



San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Citizens' Advisory Council

MINUTES • Meeting Date: March 17, 2022

SPECIAL MEETING

5:30 pm

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect our Council Members, SFMTA staff, and members of the public, the SFMTA Meeting Room (Union Square Conference Room) is closed.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Council in advance of the meeting, please send an email to CAC@sfmta.com by 5 pm the day before the meeting, or call (415) 646-2388.

REMOTE MEETING ACCESS

WATCH: (link can be found online <https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/citizens-advisory-council-cac-special-meeting-march-17-2022>)

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: (415) 915-0757 | Conference ID: 190 465 159#

SFMTA CITIZENS' ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS

Michael Chen, Chair

Aaron Leifer, Vice-Chair

Chris Arvin

Sascha Bittner

Queena Chen

Steve Cornell

John Lisovsky

Obai Rambo

Karim Salgado

Yensing Sihapanya

Connor Skelly

Susan Vaughan

Dorris Vincent

Frank Zepeda

COUNCIL LIAISON

Christine Silva

COUNCIL SECRETARY

Keka Robinson-Luqman



ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to Order

Chair Chen called the meeting to order at 5:32 p.m.

2. Roll Call

CAC members present at Roll Call: Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

CAC members absent at Roll Call: Chris Arvin and Obai Rambo

CAC members absent with notification: Queena Chen

CAC members absent without notification: Dorris Vincent

3. CONTINUATION OF REMOTE MEETINGS – Discussion and possible action regarding findings under new state urgency legislation to allow remote meetings during the COVID-19 emergency; continuing remote meetings for the next 30 days; and directing the Council Secretary to agendize a similar resolution at a council meeting within 30 days. (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

No public comment.

CAC MOTION 220317.01

WHEREAS, California Government Code Section 54953(e) empowers local policy bodies to convene by teleconferencing technology during a proclaimed state of emergency under the State Emergency Services Act so long as certain conditions are met; and

WHEREAS, In March 2020, the Governor of the State of California proclaimed a state of emergency in California in connection with the Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic, and that state of emergency remains in effect; and

WHEREAS, On February 25, 2020, the Mayor of the City and County of San Francisco (the City) declared a local emergency, and on March 6, 2020, the City's Health Officer declared a local health emergency and both those declarations also remain in effect; and

WHEREAS, On March 11 and March 23, 2020, the Mayor issued emergency orders suspending select provisions of local law, including sections of the City Charter, that restrict teleconferencing by members of policy bodies; those orders remain in effect, so City law currently allows policy bodies to meet remotely if they comply with restrictions in State law regarding teleconference meetings; and



WHEREAS, On September 16, 2021, the Governor signed AB 361, a bill that amends the Brown Act to allow local policy bodies to continue to meet by teleconferencing during a state of emergency without complying with restrictions in State law that would otherwise apply, provided that the policy bodies make certain findings at least once every 30 days; and

WHEREAS, While federal, State, and local health officials emphasize the critical importance of vaccination and consistent mask-wearing to prevent the spread of COVID-19, the City's Health Officer has issued at least one order (Health Officer Order No. C19-07y, available online at www.sfdph.org/healthorders) and one directive (Health Officer Directive No. 2020-33i, available online at <http://www.sfdph.org/directives>) that continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, such as masking, in certain contexts; and

WHEREAS, The California Department of Industrial Relations Division of Occupational Safety and Health (Cal/OSHA) has promulgated Section 3205 of Title 8 of the California Code of Regulations, which requires most employers in California, including in the City, to train and instruct employees about measures that can decrease the spread of COVID-19, including physical distancing and other social distancing measures; and

WHEREAS, Without limiting any requirements under applicable federal, state, or local pandemic-related rules, orders, or directives, the City's Department of Public Health, in coordination with the City's Health Officer, has advised that for group gatherings indoors, such as meetings of boards and commissions, people can increase safety and greatly reduce risks to the health and safety of attendees from COVID-19 by maximizing ventilation, wearing well-fitting masks (as required by Health Officer Order No. C19-07), using physical distancing where the vaccination status of attendees is not known, and considering holding the meeting remotely if feasible, especially for long meetings, with any attendees with unknown vaccination status and where ventilation may not be optimal; and

WHEREAS, On July 31, 2020, the Mayor issued an emergency order that, with limited exceptions, prohibited policy bodies other than the Board of Supervisors and its committees from meeting in person under any circumstances, so as to ensure the safety of policy body members, City staff, and the public; and

WHEREAS, The SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council has met remotely during the COVID-19 emergency and can continue to do so in a manner that allows public participation and transparency while minimizing health risks to members, staff, and the public that would be present with in-person meetings while this emergency continues; and

WHEREAS, On September 27, 2021, the SFMTA, under authority delegated by the Planning Department, determined that the AB 361 findings described above are not a



“project” under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations Sections 15060(c) and 15378(b); and,

WHEREAS, A copy of the CEQA determination is on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council and is incorporated herein by reference;

WHEREAS, On October 14, 2021, in Recommendation No. 211014-117, the Council adopted the recommended findings allowing it to continue to meet remotely for 30 days; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council finds as follows:

1. As described above, the State of California and the City remain in a state of emergency due to the COVID-19 pandemic. At this meeting, the Council has reconsidered the circumstances of the state of emergency.
2. As described above, State and City officials continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, in some settings.
3. As described above, because of the COVID-19 pandemic, conducting meetings of this body and its committees in person would present imminent risks to the safety of attendees, and the state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability of members to meet safely in person; and, be it further

RESOLVED, for at least the next 30 days, meetings of the SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council and its committees will continue to occur exclusively by teleconferencing technology (and not by any in-person meetings or any other meetings with public access to the places where any policy body member is present for the meeting). Such meetings of the Council and its committees that occur by teleconferencing technology will provide an opportunity for members of the public to address this body and its committees and will otherwise occur in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of parties and the members of the public attending the meeting via teleconferencing; and, be it further

RESOLVED, That the Council Secretary is directed to place a resolution substantially similar to this resolution on the agenda of a future meeting of The SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council within the next 30 days. If the Council does not meet within the next 30 days, the Council Secretary is directed to place such a resolution on the agenda of the next meeting of the Council.



ADOPTED: AYES –Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda
ABSENT – Queena Chen, Obai Rambo, and Dorris Vincent

SPECIAL CALENDAR

4. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the SFMTA FY 2023 & 2024 Consolidated Budget. (Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer, Finance & Information Technology. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Jonathan Rewers, Acting Director, Finance & Information Technology, presented the item.

Edward Mason asked if there is a budget book with a headcount chart. Muni day passes should be at least 2.5 times the single-ride fare. He stated that there should be a franchise fee for private commuter buses and casino buses that are occupying the public space.

Hayden Miller stated that there are a lot of good things that he likes about the budget, especially free Muni for youth. Fare policy is concerning, especially from an equity perspective. The single-ride fare should be lowered. Promoting what already exists should be happening.

CAC MOTION 220317.02

WHEREAS the SFMTA CAC appreciates the outreach staff has performed over the last two months to the CAC and to the public on the 2023-2024 budget;

WHEREAS the SFMTA CAC appreciates and agrees with the agency’s focus on data-driven insights and prioritizing a state of good repair;

WHEREAS the SFMTA CAC recognizes that the agency is still in a serious, structural budget crisis despite receiving more than \$1 billion in federal relief money;

WHEREAS the SFMTA (due to a variety of factors) still lags comparable agencies in service restoration, which is key to increasing ridership;

WHEREAS the continued global climate emergency demands a transit policy that reduces a dependence on fossil fuels in transportation, the largest source of greenhouse gas emissions;

BE IT RESOLVED that the SFMTA CAC recommends that while this is not an exhaustive list, the SFMTA budget reflect the following priorities and values:

- A. Deliver Safe, Quality Service to Bring Riders Back



1. Implement 2022 Muni service restoration plan without further delay and look to further expand service as staff hiring permits
 2. Expand the Muni Forward and Temporary Emergency Transit Lane (TETL) programs to enhance Muni service safety, speed, reliability, and efficiency
 3. Fully explore programs that will increase ridership such as Free Muni for Youth, business commuter benefits programs, and other ridership incentives and marketing initiatives
 4. Implement a fare policy that freezes fares for this budget and includes a fare-capping pilot
 5. Prioritize delivering service equitably, especially for communities of concern
- B. Drive a Business Model that Ensures Long-Term Reliability and Sustainability
1. Reduce the agency's dependency on one-time cash infusions and transform to a more self-sustaining revenue model, including additional tax revenue
 2. Prioritize one-time federal relief funds towards shrinking the maintenance backlog and moving towards a fully realized state of good repair
 3. Accelerate delivery of the next-generation customer information and replacement subway train control systems
 4. Continue to eschew the previous practice of deferring maintenance in order to deliver service
 5. Promote transportation mode shifting and safer streets in recognition of our changing local travel patterns and global climate emergency
 6. Implement a fee and fine structure that provides revenue to the agency while scaling to and considering ability to pay

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Queena Chen, Obai Rambo, Yensing Sihapanya, and Dorris Vincent

ADJOURN- The meeting was adjourned at 8:21 p.m.

Submitted by:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'KAR Robinson-Luqman', is written over a horizontal line.

Keka Robinson-Luqman
SFMTA CAC – Secretary