

SFMTA Municipal Transportation Agency

Commuter Shuttle Program Mid-Year Review & Hub Study

December 1, 2016 SFMTA Citizens Advisory Committee

Shuttle Program History



Why a Commuter Shuttle Program?

- Allows for regulation of shuttles
- Better operation of city streets
- Address neighborhood concerns
- Minimize conflicts between users

Commuter Shuttle Program

- Access to network of designated shuttle zones – 125 zones maximum
- Voluntary participation
- Large buses on Caltrans-designated arterials only
- Cost-neutral, because state law won't allow more
 - \$2.1 million in permit fees through August 2016

Pilot and Program

	Pilot	Program
Permitted Companies	16	17
Trips	76% intercity	86% intercity
Daily Riders	8,500	9,800
Daily Stop Events	3,200	3,200
Daily Vehicles	300	360-390
Resident Complaints	On average 30 a month	On average 30 a month

Shuttle Travel on Non-Arterials Minimized

April 2016



August 2016



Instance of Shuttle Vehicle Violation

Shuttles on Hayes Street (restricted) ⁶

Loading

- 110 total zones (max of 125)
- Stops made in shared Muni zones
 - Pilot: 72%
 - Program: 57%
- Stops made on nonarterial streets
 - Pilot: 26%
 - Program: 9%



Clean Fleet Requirements

- Meet 2012 emissions standards or better
- Pilot: 59%
- Program: 76%



Dedicated Enforcement Team

- Dedicated team of parking control officers (PCOs)
 - Monthly average of 165 citations issued since April
 - Monthly average of \$29,255 in citation revenue



Admin Fees Collected for Travel on Restricted Streets

- \$250 each, detected using GPS data
- \$514,000 in penalties since April



Complaints

- 20 30 complaints each month
- Complaints shared with operators and PCOs
- Program adjusted based on feedback



Program Challenges

- Lack of stop coverage in select areas
- Concentrated impact on select corridors
- Discontinuity in arterial network
- Enforcement resources
- Policy maker request for consideration of a hub approach

Impacts of the Program

- Program has succeeded in that there are:
 - Reduced Muni conflicts
 - Fewer shuttles on smaller streets
 - Cleaner vehicles
 - Reduced potential for service disruption
 - Resources dedicated to enforcement

Hub Study

Background:

- In February 2016, Board of Supervisors identified interest in studying a "hub" model that has fewer designated shuttle zones
- SFMTA & SFCTA agreed to study an alternative model

Purpose:

- Evaluate alternative approach
- Does a "hub" better meet the goals of a commuter shuttle program?

Four Scenarios



Single Hub



BART Oriented







Consolidated Network

Mode Shift



- Shuttle ridership predicted to drop 24% to 45%
- 1,780-3,300 more cars on the road

Annual VMT and GHG Emissions



- 50% to 85% reduction in shuttle VMT on surface streets
- 5x-8x increase in automobile VMT due to ridership decrease

Safety & Impacts on Muni

Safety

- Increase in VMT is an indicator of increased risk of collisions
- The single-hub has the largest increase in VMT

Impacts on Muni

 All scenarios would result in fewer conflicts with between shuttles and Muni



Additional Impacts

Shuttle Travel on Non-Arterials

- All scenarios: *reduced* travel on non-arterial streets **Area Parking Impacts**
- All scenarios: *more* competition for parking
- Most scenarios would require significant removal of parking

Unauthorized Shuttle Stops & Program Enforcement

- All scenarios: likely to result in *more* unauthorized stops
- All scenarios: require more enforcement

Timeline

- Current program authorized through March 31, 2017
- MTAB proposal targeted for early 2017

