



**SFMTA**  
Municipal  
Transportation  
Agency

**SAN FRANCISCO  
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY  
CITIZENS' ADVISORY COUNCIL**

**MINUTES**

**Thursday, March 24, 2016  
Room 7080, Union Square Conference Room  
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor**

**SPECIAL MEETING  
5:30 P.M.**

**COUNCIL MEMBERS**

**Daniel Weaver (Chair), Daniel Murphy (Vice Chair), Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew,  
Steve Cornell, Joan Downey, Steve Taber, Alex Reese, Susan Vaughan,  
Dorris Vincent, Roland Wong, and Frank Zepeda**

**COUNCIL LIAISON  
Roberta Boomer**

**COUNCIL SECRETARY  
Keka Robinson-Luqman**

## ORDER OF BUSINESS

### 1. Call to Order

Chairman Weaver called the meeting to order at 5:36p.m.

### 2. Roll Call

CAC members present at Roll Call: Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Alex Reese, Steve Taber, Daniel Weaver, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

CAC members absent at Roll Call: Dorris Vincent

CAC members absent: Roland Wong (with notification)

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting.

CAC Staff Liaison Boomer made the announcement.

### 4. Approval of Minutes

#### PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that the minutes should not say “notice of meeting” but should instead say “minutes.”

On motion to approve the minutes of March 3, 2016:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Alex Reese, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Roland Wong and Dorris Vincent

### 5. Report of the Chair (For discussion only)

No report.

### 6. Public Comment

Peter Straus stated that the SFMTA is facing a financial shortfall from state funding. The SFMTA moved to delete a 2% increase in service. The SFMTA can't fix the structural deficit by taking a little from here and from there. San Francisco needs to develop new resources to support the SFMTA. He urged the CAC to develop new financial resources for the SFMTA.

## REGULAR CALENDAR

7. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the FY17 and FY18 Capital and Operating Budgets. (Sonali Bose, Director, Finance and Information Technology) (Explanatory documents include a staff report and slide presentation.)

At the direction of Chairman Weaver, CAC Liaison Boomer called Items 7 and 8 together.

Candace Sue, Director, Communications, presented the operating budget. She stated that the SFMTA is in the final two years of the Strategic Plan which outlined a vision and set of goals for the SFMTA. She discussed recent accomplishments and the priorities for the next two-year budget cycle as well as proposed revenues and expenditures.

Councilmember Vincent arrived at 6:07p.m.

Ariel Espiritu Santo, Manager, Capital Financial Planning & Analysis, presented the Capital Budget.

### PUBLIC COMMENT:

Peter Straus stated that most recommendations from revenues are on the back of transit riders although some expenditure recommendations are for drivers. The SFMTA Board veered from Sunday meters and raised the idea of evening metering as a more palatable idea.

David Pilpel stated that there appears to be a shortfall plus an additional \$51-\$88m in expenditures and one-time uses. He stated that times are relatively good financially right now, but won't stay that way. He believes it is more prudent to maintain reserves rather than spend everything. The SFMTA should invest in the reserve fund to avoid a boom-then-bust cycle. He expressed uncertainty about the Clipper discount or cash surcharge and what the Title VI analysis yields.

8. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the Finance and Administration Committee (FAC) report and recommendations. (No explanatory documents.)

Alex Reese stated that the FAC forwarded all items to CAC for review although they were not unanimous on all items.

FAC Motion 160218.01

The CAC approves extending the T-line subway to North Beach and Fisherman's Wharf and supports inclusion of \$2 million of funding for the detailed planning and community outreach in the 2017-2018 SFMTA budget.

### PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel suggested that the CAC change the wording in the motion from “approves” to “supports” and say inclusion of funding instead of listing the specific dollar amount.

On motion to amend the recommendation to lower the amount to \$1.25m and change “approve” to “support.”

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Alex Reese, Steve Taber, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Susan Vaughan

ABSENT – Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.01

The CAC supports extending the T-line subway to North Beach and Fisherman’s Wharf and supports inclusion of \$1.25 million of funding for the detailed planning and community outreach in the 2017-2018 SFMTA budget.

On motion to approve as amended:

ADOPTED: AYES – Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Alex Reese, Steve Taber, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Neil Ballard, Susan Vaughan, and Daniel Weaver

ABSENT – Roland Wong

FAC Motion 160309.01

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA increase youth age to 18 from 17 similar to the Free Muni Program for Low and Moderate Income Youth.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that the motion would read better if amended to say “from 17 to 18” and if it was made clear that it is about the definition of youth and not the free fare program. He disagrees with the motion and believes the policy should be that as soon as one is eligible to vote, they should be subject to the adult fare. The pilot program for Free Muni for Youth is now proposed to become permanent. If Google is no longer contributing to this program, then it will end up that fare paying passengers will be paying the fare of non-fare paying passengers.

On motion to amend the recommendation to add “to bring it in line with other agencies and”:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Joan Downey, Daniel  
Murphy, Alex Reese, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent,  
Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Stephen Cornell  
ABSENT – Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.02

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA increase youth age to 18 from 17, to bring it in line with other agencies and similar to the Free Muni Program for Low and Moderate Income Youth.

On motion to approve as amended:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Steve  
Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Daniel Weaver

NAYES – Stephen Cornell, Alex Reese, and Frank Zepeda  
ABSENT – Roland Wong

FAC Motion 160309.02

To help address the FY17 and FY18 budget shortfall, the SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA establish discount fares for youth, seniors, at 50% of the adult fares.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel expressed support but is confused by the fare table. Currently, the cash fare is at 50% rounded down. Only the monthly pass would increase to 50%, which is a hefty jump. The CAC needs to consider the Title VI implications.

On motion to amend the recommendation to include “and people with disabilities”:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel  
Murphy, Alex Reese, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent,  
Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.03

To help address the FY17 and FY18 budget shortfall, the SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA establish discount fares for youth, seniors, and people with disabilities at 50% of the adult fares.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Alex Reese, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.04 (FAC Motion 160309.03)

To help address the FY17 and FY18 budget shortfall, the SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA establish a \$0.50 premium for riders paying cash to reduce cash payments and to encourage the use of the Clipper Card:

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that the SFMTA is in process of replacing fare boxes which assumes continued cash payments. He believes the SFMTA should continue to take cash fares. While the motion is written as a discount, it is actually a surcharge to cash-paying passengers. This is a significant increase for low income passengers who don't qualify for eligibility financial thresholds. He believes the SFMTA is going after transit riders to balance the budget. He expressed opposition to the motion.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Alex Reese, Steve Taber, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Susan Vaughan, and Dorris Vincent

ABSENT – Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.05 (FAC Motion 160309.04)

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA increase the commission paid to vendors from \$0.50 to \$0.75.

No public comment.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Alex Reese, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Roland Wong

CAC 160324.06 (FAC Motion 160309.05)

To help address the FY17 and FY18 budget shortfall, the SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA establish a premium fare for single rides on the express lines by increasing the adult rate by \$0.50 and the discount fares by \$0.25

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that this is a bad idea.

On motion to approve:

FAILED ADOPTION: NAYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Alex Reese, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda  
ABSENT – Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.07 (FAC Motion 160309.06)

To help address the FY17 and FY18 budget shortfall, the SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA establish a premium fare for single rides on the express lines by increasing the adult rate by \$1.00 and the discount fares by \$0.50

No public comment.

On motion to approve:

FAILED ADOPTION: NAYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Alex Reese, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda  
ABSENT – Roland Wong

FAC Motion 160309.07

To help address the FY17 and FY18 budget shortfall, the SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA increase the “A” pass by \$5.00 above the indexed price.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that this cuts different ways. Muni believes in a pass instrument; all you can eat for the same amount; while BART believes in “pay per ride.” Mr. Pilpel stated that he is interested in knowing what the current amount is and what it would take to get full cost recovery. He believes the SFMTA should explore changing the cost per ride with BART.

On motion to amend recommendation to add “reflecting the increased charge by BART for BART rides within San Francisco”:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Alex Reese, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.08

To help address the FY17 and FY18 budget shortfall, the SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA increase the “A” pass by \$5.00 above the indexed price, reflecting the increased charge by BART for BART rides within San Francisco.

On motion to approve as amended:

ADOPTED: AYES – Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel, Murphy, Alex Reese, Susan Vaughan, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Neil Ballard, Steve Taber, and Dorris Vincent

ABSENT – Roland Wong

FAC Motion 160309.08

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA provide a 50% discount to non-profit agencies that serve needy populations.

No public comment.

On motion to amend to add “for tokens and passes purchased by”:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Alex Reese, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.09

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA provide a 50% discount for tokens and passes purchased by non-profit agencies that serve needy populations.

On motion to approve as amended:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel

Murphy, Alex Reese, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent,  
Daniel Weaver, Frank Zepeda, and Mark Ballew  
ABSENT – Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.10 (FAC Motion 160309.09)

To help address the FY17 and FY18 budget shortfall, the SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA Board not lower the administrative fee for towed vehicles and not waive the fee for stored vehicles.

No public comment.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Alex Reese, Steve Taber, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda  
NAYES – Susan Vaughan and Daniel Weaver  
ABSENT – Roland Wong

FAC Motion 160309.10

To help address the FY17 and FY18 budget shortfall, the SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA eliminate the 83x line.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel suggested changing the language to “evaluate the 83x and other less productive route segments.”

Chair Weaver referred the motion to the Operations and Customer Service Committee.

FAC Motion 160309.11

To help address the FY17 and FY18 budget shortfall, further support the City’s “Transit First” policy, allow for more efficient parking management and reduce carbon emissions, the SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA reinstate enforcement of parking meters on Sunday.

No public comment.

On motion to amend to add “and evenings in appropriate locations”:

ADOPTED: AYES –Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Alex Reese,  
Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and  
Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Stephen Cornell

ABSENT – Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.11

To help address the FY17 and FY18 budget shortfall, further support the City’s “Transit First” policy, allow for more efficient parking management and reduce carbon emissions, the SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA reinstate enforcement of parking meters on Sunday and evenings in appropriate locations.

On motion to approve as amended:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Alex Reese,  
Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Stephen Cornell and Steve Taber

ABSENT – Roland Wong

Councilmember Reese left at 8:27p.m.

CAC Motion 160324.12 (FAC Motion 160309.12)

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA increase transit service hours by an additional 2% above the 10% increase already planned.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel expressed opposition to the motion. He stated that the 10% increase has been substantial. He is not sure if the good economy will continue and the SFMTA may need to trim service in the next few years, so he is good with the 10% increase for the next two years.

On motion to approve:

FAILED ADOPTION: AYES – Neil Ballard and Mark Ballew

NAYES – Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Steve  
Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and  
Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Alex Reese and Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.13 (FAC Motion 160309.13)

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA fund programs that will enhance transit performance including collision reduction, compliance with storage tank regulatory requirements, establish an independent quality assurance unit; fully staff the Transit Management Center, provide maintenance engineering and technical support to the Transit Services Division; hire dedicated transit PCOs and hire additional staff to reduce overtime.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that in general, he is supportive of improving transit performance for a reasonable cost, but he hasn't seen any details. He would probably support a lower amount. Mr. Pilpel stated that he has questions about certain things such as funding the Transit Management Center.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda  
NAYES – Stephen Cornell  
ABSENT – Alex Reese and Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.14 (FAC Motion 160309.14)

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA provide additional funding for Vision Zero program education and outreach.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel expressed opposition to the motion and thinks Vision Zero is a bad idea.

On motion to approve:

FAILED ADOPTION: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Susan Vaughan, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda  
NAYES – Stephen Cornell, Steve Taber and Dorris Vincent  
ABSENT – Alex Reese and Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.15 (FAC Motion 160309.15)

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA hire additional staff and purchase supplies to support Sustainable Streets' preventive maintenance program.

No public comment.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda,  
ABSENT – Alex Reese and Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.16 (FAC Motion 160309.16)

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA expend funds to support and enhance existing parking related applications and re-launch *SFpark*.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel expressed belief that instead of spending additional funds, the SFMTA should reprioritize and reassign staff to meet these particular needs.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, Frank Zepeda,  
ABSENT – Alex Reese and Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.17 (FAC Motion 160309.17)

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA provide funding to hire additional human resources analysts, safety specialists, storekeepers and outreach staff.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that this is another example of where staff can be reassigned. This is an example of a huge agency that needs to prioritize its staff. There has to be some discipline.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver and Frank Zepeda  
NAYES – Stephen Cornell  
ABSENT – Alex Reese and Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.18 (FAC Motion 160309.18)

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA not provide funds to hire additional tax investigators.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that he believes the SFMTA should hold the line on this.  
On motion to approve:

FAILED ADOPTION: AYES – Neil Ballard, Stephen Cornell, Daniel Murphy, and Dorris Vincent  
NAYES – Mark Ballew, Joan Downey, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda  
ABSENT – Alex Reese and Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.19 (FAC Motion 160309.19)

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA provide funds to hire additional security personnel.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that while facilities need to be maintained, funds for facilities work should be in the capital budget or should use one-time fund balance monies. Maybe the SFMTA needs to reprioritize. He expressed concern regarding investments to physical security and staffing.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda  
NAYES – Stephen Cornell and Joan Downey  
ABSENT – Alex Reese and Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.20 (FAC Motion 160309.20)

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA increase San Francisco's operating contribution to the Peninsula Corridor Joint Powers Board.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that the San Francisco contribution is included in the SFMTA budget although it's a City obligation. Caltrain should be supported.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda  
ABSENT – Alex Reese and Roland Wong

CAC Motion 160324.21

The SFMTA CAC supports funding for improved maintenance and repair of cable cars.

No public comment.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda  
ABSENT – Alex Reese and Roland Wong

Councilmember Murphy left at 9:23p.m.

CAC Motion 160324.22

The SFMTA CAC supports funding for the SFMTA's new training facility.

Chair Weaver referred the following motion to the Operations and Customer Service Committee:

The SFMTA CAC recommends that when new hires are hired, they are trained on all modes of transportation before they are certified to operate.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that he does not believe this motion is reasonably related to the budget. The CAC shouldn't vote on this.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank

Zepeda

ABSENT – Daniel Murphy, Alex Reese, and Roland Wong

9. Council Member Comment and Information and Agenda Item Requests. (For discussion only)

Chair Weaver asked councilmembers to email requests.

ADJOURN– The meeting was adjourned at 9:31p.m.

Submitted by:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'KAR Luqman', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Keka Robinson-Luqman  
SFMTA CAC – Secretary

Next regular meeting: Thursday, April 7 at 5:30pm  
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor, Union Square Conference Room, #7080