THIS PRINT COVERS CALENDAR ITEM NO: 11

SAN FRANCISCO
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY

DIVISION: Streets

BRIEF DESCRIPTION:
Approving a Roadway Shared Spaces street closure application for Hayes Street between Gough and Octavia streets, 4 pm to 10 pm each Friday and 3 pm to 10 pm each Saturday, from Friday, December 4, 2026, through Sunday, November 26, 2028; and making environmental review findings.

SUMMARY:

- From August 2020 to November 2023, the Hayes Valley Neighborhood Association and Hayes Valley Merchants Council operated a weekly recurring 3-day street closure (Friday, Saturday, Sunday) of Hayes Street between Gough and Octavia under the Shared Spaces program.
- Since October 2023, the SFMTA Board approved annual two-day (Friday and Saturday) street closure permits, reducing the previously approved closure one day due to compliance challenges and public feedback.
- Applicant has requested a Roadway Shared Spaces closure of Hayes Street between Gough and Octavia streets to vehicular traffic two days a week (Friday and Saturday) for a two-year permit term.
- Supported by early findings from an ongoing study of the closure by the SF Planning Department (Hayes Public Life Study), staff recommend granting the two-year permit term.
- Roadway Shared Spaces closures which significantly interfere with or delay a public transit service, exceed ten consecutive hours per day over four consecutive days per week, or exceed a total period of time more than two years are considered to be a Longer-Term Closure and therefore require approval from this Board.
- The proposed Roadway Shared Spaces closure has been presented at an Interdepartmental Staff Committee on Traffic and Transportation public hearing.
- The proposed Roadway Shared Spaces street closure has been reviewed pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

ENCLOSURES:
1. SFMTAB Resolution
2. Hayes Valley Public Life Study - Phase One Summary
3. Better Streets Plan Mitigated Negative Declaration
   http://sfmea.sfplanning.org/2007.1238E_FMND.pdf
4. Better Streets Plan CEQA Findings, Planning Commission Resolution
   https://sfplanning.s3.amazonaws.com/default/files/meetingarchive/planning_dept/sf-planning.org/ftp/files/Commission/cpcpackets/2007.1238emrtu.pdf
5. Better Streets Plan Mitigated Negative Declaration Shared Spaces Addendum
   https://citypln-m
   extnl.sfgov.org/SharedLinks.aspx?accesskey=bc61363c7effb77e5715d781677a071ae265f

0cdbf27c18bd9d91b3402e0900a&VaultGUID=A4A7DACD-B0DC-4322-BD29-F6F07103C6E0

APPROVALS: **DATE**

DIRECTOR Viktoriya Wise November 25, 2026

SECRETARY November 25, 2026

ASSIGNED SFMTAB CALENDAR DATE: December 1, 2026

PURPOSE

Approving a Roadway Shared Spaces street closure application for Hayes Street between Gough and Octavia streets, 4 pm to 10 pm each Friday and 3 pm to 10 pm each Saturday, from Friday, December 4, 2026, through Sunday, November 26, 2028; and making environmental review findings.

STRATEGIC PLAN GOALS AND TRANSIT FIRST POLICY PRINCIPLES

This item will support the following SFMTA Strategic Plan Goals:

Goal 6: Eliminate pollution and greenhouse gas emissions by increasing use of transit, walking and bicycling.
Goal 7: Build stronger relationships with stakeholders.

This item will support the following Transit First Policy Principles:

1. To ensure quality of life and economic health in San Francisco, the primary objective of the transportation system must be the safe and efficient movement of people and goods.
3. Decisions regarding the use of limited public street and sidewalk space shall encourage the use of public rights of way by pedestrians, bicyclists, and public transit, and shall strive to reduce traffic and improve public health and safety.

DISCUSSION

Permit History
Since August 2020, the Hayes Valley Merchants Council (HVMC) and Hayes Valley Neighborhood Association (HVNA) have operated a weekly Roadway Shared Spaces street closure of Hayes Street.

- August 2020 – 3-day weekly closure on 3 blocks of Hayes Street between Franklin and Laguna streets on Fridays, Saturdays, and Sundays.
- June 2022 – Reduced to 1 block of Hayes Street between Gough and Octavia streets, for the same 3 days on Fridays, Saturdays, and Sundays.
- November 2023 – Reduced to 2 days on Fridays and Saturdays on the same 1 block.
    - HVMC and HVNA had applied for 3 days.
    - Staff recommended a 1-day weekly street closure due to transit impacts to the 21-Hayes and permit compliance issues such as inconsistent activation and lack of staffed barricade monitors.
    - MTA Board voted to approve an amended staff recommendation to also include Fridays from 4 pm to 10 pm.
- November 2024 – Same 1 block closure for 2 days on Fridays and Saturdays, with expanded Saturday start time at 10 am instead of 1 pm previously. The earlier start time allows for more setup time.

    - HVNA had applied for 3 days, to add back Sundays.
    - MTA Board approved a permit for 2 days weekly, per staff's recommendation based on same observations as previous year's issues.
- November 2025 – Same 1 block closure for 2 days on Fridays and Saturdays, with same times as previous year's permit.
    - HVNA had again applied for 3 days, to add back Sundays.
    - MTA Board approved a permit for 2 days weekly.

Current Permit Application
In July 2026, the HVNA (applicant) applied for a new permit for the same street closure area with expanded permit term. The applicant requested the same Friday time from 4 pm to 10 pm, a reduced Saturday time from 3 pm to 10 pm (to account for the new farmers market, which holds a permit for Saturdays from 7 am to 3 pm). The applicant is requesting a 2-year permit term instead of a 1-year permit term.

The reduced Saturday time starting at 3 pm to 10 pm instead of the previously permitted 10 am to 10 pm accounts for the new Hayes Valley Farmers Market (HVFM). The Pacific Coast Farmers Market Association applied for a special event permit to operate a weekly farmers market on Saturdays from 7 am to 3 pm on the same block and was approved for that permit at the April 23, 2026 Interdepartmental Staff Committee on Traffic and Transportation public hearing. The HVFM permit is currently active through Saturday, June 7, 2027. The Saturday time on the current HVNA shared space permit was amended to begin at 3 pm instead of 10 am.

This application was considered at the Interdepartmental Staff Committee on Traffic and Transportation (ISCOTT) public hearing on November 12, 2026. ISCOTT members voted 7-0 to recommend this item to SFMTA Board for approval.

To continue the successes of last year's permit, staff support approval of a 2-year permit renewal that closes Hayes between Gough and Octavia streets, 4 pm to 10 pm each Friday, and 3 pm to 10 pm each Saturday. Staff recommend examining the results and recommendations from the ongoing Hayes Valley Public Life Study to inform a potential longer-term closure, capital improvements, and other alternatives for the future activations of this block.

Current Permit Compliance
The permit compliance of the one-year street closure that expired in November 2026 improved in many aspects compared to earlier years. Specifically, the applicant demonstrated more regular street activations on both Fridays and Saturdays. These events included seasonal and holiday market events, children's activities, dance classes, and live music performances. The permittee consistently placed intersection barricades at both Gough and Octavia in the correct placement, which helped reduce illegal double-parking at the entrances of the street closures. The permittee has made an effort to staff the barricades and has set up the lane taper on the block of Hayes Street approaching the street closure at Grove Street.

Some of the challenges documented this year include concerns with vehicle access, traffic congestion, and impacts to emergency access. The reroute of the 6 Hayes on Friday evenings and Saturdays continues to be confusing to riders who complained about not knowing where to board on which days. Service planning changes that went into effect last year allowed normal service to remain on Sunday when the street is open to vehicles.

Hayes Valley Public Life Study

The San Francisco Planning Department, with support from consultants and the SFMTA, began a comprehensive study of the Hayes Street closure in summer 2026[1]. The Public Life Study, as it is called, aims to assess changes in uses and demands along/adjacent to Hayes Street that may be attributable to the roadway closure. The study consists of two phases, the first of which is a focused data collection and analysis effort to inform near-term permitting renewal decisions (such as this permit approval request). A second phase will explore potential capital improvement and activation concepts as well as supplementary analysis that may be needed for future actions to improve neighborhood circulation and safety.

Phase One Study

The Public Life[2] field observations and traffic data were collected over multiple weeks in July 2026 to help form a clearer picture of changes between a typical weekday (Wednesdays) and the closure period (focus on Saturdays). The more intensive analysis focuses on three key blocks within the closure area: the 400 and 500 blocks of Hayes Street, as well as Patricia's Green and adjacent Octavia Blvd and the Proxy SF public/private space. The SFMTA provided additional transit, parking, and collision data for surrounding blocks to inform the transportation analysis, while consultants and SF Planning staff conducted a comprehensive business survey that included 'door knocking,' interviews, and an online comment form.

Draft Findings

A detailed presentation of the initial data analysis for phase one of the Hayes Public Life Study is provided as Exhibit 2 appended to this report. An earlier version of these findings was presented and discussed with community stakeholders at two events in October 2026, including the publicly noticed and accessible SF County Transportation Authority Citizen Advisory Committee (SFCTA CAC) meeting on October 28, 2026. Based on feedback received, the current study provides additional 'big data' travel demand and annualized sales tax revenue data to try and better understand larger trends and address some limitations with the other data.

Key Takeaways

1 The study is funded by the Octavia Special Fund, an investment program developed out of the sale and leasing of land in the former footprint of the Central Freeway.

2 A public life study aims to comprehensively assess how people use and move through public spaces to inform decision-making. More information is at https://sfplanning.org/project/public-space-and-public-life-studies

- The closure period (an average of multiple Saturdays) sees 70%-80% more foot traffic than comparable Wednesdays when the roadway is open. This suggests the closure is contributing to an active and inviting public realm, but more analysis is needed to try and control for general weekday versus weekend trends.
- While the 400 block of Hayes Street sees more passersby than other blocks (confirming its role as a neighborhood 'gateway' of sorts), the areas around Patricia's Green and PROXY SF have more staying power, with users taking advantage of the seating provided to linger longer and more frequently.
- The business survey, which received 32 responses, yielded a mixed but majority positive response to the ongoing roadway closures.
    - While more responding businesses (44%) support the current closure than do not (28%), another 28% are more neutral and support the closure with modifications.
- The required re-routing of the westbound 6 Hayes-Parnassus bus does negatively impact travel time and legibility, but these are generally limited impacts that have been or could be reduced with further (modest) enhancements.
- The Gough/Hayes intersection is a priority to manage during the closure since the required westbound vehicle merge and left turn can be confusing, but there are no discernable safety impacts based on collision analysis; and there are planned improvements downstream (at Fell/Octavia) in early 2027 that may help limit problematic traffic backups.
- Mobile phone-based travel data measuring overall foot traffic shows that from 2024 to 2025, Saturday counts increased at a greater rate than Sundays and Wednesdays. (Sunday +9k, Wednesday +14k, Saturday +30k)
- Both foot traffic and sales tax data show a steady post-pandemic recovery from 2021 to 2026, with the number of visits and overall sales receipts inching closer to pre-pandemic levels particularly in the past two years.

<u>Phase Two Study scoping and timeline</u>

The city and consultant team will transition into the second phase of the Hayes Public Life Study after the permit renewal hearing and SFMTA Board decision in December 2026.

The primary goal of this phase is to identify both near-term and long-term concepts that can support neighborhood programming and activation while addressing critical transportation safety and circulation issues. Pending feedback from public comment and the SFMTA Board decision regarding the roadway shared space application, the study may look at any or all of the following:

- the feasibility of closing Hayes Street to vehicles and re-routing the 6 Hayes-Parnassus bus route more permanently;
- public realm improvements such as sidewalk widening, public park enhancements, and bike network alterations that maintain or complement existing circulation and access
- alternative street closure configurations, operations, and activation concepts that improve overall viability and support for shared space programming

The draft and final Hayes Public Life Study, inclusive of phase two recommendations, will be

presented to both the SFCTA's CAC and Board of Directors for approval, expected in late spring 2027. Concepts approved by the SFCTA Board could then become eligible to receive Octavia Special Fund revenues for future design and implementation phases.

ITEMS

The following item was considered at a Public Hearing held on November 12, 2026, by the Interdepartmental Staff Council on Traffic and Transportation (ISCOTT). For the reasons above, staff recommend the SFMTA Board of Directors approve a modified version of the applicant's request, as listed in Item A:

A. ESTABLISH – SHARED SPACES ROAD CLOSURE – Hayes Street between Gough and Octavia streets, 4 pm to 10 pm each Friday and 3 pm to 10 pm each Saturday, from Friday, December 4, 2026, through Sunday, November 28, 2028.

Item A would grant a permit for a Shared Spaces Road Closure for the Hayes Valley Neighborhood Association to provide outdoor, dining, retail, and entertainment space for the public and customers of nearby businesses.

The SFMTA Board of Directors is asked to consider the approval of a Longer-Term Closure of the above area under the authority granted by California Vehicle Code section 21101 and Div. II, section 206 of the Transportation Code for the purpose of issuing a Roadway Shared Spaces permit. In doing so, the Board would find based upon a determination of public convenience and necessity that the subject portion of Hayes Street is no longer needed for vehicular traffic during the proposed closure hours, and that the street closure is necessary for the safety and protection of the public who will use the street during the closure.

STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT

Item A was considered at a Public Hearing held on November 12, 2026 by ISCOTT. The applicant provided six letters of support from businesses. At the deadline for public comments, ISCOTT received 270 letters of support and 3 letters of opposition via email. Ten public comments in support this item were received at the hearing. One public comment concerning traffic impact, specifically the westbound Hayes Street traffic signal at Gough Street, was made at the hearing. The ISCOTT chair responded that it is not possible to retime that traffic signal for the street closure since the street closure may not be activated in inclement weather.

The emailed letters of support included many from residents in Hayes Valley and many from other neighborhoods who frequently visit Hayes Valley because of the shared space street closure. There were 264 similarly-worded letters of support from individuals and 6 fully unique letters of support. The supporters highlighted the benefits of having a family-friendly car-free space for young children to wander, a gathering spot, and increased foot traffic for local businesses. The supporters desire a 2-year permit term so that organizers and volunteers can focus more efforts on programming.

The emailed letters of opposition included two from HVSafe, and one from the Hayes Valley Small Business Association (HVSBA). HVSafe outlined concerns about transit impact, permit compliance issues, cumulative neighborhood impacts, and public engagement with residents and merchants who have raised objections in the past. HVSafe suggests having neighborhood events in other locations and opposes the 2-year permit renewal and calls for an end to the recurring street closure. The HVSBA is concerned that there is no demonstrated need to maintain the street closure and also opposes the 2-year permit renewal and calls for the recurring street closure to end.

ISCOTT members voted 7-0 to recommend the Friday and Saturday times with 2-year permit duration to the SFMTA Board of Directors for approval.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

Staff considered alternatives including shorter frequency, duration, or discontinuing the regular closure. However, given the applicant's increased and regular activation of the street, commitment to barricade staffing compliance, and community feedback in support of the street closure, staff are recommending a renewal of a 2-year permit term.

FUNDING IMPACT

The ISCOTT application fee, which applies to Roadway Shared Spaces (Transportation Code SEC 6.16(g)), is set at a cost recovery rate to cover staff's time and effort to review the subject application. The applicant for Item A has paid an application fee of $1,331 for applications submitted more than 120 days before the first event.

The 6-Hayes/Parnassus route runs on trolley coaches. The operational cost to motorize the route to accommodate the street closure (off-wire) is approximately $1,500 per week ($75,000 per year). It is costlier to run motor coaches than trolley coaches.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

On April 19, 2021, the San Francisco Planning Department determined that the Shared Spaces Program (Case No. 2021-003010ENV), inclusive of Item A, is within the scope of the Better Streets Plan Final Mitigated Negative Declaration (FMND, Case No. 2007.1238E, September 17, 2010), and that the proposal would not require the preparation of a subsequent negative declaration under CEQA Guidelines section 15162. On October 28, 2010, the Planning Commission in Resolution No. 18211, adopted findings under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the CEQA Guidelines, and Chapter 31 of the Administrative Code (CEQA Findings), and a Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP), associated with the Better Streets Plan.

Copies of the CEQA determinations are on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Board of

Directors and may be found in the records of the Planning Department by Case Number at https://sfplanninggis.org/pim or 49 South Van Ness Avenue, Suite 1400 in San Francisco, and are incorporated herein by reference.

OTHER APPROVALS RECEIVED OR STILL REQUIRED

Pursuant to section 206 of the Transportation Code, the decision of the SFMTA Board of Directors with respect to any proposed Longer-Term Closure of a Traffic Lane shall be final.

A public hearing for Item A was held at the November 12, 2026 meeting of ISCOTT.

The City Attorney has reviewed this item.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommend that the SFMTA Board of Directors approve a Roadway Shared Spaces street closure application for Hayes Street between Gough and Octavia streets, 4 pm to 10 pm each Friday and 3 pm to 10 pm each Saturday, from Friday, December 4, 2026, through Sunday, November 26, 2028; and make environmental review findings.

SAN FRANCISCO
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY
BOARD OF DIRECTORS

RESOLUTION No. _____

WHEREAS, The Hayes Valley Merchants Council (HVMC) and Hayes Valley Neighborhood Association (HVNA) have operated a recurring closure of Hayes Street between Gough and Octavia streets since 2020; and,

WHEREAS, From August 2020 to October 2023 the closure of Hayes Street between Gough and Octavia streets was three days under the pandemic era and permanent Roadway Shared Spaces programs; and,

WHEREAS, The SFMTA Board of Directors, on November 7, 2023, voted to approve an amended staff recommendation of a two-day per week closure, Fridays from 4 pm to 10 pm and Saturdays from 1 pm to 10 pm; and,

WHEREAS, The SFMTA Board of Directors, on November 19, 2024 and November 18, 2025, voted to approve an amended staff recommendation of Fridays from 4 pm to 10 pm and Saturdays from 10 am to 10 pm; and,

WHEREAS, The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency has received an application from HVNA for a Roadway Shared Spaces street closure as follows:

A. ESTABLISH – SHARED SPACES ROAD CLOSURE – Hayes Street between Gough and Octavia streets, 4 pm to 10 pm each Friday and 3 pm to 10 pm each Saturday, from Friday, December 4, 2026, through Sunday, November 26, 2028; and,

WHEREAS, The subject portion of the above listed street is no longer needed for vehicular traffic during the proposed closure hours and the street closures are necessary for the safety and protection of the public who will use those portions of the streets during the closure; and,

WHEREAS, Supported by early findings from an ongoing study (Hayes Vallley Public Life Study) of the street closure by the SF Planning Department, staff recommend granting the two-year permit term; and,

WHEREAS, On September 17, 2010, the San Francisco Planning Department published the Better Streets Plan Final Mitigated Negative Declaration (Better Streets Plan FMND, Case No. 2007.1238E), and under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the CEQA Guidelines, and Chapter 31 of the Administrative Code—the San Francisco Planning Commission adopted CEQA Findings, a Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP) on October 28, 2010 under Motion 18211; and,

WHEREAS, On April 19, 2021, the San Francisco Planning Department determined that the Shared Spaces Program (Case No. 2021-003010ENV), inclusive of Item A, is within the scope of the Better Streets Plan FMND and that it would not require the preparation of a subsequent negative declaration under CEQA Guidelines Sections 15162; and,

WHEREAS, The SFMTA Board of Directors has reviewed the Better Streets Plan Final Mitigated Negative Declaration (FMND) and Addendum and finds that since adoption of the FMND, no changes have occurred in the proposed project or in the circumstances under which the project would be implemented that would cause new significant impacts or a substantial increase in the severity of impacts identified and analyzed in the FMND, and that no new information has emerged that would materially change the analysis or conclusions set forth in the FMND; The actions approved herein would not necessitate implementation or additional or considerably different mitigation measures that those identified in the FMND; and,

WHEREAS, Copies of the CEQA determinations are on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Board of Directors, and may be found in the records of the Planning Department by Case Number at https://sfplanninggis.org/pim/ or 49 South Van Ness Avenue, Suite 1400 in San Francisco, and are incorporated herein by reference; and,

WHEREAS, The public has been notified about the proposed modifications and has been given the opportunity to comment on those modifications through the public hearing process; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors adopts these CEQA findings as its own; a copy of the Planning Commission Resolution, the CEQA findings, and the CEQA determinations are on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Board of Directors, and may be found in the records of the Planning Department at https://sfplanning.org/ and 49 South Van Ness Avenue, Suite 1400 in San Francisco, and is incorporated herein by reference; and, be it further

RESOLVED, That the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors approves the application by the Hayes Valley Neighborhood Association for Item A above and finds that the subject portion of the above listed street is no longer needed for vehicular traffic during the proposed closure hours and the street closure is necessary for the safety and protection of the public who will use that portion of the street during the closure.

I certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors at its meeting of December 1, 2026.

_____

Secretary to the Board of Directors
San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency