**SFMTA - TASC SUMMARY SHEET**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PreStaff_Date</th>
<th>9/5/2023</th>
<th>Public Hearing Consent</th>
<th>No objections:__________</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Requested_by</td>
<td>SFMTA</td>
<td>Public Hearing Regular</td>
<td>Item Held:______________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Handled</td>
<td>Dustin White</td>
<td>Informational / Other</td>
<td>Other:______________</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section Head</td>
<td>CL/MV</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Location:** Judah Street at La Playa Street and Lower Great Highway

**Subject:** N Judah Terminal Safety Improvements

**PROPOSAL / REQUEST:**

- **ESTABLISH – NO RIGHT TURN**
  Lower Great Highway, northbound, at Judah Street

- **ESTABLISH – NO LEFT TURN**
  Lower Great Highway, southbound, at Judah Street

- **ESTABLISH – RIGHT TURN ONLY**
  La Playa Street, northbound, at Judah Street

- **ESTABLISH – RIGHT TURN ONLY, EXCEPT MUNI**
  Judah Street, westbound, at La Playa Street

- **ESTABLISH – DEAD END**
  La Playa Street, southbound, at Irving Street (south leg of La Playa Street closed at Judah Street)

- **ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING ANYTIME**
  La Playa Street, east side, from Judah Street to 130 feet southerly

**BACKGROUND INFORMATION / COMMENTS**

The CPUC requests changes to address a history of collisions involving motorists and N Judah LRVs at the terminal. 15 reported collisions between May 2019 and February 2023 involving N Judah LRVs. All vehicle movements would be restricted that are currently physically blocked when a train is at the terminal. Forced right turns for northbound La Playa Street and westbound Judah Street to address poor visibility of crossing pedestrians when a train occupies the terminal.

- 2 police reported collisions in past 5 years - pedestrian in north crosswalk crossing Lower Great Highway hit by southbound motorist; motorcycle vs. motorcycle rear-end on La Playa
- 107 scheduled trains/day from 5:15am-12:30am
- Average scheduled layover duration = 17 mins
- PM peak hour traffic volume for all approaches = 712 vehicles (March 2023)
- ADT, Lower Great Highway north of Judah = 2,140 NB | 1,390 SB (Feb 2021)
- Removes 4 parking spaces

**HEARING NOTIFICATION AND PROCESSING NOTES:**

- **ENVIRONMENTAL CLEARANCE BY:**
  - SFMTA Attached Pending

**CHECK IF PREPARING SEPARATE SFMTA BOARD CALENDAR ITEM FOR PROPOSAL:**

-Thursday, August 31, 2023
Judah Street at La Playa Street and Lower Great Highway – N Judah Terminal Safety Improvements

**ESTABLISH – NO RIGHT TURN**
Lower Great Highway, northbound, at Judah Street

**ESTABLISH – NO LEFT TURN**
Lower Great Highway, southbound, at Judah Street

**ESTABLISH – RIGHT TURN ONLY**
La Playa Street, northbound, at Judah Street

**ESTABLISH – RIGHT TURN ONLY, EXCEPT MUNI**
Judah Street, westbound, at La Playa Street

**ESTABLISH – DEAD END**
La Playa Street, southbound, at Irving Street (south leg of La Playa Street closed at Judah Street)

**ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING ANYTIME**
La Playa Street, east side, from Judah Street to 130 feet southerly

**ESTABLISH – NO PARKING ANY TIME**
La Playa Street, west side, from Judah Street to 77 feet northerly

(Supervisor District 4)

Proposal to restrict turns and make traffic circulation changes to reduce conflicts between N Judah trains and other vehicles and to improve pedestrian safety.

Dustin White, dustin.white@sfmta.com
Summary

- California Public Utilities Commission requires changes to the intersection to address pattern of collisions involving motorists and N Judah trains at the line’s western terminal located within the intersection of Judah Street, La Playa Street and Lower Great Highway.
  - 15 property damage incidents involving trains and motor vehicles from 05/19 to 02/23.
  - 2 police-reported injury collisions in past 5 years:
    - 11/27/20: Motorcycle rear-ended motorcycle on La Playa.
- SFMTA staff have developed low-cost design changes to restrict vehicular access through the train terminal area – these restrictions are effectively in place under existing conditions whenever a train occupies the terminal. 107 trains/day use terminal on weekdays from 5:30am-12:30am with an average scheduled layover duration of 17 minutes
- When a train is present, it limits the amount of width on La Playa Street for two-way traffic to proceed through the intersection.
- Relocating the terminal onto Judah Street between 48th Avenue and La Playa Street is not feasible at this time:
  - Storing trains on Judah would block residential driveways and remove access to an accessible boarding ramp at the first inbound stop located adjacent to the existing terminal.

CPUC Coordination

On 11/30/2022, the California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) notified the SFMTA that changes to the N Judah terminal were required due to a pattern of collisions. The CPUC recommended that the terminal be relocated, which the SFMTA does not consider feasible.

On 1/26/2023 SFMTA staff met with CPUC staff onsite to review potential mitigations. The SFMTA agrees that modifications to the intersection are necessary to improve safety. SFMTA staff recommend restricting motor vehicle access between La Playa Street and Lower Great Highway at this intersection to prevent motorists from sideswiping trains or parking illegally and being sideswiped as a train enters or leaves the terminal. Additionally, converting La Playa Street to one-way northbound between Kirkham and Irving streets reduces conflicts between two-way traffic through the intersection and improves visibility of pedestrians.

Community Input

An earlier version of the project was presented at an open house event on 6/29/23 that included converting La Playa Street to one-way northbound between Kirkham and Irving streets and adding angled parking on the west side of La Playa Street between Kirkham Street and 165 feet north of Judah Street. Residents expressed concerns and suggestions including:
- Concerns about circulation impacts of one-way proposal
- Concerns that angled parking on La Playa Street north of Judah Street near Java Beach café could result in congestion when double parking or deliveries occur.
- Requests that the N Judah terminal be relocated onto Judah Street.
- Requests that angled parking be added on Lower Great Highway between Lincoln Way and Kirkham Street to discourage oversize vehicles from parking.
- Suggestion for forced right turn on northbound La Playa Street at Judah Street to reduce traffic moving through the intersection and improve pedestrian safety.
Background

2012-14: La Playa Neighborhood Coalition began community redesign effort focused on improving social gathering space with seating, signage, plantings and pedestrian safety improvements – some minor landscaping and seating improvements were implemented in coordination with Public Works in 2014.

2016-17: Planning Department led City effort to design and permit improvements envisioned by community with funding from Supervisor Tang’s Office. Final proposal shown below included traffic circulation changes and repurposing of parking – was not implemented due to community opposition.

2018-22: Incremental changes consistent with original community vision, including:
- Painted safety zones at crosswalks across Lower Great Highway
- Raised crosswalk across La Playa Street (north leg)
- Speed humps on Lower Great Highway and La Playa Street between Kirkham and Irving streets
- NO RIGHT TURN on southbound La Playa at Judah
- Delineators to deter illegal parking within train dynamic envelope
- Mural on Muni operator restroom building
- Shared space at Java Beach Cafe
Existing Conditions

Aerial view of N Judah terminal at intersection of La Playa Street, Judah Street, Lower Great Highway

View North on La Playa Street at Judah Street

Pinch point for two-way traffic between trains and single parking space

Train obstructs visibility between southbound traffic or WBLT from Judah and pedestrians in south crosswalk
View South on La Playa Street at Judah Street

Pinch point for two-way traffic between trains and Java Beach shared space

Train obstructs visibility between northbound traffic and pedestrians in north crosswalk

View West on Judah Street at La Playa Street
View East from Lower Great Highway
**Surveyor:** Dustin White  
**Location:** Judah/La Playa/Lower Great Highway  
**Date:** 3/3/2023  
**Time:** 4:00-5:00 pm  
**Notes:** Count conducted Friday to capture added volumes due to Upper Great Highway scheduled weekend closure  
Poor stop sign compliance NB/SB LGH  
Muni N Judah LRVs occupy intersection at most times  
Heavy pedestrian activity at north legs of La Playa and LGH  
*Indicates movements that occurred when Muni LRV was not present

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>15-min Interval Start</th>
<th>Judah</th>
<th>La Playa</th>
<th>LGH</th>
<th>LGH</th>
<th>15-min Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Westbound</td>
<td>Northbound</td>
<td>Southbound</td>
<td>Northbound</td>
<td>Southbound</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LT to LP</td>
<td>LT to LGH</td>
<td>RT to LP</td>
<td>TH to Judah</td>
<td>LT to Judah</td>
<td>TH to LP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:00 PM</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:15 PM</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:30 PM</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:45 PM</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-Hour Total</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Notes from police reports:

8/25/22 pedestrian-motor vehicle collision occurred in north leg crosswalk crossing Lower Great Highway, SB  motorist ran stop sign

9/13/22 bike-motor vehicle collision occurred on Upper Great Highway

8/16/22 collision involving two motorcycles occurred in Upper Great Highway - police report lists 8/16/22, TransBASE database lists 11/27/20
Collision/Party/Victim Table
Showing 1 to 3 of 3 entries

Count of Fatal Collisions: 0
Count of Non-Fatal Injury Collisions: 3
Total Count of Fatal/Non-Fatal Injury Collisions: 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case ID</th>
<th>Collision Date</th>
<th>Collision Time</th>
<th>Day of Week</th>
<th>Primary Road</th>
<th>Secondary Road</th>
<th>Distance</th>
<th>Direction</th>
<th>Party 1 Type</th>
<th>Party 1 Direction of Travel</th>
<th>Party 1 Movement Preceding Crash</th>
<th>Party 2 Type</th>
<th>Party 2 Direction of Travel</th>
<th>Party 2 Movement Preceding Crash</th>
<th>Vehicle Code Violation</th>
<th>Highest Degree of Injury</th>
<th>Type of Collision</th>
<th>Motor Vehicle Involved With</th>
<th>Hit and Run</th>
<th>Road Surface</th>
<th>Road Condition</th>
<th>Lighting</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>220625387</td>
<td>09/13/2022</td>
<td>17:26</td>
<td>Tuesday</td>
<td>LA PLAYA</td>
<td>JUDAH ST</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Not Stated</td>
<td>Bicyclist</td>
<td>West</td>
<td>Proceeding Straight</td>
<td>Driver</td>
<td>South</td>
<td>Proceeding Straight</td>
<td>CVC 21804(a)</td>
<td>Injury (Severe)</td>
<td>Broadside</td>
<td>Bicycle</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Dry</td>
<td>No Unusual Condition/Not Stated</td>
<td>Daylight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>220572471</td>
<td>08/25/2022</td>
<td>00:50</td>
<td>Thursday</td>
<td>GREAT HWY</td>
<td>JUDAH ST</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Not Stated</td>
<td>Driver</td>
<td>South</td>
<td>Proceeding Straight</td>
<td>Pedestrian</td>
<td>East</td>
<td>Proceeding Straight</td>
<td>CVC 22350</td>
<td>Injury (Complaint of Pain)</td>
<td>Vehicle/Pedestrian</td>
<td>Pedestrian</td>
<td>Felony</td>
<td>Wet</td>
<td>No Unusual Condition/Not Stated</td>
<td>Dark - Street Lights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200717368</td>
<td>11/27/2020</td>
<td>20:18</td>
<td>Friday</td>
<td>LA PLAYA</td>
<td>JUDAH ST</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>South</td>
<td>Driver</td>
<td>South</td>
<td>Proceeding Straight</td>
<td>Driver</td>
<td>South</td>
<td>Proceeding Straight</td>
<td>CVC 21703</td>
<td>Injury (Complaint of Pain)</td>
<td>Rear End</td>
<td>Other Motor Vehicle</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Dry</td>
<td>No Unusual Condition/Not Stated</td>
<td>Dark - Street Lights</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
November 30, 2022

Melvyn Henry
Chief Safety Officer
San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency
1 South Van Ness Ave, 6th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

SENT VIA EMAIL

Re: Safety Concerns on La Playa and Judah Street At-Grade Highway-Light Rail Transit Crossing, Identified as CPUC No. 125N-13.58 in the City of San Francisco, County of San Francisco.

Dear Mr. Henry:

The California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) has regulatory and safety oversight over all Highway-Light Rail Transit crossings in California. During a recent review of incidents at the La Playa and Judah Street Highway-Light Rail Transit crossing (crossing), identified above, staff from the CPUC’s Rail Transit Safety Branch (RTSB) and Rail Crossings and Engineering Branch (RCEB) has noticed an unusually high number of incidents at this crossing within the last three years. Below is a table summarizing those incidents.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of Incident</th>
<th>Description of Incident</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11/16/2022</td>
<td>South Bound Motorist with trailer Made a U-turn on Great Highway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/4/2022</td>
<td>Left turn into Judah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3/25/2022</td>
<td>West bound driver turning left on Great Highway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3/18/2022</td>
<td>Parked Vehicle near the tracks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/11/2022</td>
<td>Right turn while going south bound on La Playa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1/14/2022</td>
<td>Parked Garbage Truck Near the Tracks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/20/2021</td>
<td>City’s Parks and Recs Vehicle attempting to squeeze past the train from Judah St</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9/27/2021</td>
<td>Ambulance parked next to the tracks to give medical attention to a citizen and was hit after the train began to move</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8/05/2021</td>
<td>West bound driver attempting to turn right onto the Great Highway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8/23/2020</td>
<td>South bound motorist on La Playa attempting to turn right onto Great Highway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/9/2020</td>
<td>South bound motorist on La Playa attempting to turn right onto Great Highway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/8/2020</td>
<td>South bound motorist on La Playa attempting to turn right onto Great Highway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5/19/2019</td>
<td>Vehicle parked within the dynamic envelope</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Currently 114 trains per day travel through the crossing. Per our last conversation with San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) staff, the crossing is routinely occupied by parked two-car trains for extended periods of time. The CPUC staff considers storing a 2 car consist in an active four-way intersection a hazardous condition.
• Utilizing an intersection as a temporary storage facility for trains confuses motorists who are both familiar and unfamiliar with the crossing. Several of the incidents involved vehicles owned and operated by the City of San Francisco as well as rental vehicles.
• When a train is occupying the crossing, the Light Rail Vehicle’s (LRV) block the path of vehicles traveling south bound on La Playa Street, forcing the automobiles into the opposing lane in order to continue forward or turn left to Judah. The parked LRV’s force motorists to make this dangerous maneuver which can lead to head on vehicle-to-vehicle collisions.
• Autonomous vehicles may have a difficult time navigating this corridor.
• A LRV blocking the intersection will confuse motorists whose GPS navigation systems have directed them to use the intersection.
• On September of 2021, an emergency response vehicle parked in proximity of a two-car LRV to perform their duties. The two-car LRV left the scene and struck the ambulance as it moved through the turn around. This hazardous condition was created by a two-car, parked LRV blocking a four-way intersection.
• A LRV parked in the middle of the intersection may increase the time necessary for emergency responders to reach the scene of an incident, reducing public safety in the area.

The CPUC recommends SFMTA find an alternative location to park their trains to create a safer environment for San Francisco residents and visitors and increase the level of service for motorists at the intersection. The current satellite view shows the storage of trains in between the Avenues on Judah.

Please reply to CPUC staff in writing by January 31, 2023 with the City of San Francisco’s plan to address the safety concerns at the crossing. For crossing safety questions, please contact Sia Mozaffari at (415) 471-4129 or siavash.mozaffari@cpuc.ca.gov. For SFMTA incident questions, please contact Jimmy Xia at (415) 517-7052 or jimmy.xia@cpuc.ca.gov.

Sincerely,
Felix Ko, P.E.
Senior Utilities Engineer
Rail Crossings and Engineering Branch
Rail Safety Division
January 12, 2023

Felix Ko
Senior Utilities Engineer
Rail Crossings & Engineering Branch - Rail Safety Division
California Public Utilities Commission
505 Van Ness Ave, San Francisco, CA 94102

Subject: Safety Concerns on La Playa and Judah Street At-Grade Highway-Light Rail Transit Crossing, Identified as CPUC no. 125N-13.58 in the City of San Francisco, County of San Francisco

Dear Mr. Ko:

On November 30, 2022, we received a letter from the CPUC that describes safety concerns regarding the storage of 2-car consists at the intersection of La Playa and Judah. This letter noted that the CPUC considers this to be a hazardous condition.

Over the summer, minor improvements were made to this intersection and staff are assessing the feasibility of additional improvements. We would like to request a meeting with CPUC staff to discuss these improvements. Please let us know if you are available during any of the following dates and times for an onsite meeting to discuss the La Playa and Judah Street intersection:

- Tuesday, January 24th at 11:00 am
- Wednesday, January 25th at 12:30 pm
- Thursday, January 26th at 11:30 am (preferred)

Thank you for your staff’s continued commitment to safety.

Sincerely,

Julie Kirschbaum
Director of Transit

Melvyn Henry
Director of System Safety

Cc:
Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation
Susan Cleveland-Knowles, Deputy City Attorney
Stephanie Stuart, Deputy City Attorney
2017 design, supported at 10/12/2017 TASC, but never fully legislated.