MEETING MINUTES • Meeting Date: Tuesday, May 7, 2024

REGULAR MEETING AND CLOSED SESSION
1:00pm

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
Room 400, City Hall

REMOTE MEETING ACCESS
WATCH: www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE or
https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/board-directors-meeting-may-7-2024

SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS
Amanda Eaken, Chair
Stephanie Cajina, Vice Chair
Steve Heminger
Dominica Henderson
Fiona Hinze
Lydia So
Janet Tarlov

DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION
Jeffrey Tumlin

BOARD SECRETARY
Christine Silva
ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to Order

Chair Eaken called the meeting to order at 1:03pm.

2. Roll Call

Present: Dominica Henderson
         Fiona Hinze
         Lydia So
         Janet Tarlov
         Stephanie Cajina
         Amanda Eaken

Absent (at Roll Call): Steve Heminger

3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting

Board Secretary Silva made the announcement.

4. Approval of Minutes

   • April 16, 2024, Regular Meeting

   No public comment.

   On motion to approve the minutes of the April 16, 2024, Regular Meeting:

   ADOPTED: AYES – Henderson, Hinze, So, Tarlov, Cajina, and Eaken
             ABSENT – Heminger

5. Communications

   None.

6. Introduction of New or Unfinished Business by Board Members

   Director So shared about a recent incident on the 29 Sunset line and about attending the agency’s Rail Roadeo.

   Director Heminger joined the meeting.
Chair Eaken returned to Item 6 after Item 11. Chair Eaken shared that Director So’s appointment to the Planning Commission was approved at the Board of Supervisors and recognized Director So for her service on the SFMTA Board of Directors.

Directors Heminger, Kirschbaum, Cajina, Henderson, and Tarlov provided remarks in appreciation of Director So.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Luke Bornheimer thanked Director So for her service.

Joel Ramos expressed gratitude to Director So for her service.

7. Director’s Report (For discussion only)
   - Special Recognition
   - Twin Peaks Tunnel Update
   - SFMTA Labor Agreements Update
   - Ongoing Activities

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Streets, introduced Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer, to recognize the staff from the Payroll Unit and Kimberly Ackerman, Chief People Officer to recognize staff from the Peer Assistance Program (PAP) and Employment Services Unit.

Director Kirschbaum, acting on behalf of the Director of Transportation, provided an update on Twin Peaks Tunnel work, shared about a new General Obligation (GO) Bond, Bike and Roll to School Week, Earth Day, and a recent Administrative Professionals Day luncheon.

Director Henderson requested to learn more about the PAP program, at a board meeting or briefing.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Michael Petrellis expressed concern about the proposed GO Bond and Vision Zero, also sharing concern about the delay of changes at West Portal.

Luke Bornheimer commented on the GO Bond and climate action.

Herbert Weiner expressed concern about Vision Zero being an impossible goal to achieve and suggested working with the police department.
Allan Buradell expressed concern about Vision Zero, sharing that more enforcement is needed by the police department.


Aaron Leifer, Citizens’ Advisory Council (CAC) Chair, presented the report.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Luke Bornheimer thanked the CAC for supporting the Frida Kahlo Way and West Portal improvements and urged the SFMTA to take action on the West Portal project.

Speaker expressed concern about the Frida Kahlo Way vote at the CAC and shared that the concerns raised were comparable to the concerns of citizens.

Jess Win shared about being a student at City College and expressed concern regarding the Frida Kahlo Way Quick-Build Project.

Harry Bernstein expressed concern about recent efforts at West Portal, sharing that there was a great amount of community interest.

Michael Petrelis expressed concern for the fatalities at West Portal and called for a moment of silence for the family and everyone that has died on San Francisco streets.

9. Public Comment

Members of the public may address the SFMTA Board of Directors on matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction and are not on today's calendar.

Michael Petrelis expressed concern about potholes in the city and pedestrian hazards at Jane Warner Plaza.

Luke Bornheimer urged staff to bring forward a No Turn on Red proposal and plan and called for protected bikeways on Arguello Boulevard.

Herbert Weiner expressed concern regarding paratransit wait times and commented on Vision Zero and sidewalk safety from bicycles and scooters.

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS BEFORE THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR ACTION AS STATED BY THE SFMTA
DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION OR CITY ATTORNEY WHERE APPLICABLE. EXPLANATORY DOCUMENTS FOR ALL CALENDAR ITEMS ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. 7th FLOOR.

CONSENT CALENDAR

10. All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and will be acted upon by a single vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Board of Directors or the public so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item.

10.1. Requesting the Controller to allot funds and to draw warrants against such funds available or will be available in payment of the following claim against the SFMTA: (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

A. Ruby Cornelius v. CCSF, et al., Superior Ct. Case No. CGC-24-611696 for $12,000. Lawsuit involving allegations of personal injury from Parking Control Officer (PCO) negligence and battery (Plaintiff and PCO).


RESOLUTION No. 240507-045

10.2. Approving various routine parking and traffic modifications: (The Planning Department has found that Items A-F are exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act [CEQA]. For these parking and traffic modifications that received a categorical exemption, the proposed action is the Approval Action as defined by Chapter 31 of the San Francisco Administrative Code. Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)


B. ESTABLISH – RESIDENTIAL PERMIT PARKING AREA S – 3864-3868 24th Street.

C. ESTABLISH – RESIDENTIAL PERMIT PARKING AREA U – 500 Bryant Street.

D. ESTABLISH – RESIDENTIAL PERMIT PARKING AREA I – 3274-3276 24th Street.


F. ESTABLISH – RESIDENTIAL PERMIT PARKING AREA I – 2170 Mission Street.

RESOLUTION No. 240507-046
10.3. Approving Roadway Shared Spaces street closures on: (1) Larkin Street between Eddy and O’Farrell streets, Saturday, May 11, 2024, through Saturday, May 10, 2025, 11 am to 8 pm, the second Saturday of each month; (2) Trinity Street between Bush and Sutter streets, Wednesday, May 9, 2024 through Thursday, May 8, 2025, 8 am to 10 pm, daily; (3) Maiden Lane between Kearny Street and Grant Avenue, Saturday, May 18, 2024, through Sunday, May 18, 2025, 5 pm to 10 pm, each Tuesday through Friday, and 12 noon to 10 pm, each Saturday; and making environmental review findings.  (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 240507-047

10.4. Authorizing the Director of Transportation to execute Contract No. SFMTA-2024-06 with the San Francisco Bicycle Coalition Education Fund for the amount of $1,494,736 over a five-year term to provide bicycle education classes, scooter education classes, and outreach services. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

Item 10.4 was severed from the Consent Calendar and heard separately.

Board Secretary Silva clarified the contract term of an initial term of three years, and with two options to renew the agreement for a period of 1 year each, for a total of two additional years.

Tracey Lin, Transportation Planner, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing opposition: Michael Petrelis, Speaker, Allan Duradell, Speaker, Michael Adams, Leanna Louie, Speaker, and Harry Bernstein

On motion to amend the resolution to clarify the contract term of an initial term of three years, with two options to renew the agreement for a period of 1 year each, for a total of two additional years; direct staff to evaluate, prior to the first option period in the contract, alternative delivery methods for bicycle and scooter training including, but not limited to, bringing the function in-house; and approve as amended:

ADOPTED: AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, Tarlov, Cajina, and Eaken

RESOLUTION No. 240507-048
10.5. Adopting a resolution of local support for allocation of Regional Measure 3 bridge toll funds in the amount of $18,062,000 for two SFMTA projects: (1) New Flyer Midlife Overhaul Phase 1 for $11,344,000; and (2) Vintage Streetcar Rehabilitation for $6,718,000; and providing assurances that the SFMTA will comply with Metropolitan Transportation Commission policies. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 240507-049

No public comment.

On motion to approve (Item 10.4 removed): ADOPTED: AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, Tarlov, Cajina, and Eaken

REGULAR CALENDAR

11. Approving transit accessibility and active transportation safety improvements on Frida Kahlo Way between Ocean Avenue and Judson Avenue, and on Judson Avenue between Frida Kahlo Way and Foerster Street, including: adding two-way protected bikeways (Class IV) on the east side of Frida Kahlo Way and the south side of Judson Avenue within the project limits, implementing pedestrian safety improvements such as intersection daylighting and traffic safety islands, transit prioritization elements such as transit boarding islands and bus-stop consolidation, vehicle circulation safety measures near Archbishop Riordan High School, and associated curb use changes including parking removal: (The Planning Department has found that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act [CEQA]. The SFMTA Board action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 31.04(h). Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

A. ESTABLISH – CLASS IV BIKEWAY (TWO-WAY)
   i. Frida Kahlo Way, east side, from Cloud Circle (south) to Judson Avenue (establishes two-way protected bikeway, replaces general parking and motorcycle parking)
   ii. Judson Avenue, south side, from Frida Kahlo Way to Foerster Street (establishes two-way protected bikeway, replaces some general parking)

B. ESTABLISH – CLASS IV BIKEWAY (ONE-WAY)
   i. Frida Kahlo Way, northbound, from Ocean Avenue to Cloud Circle (South) (establishes one-way protected bikeway on east side of street, replaces general parking)

C. RESCIND – CLASS II BIKEWAY
i. Frida Kahlo Way, northbound, from Cloud Circle (South) to Judson Avenue  
ii. Judson Avenue, eastbound, from Frida Kahlo Way to Gennessee Avenue  
   (existing bike lane on these segments to be replaced by two-way protected bikeway)  
iii. Frida Kahlo Way, southbound, from Cloud Circle (South) crosswalk to North Access Road  

D. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING ANY TIME  
i. Frida Kahlo Way, east side, from Ocean Avenue to Cloud Circle (South) crosswalk  
ii. Frida Kahlo Way, east side, from Cloud Circle (South) to 139 feet northerly  
iii. Frida Kahlo Way, east side, from 301 feet to 361 feet north of Cloud Circle (South) crosswalk  
iv. Frida Kahlo Way, east side, from North Access Road to 511 feet southerly  
v. Frida Kahlo Way, east side, from North Access Road to Judson Avenue  
vi. Judson Avenue, south side, from 130 feet to 160 feet west of Gennessee Street  
vii. Judson Avenue, south side, from Gennessee Street to 74 feet easterly  
viii. Judson Avenue, south side, from 298 feet to 330 feet west of Foerster Street  
   (removes general parking to accommodate protected bikeway)  
ix. Judson Avenue, south side, from Foerster Street to 122 feet westerly  
   (removes general parking to accommodate left turn lane)  
x. Judson Avenue, north side, from Foerster Street to 10 feet easterly  
xii. Foerster Street, west side, from Judson Avenue to 10 feet northerly  
xiii. Judson Avenue, north side, from Gennessee Street to 10 feet easterly  
xiii. Judson Avenue, north side, from Frida Kahlo Way to 30 feet easterly  
   (removes general parking for daylighting purposes)  

E. RESCIND – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING ANY TIME  
i. Frida Kahlo Way, west side, from 460 feet to 490 feet south of North Access Road  
   (replaces thirty feet of existing red zone with general parking; twenty feet of red zone remain)  

F. ESTABLISH – BUS STOP  
i. Frida Kahlo Way, east side, from Cloud Circle (South) crosswalk to 125 feet southerly  
   (shifts existing bus stop to accommodate Class IV bikeway and will be replaced by transit boarding island)  

G. ESTABLISH – BUS STOP  
ESTABLISH – TRANSIT BOARDING ISLAND  
i. Frida Kahlo Way, east side, from Cloud Circle (South) crosswalk to 125 feet southerly  
ii. Frida Kahlo Way, east side, from North Access Road to 87 feet southerly  
iii. Judson Avenue, south side, from Gennessee Street to 50 feet westerly  
   (establishes transit boarding islands adjacent to the new protected bikeway for three existing bus zones/bus flag stops)  

H. RESCIND – BUS STOP  
i. Frida Kahlo Way, east side, from 400 to 512 feet south of North Access Road  
   (removes existing bus stop at CCSF main steps, replaced by TANSAT)
ii. Frida Kahlo Way, west side, from 586 to 686 feet south of North Access Road (removes existing bus stop at CCSF main steps, revert to general parking)

iii. Frida Kahlo Way, east side, from 142 to 240 feet south of Judson Avenue (removes existing curbside bus stop at Frida Kahlo/Judson, replaced by transit boarding island south of North Access Road)

I. ESTABLISH – BUS FLAG STOP
   i. Gennessee Avenue, northwest corner of Gennessee Street and Judson Avenue (establishes new OB flag stop, replacing existing flag stop around the corner on Judson Avenue)

J. RESCIND – BUS FLAG STOP
   i. Judson Avenue, northwest corner of Judson Avenue and Gennessee Street (removes existing OB flag stop, to be replaced by a bus flag stop on Gennessee)
   ii. Judson Avenue, southwest corner of Judson Avenue and Gennessee Street (removes existing IB flag stop, to be replaced by a bus stop and boarding island)

K. ESTABLISH – NO STOPPING EXCEPT BICYCLES
   ESTABLISH – BIKE SHARE STATION
   i. Frida Kahlo Way, east side, from 361 feet to 513 feet north of Cloud Circle (South) crosswalk (establishes floating bike-share station in bikeway buffer)
   ii. Judson Avenue, south side, from 50 feet to 130 feet west of Gennessee Street (establishes floating bikeshare stations adjacent to proposed boarding islands)

L. RESCIND – NO STOPPING EXCEPT BICYCLES
   RESCIND – BIKE SHARE STATION
   i. Frida Kahlo Way, west side, from 400 to 463 feet south of North Access Road
   ii. Judson Avenue, south side, from 180 feet to 252 feet east of Gennessee Street (removes two existing bikeshare stations, reverting them to general parking)

M. ESTABLISH – MOTORCYCLE PARKING
   i. Frida Kahlo Way, east side, from 139 feet to 301 feet north of Cloud Circle (South) crosswalk (establishes floating motorcycle parking in the bikeway buffer)

N. RESCIND – MOTORCYCLE PARKING
   i. Frida Kahlo Way, west side, from 63 feet to 115 feet north of Cloud Circle (South) crosswalk (removes existing motorcycle parking on the west side of Frida Kahlo, to be replaced on the east side)

O. RESCIND – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING, YELLOW METERED COMMERCIAL LOADING ONLY, 30-MINUTE TIME LIMIT, 7AM to 4PM MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY
   i. Frida Kahlo Way, west side, from 20 feet to 63 feet north of Cloud Circle (South) crosswalk (removes existing yellow zone at the old City College bookstore location)

P. ESTABLISH – SPEED CUSHION
i. Judson Avenue, westbound, between Gennessee Street and Frida Kahlo Way (one three-lump cushion)

Q. ESTABLISH – NO U-TURN
i. Frida Kahlo Way, northbound, at Judson Avenue
(prohibits U-turns at this location to reduce conflicts and congestion near Riordan High School)

R. ESTABLISH – STOP SIGN
i. Gennessee Street, northbound, at Judson Avenue
ii. Foerster Street, northbound, at Judson Avenue
(establishes stop control for new northbound bike movement from Class IV bikeway along southern curb at these intersections)

Emma Heiken, Legislative Aide for Supervisor Myrna Melgar, expressed support for the project.

Elliott Goodrich, Project Manager, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing support: Zach Lipton, Fabian Skibinski, Ed Pike, Robin Pham, Rachel Clyde, Speaker, and Luke Bornheimer

Members of the public expressing opposition: Speaker, Nicky Trasvina, Heather Brandt, Adolfo Velasquez, Jess, Fred Muhlheim, Madeline Mueller, Lisa Gutierrez Guzman, Michael Adams, Speaker, Leanna Louie, Marilee Hearn, Mukulla Godwin, Harry Bernstein, Patricia Arack, and Tomasita Medal

Chair Eaken recessed the meeting at 3:48pm and reconvened the meeting at 4:10pm.

On motion to amend the resolution to direct staff to return to the Board within one year of implementation to provide an update, including evaluation metrics for the project and an update about transit passes for City College; and approve as amended:

ADOPTED: AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, Tarlov, Cajina, and Eaken

RESOLUTION No. 240507-050

Chair Eaken returned to Item 6.

12. Presentation and discussion regarding a Muni Service Update. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)
Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transit, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Herbert Weiner expressed concern about bus service, urging the agency to restore the bus fleet.

Director Cajina requested membership and composition information for the Muni Equity Working Group, suggesting that it would be helpful to get the group’s feedback on relevant, future projects.

13. Discussion and vote pursuant to Administrative Code Section 67.10(d) as to whether to invoke the attorney-client privilege and conduct a closed session conference with legal counsel.

No public comment.

On motion to go into Closed Session:

ADOPTED: AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, Tarlov, Cajina, and Eaken

RECESS REGULAR MEETING AND CONVENE CLOSED SESSION – Chair Eaken recessed the meeting at 6:18pm.

CLOSED SESSION
1. Call to Order

Chair Eaken called the Closed Session to order at 6:20pm

2. Roll Call

Present: Steve Heminger
Dominica Henderson
Fiona Hinze
Lydia So
Amanda Eaken

Absent (at Roll Call): Janet Tarlov
Stephanie Cajina
3. Pursuant to Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1) and (d)(2) and Administrative Code Section 67.8 (a)(3) and 67.10(d)(1) and (2), the SFMTA Board of Directors will meet in Closed Session to discuss and take action on attorney client matters on the following:

CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL

Director Cajina and Director Tarlov joined the Closed Session.

Existing Litigation: (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

A. Ruth Owades v. CCSF, Superior Ct. Case No. CGC-23-605297 filed 03/21/2023 for $11,000,000. Lawsuit involving allegations of personal injury from operator negligence (Plaintiff and revenue vehicle).

B. Mei Yu Lin v. CCSF, Superior Ct. Case No. CGC-23-610095 filed 10/31/2023 for $5,500,000. Lawsuit involving allegations of personal injury from operator negligence (fall on board).

C. Michelle Spicher v. CCSF, et al., Superior Ct. Case No. CGC-22-600372 filed 06/24/2022 for $1,499,000. Lawsuit involving allegations of personal injury from operator negligence (non-revenue vehicle).

On motion to approve Item 3C:

ADOPTED: AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, Tarlov, Cajina, and Eaken

RESOLUTION No. 240507-051

ADJOURN CLOSED SESSION AND RECONVENE OPEN SESSION – Chair Eaken adjourned the Closed Session and reconvened the meeting at 7:19pm.

14. Announcement of Closed Session
Board Secretary Silva announced that the Board met in closed session, voted to settle Item 3C and took no action on Items 3A and 3B.

15. Motion to disclose or not disclose the information discussed in Closed Session

ADOPTED: AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, Tarlov, Cajina, and Eaken

PUBLIC COMMENT:

ADJOURN – Chair Eaken adjourned the meeting at 7:23pm.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.

Christine Silva
Board Secretary

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call 415.554.5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call 415.554.5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf.

The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may
be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax: 415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the website: https://sfethics.org/.

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on an agenda, please email the Board at MTABoard@sfmta.com. Please know that the Board appreciates receiving such communication by 12pm the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at sotf@sfgov.org.

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City’s website at https://sfgov.org/sunshine/. 