings while this emergency continues; and

WHEREAS, On September 27, 2021, the SFMTA, under authority delegated by the



Planning Department, determined that the AB 361 findings described above are not a “project” under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations Sections 15060(c) and 15378(b); and,

WHEREAS, A copy of the CEQA determination is on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council and is incorporated herein by reference;

WHEREAS, On October 14, 2021, in Recommendation No. 211014-117, the Council adopted the recommended findings allowing it to continue to meet remotely for 30 days; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council finds as follows:

1. As described above, the State of California and the City remain in a state of emergency due to the COVID-19 pandemic. At this meeting, the Council has reconsidered the circumstances of the state of emergency.
2. As described above, State and City officials continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, in some settings.
3. As described above, because of the COVID-19 pandemic, conducting meetings of this body and its committees in person would present imminent risks to the safety of attendees, and the state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability of members to meet safely in person; and, be it further

RESOLVED, for at least the next 30 days, meetings of the SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council and its committees will continue to occur exclusively by teleconferencing technology (and not by any in-person meetings or any other meetings with public access to the places where any policy body member is present for the meeting). Such meetings of the Council and its committees that occur by teleconferencing technology will provide an opportunity for members of the public to address this body and its committees and will otherwise occur in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of parties and the members of the public attending the meeting via teleconferencing; and, be it further

RESOLVED, That the Council Secretary is directed to place a resolution substantially similar to this resolution on the agenda of a future meeting of The SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council within the next 30 days. If the Council does not meet within the next 30 days, the Council Secretary is directed to place such a resolution on the agenda of the next meeting of the Council.



On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Sascha Bittner, Obai Rambo, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, and Dorris Vincent

8. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the SFMTA FY 2023 & 2024 Consolidated Budget and 2023-2027 Capital Improvement Program. (Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer, Finance & Information Technology. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that he supports the state of good repair and a more realistic budget. It's useful to trade off new programs for old, and it's also fine to add new positions while cutting elsewhere. One of the challenges is to increase efficiency.

Edward Mason stated that there should be a franchise tax fee on the corporate commuter shuttle buses. Currently they are operating without SFMTA permits. The agency is losing revenue from all the violations.

9. Council Member Information and Agenda Item Requests. (For discussion only)

Sue Vaughan requested the following regarding the Institutional Pass Program: how many institutions, total number of institutional passes issues, and the costs and benefits to the agency.

John Lisovsky asked the following: Looking at developer impact fees, could MTA model the potential fiscal revenue to itself from:

1. Supervisor Mandelman's fourplexes legislation
2. Supervisor Mar's fourplex zoning legislation
3. Supervisor Safai's fourplex zoning legislation
4. Mayor Breed's charter amendment on streamlining some housing developments
5. Mayor Breed's "Cars to Casas" zoning legislation
6. Approving a Housing Element and General Plan that would zone for the realistic development of 82,000 homes over 8 years, as stipulated by the state's Regional Housing Needs Allocation (RHNA)?



7. Any other significant land use proposals currently under consideration at the Board of Supervisors?

Sue Vaughan requested an update on the Commuter Shuttle Program for 2021 including the total number of commuter shuttles with Placards, the average number of stop events per day, and the total charges assessed for 2021.

Sue Vaughan requested an update on Muni service disruptions during the Omicron surge including the percentage of missed runs, the causes of those missed runs, and how the agency is preparing for future disruptions.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel suggested having staff prepare a list regarding current outreach and surveys, something summarizing missed service, and something detailing the current staffing that they send to the CAC regularly.

Edward Mason stated that he cannot find an update on the Transportation Sustainability Fee since the 2015 version, which is supposed to be update every five years.

ADJOURN- The meeting was adjourned at 8:25 p.m. in memory of Bob Planthold.

Submitted by:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'KARL' followed by a stylized flourish.

Next regular meeting: Thursday, March 3rd at 5:30pm | TBD