



San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors & Parking Authority Commission

MEETING MINUTES • Meeting Date: Tuesday, April 15, 2025

REGULAR MEETING

1:00pm

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
Room 400, City Hall

REMOTE MEETING ACCESS

WATCH: www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE or
<https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/board-directors-meeting-april-15-2025>

SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Janet Tarlov, Chair
Stephanie Cajina, Vice Chair
Mike Chen
Alfonso Felder
Steve Heminger
Dominica Henderson
Fiona Hinze

DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION

Julie Kirschbaum

BOARD SECRETARY

Christine Silva



ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to Order

Chair Tarlov called the meeting to order at 1:05pm.

2. Roll Call

Present: Mike Chen
Alfonso Felder
Steve Heminger
Dominica Henderson
Fiona Hinze
Janet Tarlov
Stephanie Cajina

3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting

Board Secretary Silva made the announcement.

4. Approval of Minutes

- April 1, 2025, Regular Meeting

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of the April 1, 2025, Regular Meeting:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chen, Felder, Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, Cajina, and Tarlov

5. Communications

None.

6. Director's Report (For discussion only)

- Special Recognition
- Autonomous Vehicles on Market Street
- Fix-It Week
- Accessibility Survey Results
- Ongoing Activities & Events



Director Kirschbaum introduced Jonathan Rewers, Chief Strategy Officer, who recognized the Proof of Payment Program staff.

Director Kirschbaum then shared about autonomous vehicles (AVs) on Market Street, upcoming Fix-It Week, the Accessibility Services Annual Report, Climate Week and Earth Day, recent awards, and a request to adjourn the meeting in honor of Philippe “Phil” Sterlin.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Caitlin O’Malley expressed support for Waymo on Market Street, sharing that it enhances direct, independent mobility.

Fran Taylor expressed opposition to Waymo and commented that it was a disruption.

Bertha Canty shared personal challenges as a senior navigating public transit and urged the agency for better accessibility, signage and seating.

Dylan Fabris expressed opposition to Waymo on Market Street and urged the Board to stand up against the decision.

Cyrus Hall expressed opposition to Waymo’s lack of oversight and data transparency and warned that it sends the message to ride Waymo instead of public transit.

Lana Nieves expressed support for Waymo on Market Street, sharing that it offers people a choice.

Mark Gruberg expressed opposition to Waymo on Market Street, commenting about the lack of public process and warning that AVs block traffic and park illegally.

Belen Islas expressed opposition to Waymo on Market Street and shared about parenting two autistic kids and using Muni.

Anthony Ballester thanked the Board for recognizing the transit fare inspector team and expressed opposition to Waymo.

Speaker expressed concern about AVs on Market Street, the city’s most crucial corridor, sharing that the privatization of the transportation system isn’t acceptable.

Griffin Lee expressed support for AVs on Market Street, sharing that it was a step to revitalizing downtown and offers residents more transportation options.



Ross Parish expressed opposition to Waymo on Market Street and sharing that car-free Market Street is its own destination that should be preserved.

Christopher White expressed opposition to Waymo on Market Street, asked the Board to consider a resolution that opposes any additional cars on Market Street.

Dave Alexander criticized the Mayor's meetings with Waymo lobbyists and urged the Board to push back.

Ed Pike expressed support for car-free Market Street and supported a resolution on the matter from the Board.

John Dreden expressed support for car-free Market Street, sharing about improved speed and reliability on public transportation.

Jaime Vitoria urged the Board to not be too welcoming of AVs on Market Street and spoke about the negative consequences.

Mia Satya expressed opposition to Waymo on Market Street, sharing that transit should remain public and equitable, not privatized.

Malena Cabada expressed concern about vehicles on Market Street, sharing that it would threaten pedestrian safety.

Annemarie Doncor expressed support to push back on the Mayor's decision, shared about personal experience, and that congestion from AVs risks emergency response times.

Collin Dyer expressed opposition to cars on Market Street, sharing that doing so would hurt transit, public safety and economic recovery.

Russell expressed opposition to Waymo on Market Street, criticizing the privatization of Market Street while cutting public transit.

Speaker expressed opposition to Waymo on Market Street, warning that it will harm Muni efficiency and rider satisfaction.

Elliott Clark expressed opposition to Waymo on Market Street, sharing that adding cars contradicts climate and transit goals.

Speaker expressed support for a car-free Market Street and urged the agency to keep it closed to private vehicles.



Speaker advocated for multi-modal opportunities where things work together and suggested cooperation between systems.

Robin Pam shared that adding Waymo would create new problems and encouraged staff to measure impacts of Waymo and explore implementing solutions that address Market Street.

Herbert Weiner expressed concern about poor accessibility for seniors and those with disabilities using public transportation.

Director Cajina requested an update about the timeline and implementation regarding Waymo on Market Street to build public awareness.

7. Citizens' Advisory Council Report

Aaron Leifer, Citizens' Advisory Council (CAC) Chair, presented the report.

No public comment.

8. New or Unfinished Business by Board Members

None.

9. Public Comment

Members of the public may address the SFMTA Board of Directors on matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction and are not on today's calendar.

Mark Gruberg expressed support for continued taxi access on Market Street, sharing that taxis are a major component of the city's paratransit services.

Speaker expressed frustration about service cuts.

Herbert Weiner expressed frustration about the SFMTA favoring certain groups while excluding others and shared that broader community input is needed.

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS BEFORE THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR ACTION AS STATED BY THE SFMTA DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION OR CITY ATTORNEY WHERE APPLICABLE. EXPLANATORY DOCUMENTS FOR ALL CALENDAR ITEMS ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. 7th FLOOR.



Board Secretary Silva announced that Item 10.5 was removed from the Consent Calendar and would be heard separately.

CONSENT CALENDAR

10. All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be simple or routine by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and will be acted upon by a single vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Board of Directors or the public so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item.

10.1. Approving various routine parking and traffic modifications and making environmental review findings (The Planning Department has found that Items A-N are exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act [CEQA]. For these parking and traffic modifications that received a categorical exemption, the proposed SFMTA Board action constitutes the Approval Action as defined by Chapter 31 of the San Francisco Administrative Code. Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.):

- A. ESTABLISH – RESIDENTIAL PERMIT PARKING AREA C (Eligibility only, no signs), Post Street, both sides, between Larkin Street and Polk Street.
- B. ESTABLISH – RESIDENTIAL PERMIT PARKING AREA D (Eligibility only, no signs), Mission Street, both sides, between Admiral Avenue and Castle Manor Avenue.
- C. RESCIND – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING, EXCEPT PERMITTED CAR SHARE, California Street, north side, from Presidio Avenue to 20 feet easterly.
- D. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING, EXCEPT PERMITTED CAR SHARE, California Street, north side, from 20 feet to 38 feet east of Presidio Avenue.
- E. ESTABLISH – RED ZONE, California Street, north side, from Presidio Avenue to 20 feet easterly.
- F. RESCIND – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING, EXCEPT PERMITTED CAR SHARE, 4th Avenue, west side, from 12 feet to 32 feet north of Fulton Street.
- G. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING, EXCEPT PERMITTED CAR SHARE, 4th Avenue, east side, from Fulton Street to 18 feet northerly.
- H. ESTABLISH – RED ZONE, 4th Avenue, west side, from Fulton Street to 15 feet northerly.
- I. RESCIND – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING, EXCEPT PERMITTED CAR SHARE, 9th Avenue, west side, from 11 feet to 33 feet north of Geary Boulevard.
- J. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING, EXCEPT PERMITTED CAR SHARE, 9th Avenue, west side, from 33 feet to 55 feet north of Geary Boulevard.
- K. ESTABLISH – RED ZONE, 9th Avenue, west side, from 11 feet to 33 feet north of Geary Boulevard.



- L. RESCIND – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING, EXCEPT PERMITTED CAR SHARE, 16th Avenue, west side, from Anza Street to 20 feet northerly.
- M. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING, EXCEPT PERMITTED CAR SHARE, Anza Street, north side, from 12 feet to 30 feet west of 16th Avenue.
- N. ESTABLISH – RED ZONE, 16th Avenue, west side, from Anza Street to 10 feet northerly.
- O. ESTABLISH – BUS ZONE, California Street, south side, from 4th Avenue to 95 feet easterly (removes 2 RPP parking spaces).
- P. RESCIND – BUS ZONE, California Street, south side, from 4th Avenue to 75 feet westerly

RESOLUTION No. 250415-031

- 10.2. Approving three Roadway Shared Spaces street closure applications by local businesses for: (A) 37th Avenue between Ortega and Pacheco streets, Saturday, April 19, 2025, through Saturday, November 15, 2025, 7:30 am to 5:30 pm, every third Saturday of each month; (B) Gold Street between Montgomery and Balance streets, Friday, May 16, 2025, through Saturday, May 16, 2026, 4:30 pm to 11:59 pm, daily; and (C) Harlan Place between Grant Avenue and Mark Lane, Sunday, May 25, 2025, through Sunday, May 24, 2026, 11 am to 1:30 am, daily; and making environmental review findings. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 250415-032

- 10.3. Approving the designation of on-street electric vehicle charging spaces on 300 block of Hermann Street. (The SFMTA has determined that the proposed on-street electric vehicle charging regulation is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act [CEQA]. The proposed action is the Approval Action as defined by the S. F. Administrative Code Chapter 31. Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 250415-033

- 10.4. Approving an increase of parking meter rates citywide by \$0.25 per hour and amending Transportation Code Section 402 to increase the minimum parking meter hourly rate from \$0.50 to \$1 and to charge a \$0.10 convenience fee when paying for parking using a mobile device. The convenience fee will match the service fee charged to the SFMTA by mobile application vendors. (The SFMTA has determined that the proposed parking fee modifications are not a “project” under the California Environmental Quality Act [CEQA]. The proposed action is the Approval Action as



defined by the S.F. Administrative Code Chapter 31. Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 250415-034

PUBLIC COMMENT (Items 10.1-10.4):

Members of the public expressing support: Tafflyn Toy (10.3), Ray Kutz (10.3), Matthew Myers (10.3), Ken Tilas (10.3), Mario Holdsworth (10.3), Alex Lantsburg (10.3), Sylvia Damon (10.3), and Speaker (10.3)

Members of the public expressing opposition: John Drahon (10.3)

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: Cyrus Hall (10.3)

On motion to approve the Consent Calendar (Item 10.5 removed):

ADOPTED: AYES – Chen, Felder, Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, Cajina, and Tarlov

10.5. Approving the SFMTA’s Title VI Service Equity Analysis of proposed Muni service cuts, expected to be implemented June 21, 2025, which includes analysis of the route consolidation of the 6 Haight-Parnassus and 21 Hayes lines and finds that the route consolidation does not result in a disparate impact on communities of color or a disproportionate burden on low-income communities; and approving the route consolidation of the 6 Haight-Parnassus and 21 Hayes. (The Planning Department has determined that the proposed project is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act [CEQA]. The proposed action is the Approval Action as defined by the S. F. Administrative Code Chapter 31. Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

Item 10.5 was removed from the Consent Calendar and heard separately.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing opposition: Anthony Ballester, Jaime Vilorio, Dylan Fabris, Speaker, Claire Amable, Christopher White, and Speaker

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chen, Felder, Heminger, Hinze, and Tarlov
NAYES – Henderson and Cajina



RESOLUTION No. 250415-035

REGULAR CALENDAR

11. Approving revisions to the side-running protected bikeway and parking and traffic modifications on Valencia Street between 15th and 23rd streets (The Planning Department has determined that the proposed Mid-Valencia Curbside Protected Bikeway Project, including as modified by this action in Items A through L, is statutorily exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act [CEQA]. Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.):
 - A. ESTABLISH – GREEN METERED ZONE, 30-MINUTE TIME LIMIT, 9AM TO 6PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY
 - i. Valencia Street, west side, from 110 feet to 180 feet south of 18th Street
 - B. ESTABLISH – BLUE ZONE
 - i. Hill Street, north side, from 10 feet to 30 feet west of Valencia Street
 - C. ESTABLISH – CLASS IV BIKEWAY (PARKING-PROTECTED BIKEWAY)
 - i. 17th Street, eastbound, from 50 feet west of Valencia Street to 50 feet east of Valencia Street
 - ii. 17th Street, westbound, from 50 feet east of Valencia Street to 50 feet west of Valencia Street
 - D. ESTABLISH – RED ZONE
 - i. 17th Street, north side, from Valencia Street to 50 feet easterly
 - ii. 17th Street, south side, from Valencia Street to 50 feet easterly
 - iii. 17th Street, south side, from Valencia Street to 86 feet westerly
 - iv. 17th Street, north side, from Valencia Street to 50 feet westerly
 - v. Valencia Street, west side, from Hill Street to 52 feet northerly
 - vi. Valencia Street, west side, from 96 feet to 120 feet north of Hill Street
 - E. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING, METERED COMMERCIAL LOADING, 8AM TO 4PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY
 - i. 17th Street, north side, from 50 feet to 80 feet east of Valencia Street
 - ii. 21st Street, north side, from 7 feet to 33 feet west of Valencia Street
 - F. RESCIND – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING, METERED COMMERCIAL LOADING, 8AM TO 12PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY; GENERAL LOADING ZONE, 12PM TO 9PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY
 - i. Valencia Street, east side, from 49 feet to 86 feet south of 21st Street
 - G. RESCIND – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING, GENERAL LOADING ZONE, 12PM TO 9PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY
 - i. Valencia Street, east side, from 189 to 211 feet south of 18th Street
 - H. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING, GENERAL LOADING ZONE, 12PM TO 9PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY



- i. Valencia Street, east side, from 169 to 189 feet south of 18th Street
- ii. Valencia Street, east side, from 69 feet to 86 feet south of 21st Street
- I. RESCIND – NO LEFT TURN, EXCEPT BICYCLES
 - i. Valencia Street, northbound and southbound, at 17th Street
 - ii. Valencia Street, northbound and southbound, at 21st Street
 - iii. Valencia Street, northbound and southbound, at 23rd Street
- J. RESCIND – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING, 6-WHEEL METERED COMMERCIAL LOADING, 8AM TO 12PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY; GENERAL LOADING ZONE, 12PM to 10PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY
 - i. 19th Street, north side, from 50 feet to 92 feet east of Valencia Street
- K. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING, METERED COMMERCIAL LOADING, 8AM TO 12PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY; GENERAL LOADING ZONE, 12PM to 10PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY
 - i. Valencia Street, west side, from 26 feet to 116 feet north of 16th Street
 - ii. 19th Street, north side, from 11 feet to 58 feet east of Valencia Street
- L. RESCIND – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING, METERED COMMERCIAL LOADING, 8AM TO 6PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY
 - i. 22nd Street, south side, from 108 feet to 130 feet east of Valencia Street

Paul Stanis, Project Manager, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing opposition: Malena Cabeda, Claire Amable, and Dylan Fabris

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: Speaker and Griffin Lee

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chen, Felder, Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, Cajina, and Tarlov

RESOLUTION No. 250415-036

- 12. Presentation and discussion regarding Transit Fare Optimization and Compliance. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Jonathan Rewers, Chief Strategy Officer, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:



Dylan Fabris requested more detailed data on fare evasion, asked for clarity on program costs, and expressed concern about enforcement.

Cyrus Hall thanked staff for their analysis work and requested updated data on targeted lines and correlation to demographics.

Speaker expressed support for fairer costs between Muni fares and private vehicle usage.

Herbert Weiner opposed fare increases and expressed concern about enforcement.

Director Felder left the meeting.

ADJOURN - The meeting was adjourned at 4:57pm in honor of Philippe "Phil" Stern.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Christine Silva'.

Christine Silva
Board Secretary

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call 415.554.5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call 415.554.5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: <https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf>.



The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax: 415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the website: <https://sfethics.org/>.

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on an agenda, please email the Board at MTABoard@sfmta.com. Please know that the Board appreciates receiving such communication by 12pm the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at sotf@sfgov.org.

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at <https://sfgov.org/sunshine/>.