



**SAN FRANCISCO  
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY  
BOARD OF DIRECTORS AND  
PARKING AUTHORITY COMMISSION**

**MINUTES**

Tuesday, December 21, 2021

**REGULAR MEETING AND CLOSED SESSION  
1 P.M.**

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect our Board Members, SFMTA staff, and members of the public, the SFMTA Board is meeting via teleconferencing under Government Code Section 54953 and the Board's Meeting Room (Room 400) is closed.

**Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Board in advance of the meeting, please send an email to [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com) by 5pm the day before the meeting or call (415) 646-4470. Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.**

**SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

Gwyneth Borden, Chair  
Amanda Eaken, Vice Chair  
Steve Heminger  
Fiona Hinze  
Sharon Lai  
Manny Yekutieli

Jeffrey Tumlin  
**DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION**

Christine Silva  
**SECRETARY**

## ORDER OF BUSINESS

### 1. Call to Order

Chair Borden called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m.

### 2. Roll Call

Present: Gwyneth Borden  
Amanda Eaken  
Steve Heminger  
Fiona Hinze  
Sharon Lai  
Manny Yekutieli

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting.

No announcement was made.

### 4. Approval of Minutes

#### PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel suggested changes to his comment on page 2 and correcting the spelling of Eric Rozell and Bob Finebaum.

Eric Rozell confirmed the spelling of his name as Rozell.

On motion to approve the minutes of the December 7, 2021 Regular Meeting:

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Eaken, Heminger, Hinze, Lai and Yekutieli

### 5. Communications

Chair Borden discussed the virtual meeting and expressed appreciation to staff for their work to enable the meeting to be held via teleconference. Board Secretary Silva reviewed how members of the public could watch the meeting and address the Board.

### 6. Introduction of New or Unfinished Business by Board Members

No new or unfinished business.

### 7. Director's Report (For discussion only)

- Transit Service Update

- Human Resources Update
- Shared Spaces Update
- Controller's Report Update
- Central Subway Project Update
- Annual Report Update
- Ongoing Activities

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transit, shared about a recent service disruption involving an overhead line issue in the Muni subway and about Winter 2022 transit service implementation.

Director Tumlin provided updates on Vision Zero fatalities, Shared Spaces, the recently published Controller's Report, the Central Subway Project, the Annual Report, and free Muni service on New Year's Eve.

PUBLIC COMMENT (items presented by Director Kirschbaum):

Herbert Weiner urged the SFMTA to fully restore service as early as possible, sharing that there is no deficit in funding.

Aleta Dupree was appreciative of the J Church returning to the subway.

Kathy Setian thanked the Board for restoring the J Church to the subway and looked forward to working with the Citizens' Advisory Council on implementation.

Edward Mason expressed concern for the westbound 48 Quintara line weekday service and suggested a review of the apprenticeship program with City College.

David Pilpel commented on proposed Metro service as well as the 28 19<sup>th</sup> Avenue, 28R 19<sup>th</sup> Avenue Rapid, 58 Lake Merced, and 6 Haight/Parnassus transit line service.

Michael Chizner thanked the SFMTA for planning and implementing the 2022 service plan, commented on the J Church line and use of the Muni Mobile app.

Anonymous expressed support for restoring all Muni lines as soon as possible and commented on references to customers instead of riders.

Anastasia Yovanopoulos thanked the Board for the decision to return the J Church to the subway and hoped that the Board restores the 47 Van Ness line.

PUBLIC COMMENT (on items presented by Director Tumlin):

Zach Lipton expressed concern over the lack of staff resources and encouraged the Board and staff to work faster on streets projects.

Aleta Dupree requested an explanation of the running deficits and expressed appreciation for the SFMTA vaccinated workforce.

Dave Alexander expressed concern over a small and vocal minority in opposition of Slow Lake Street.

Eric Rozell commented on the Tenderloin Transit Safety Task Force and urged the Board to speed up the Action Strategy as well as the evaluation process of the 20-mph speed limit.

#### 8. Citizens' Advisory Council Report

No report was made.

#### 9. Public Comment

Members of the public may address the SFMTA Board of Directors on matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction and are not on today's calendar.

Aleta Dupree shared about a recent Muni experience and expressed concern over wayfinding at some light rail stops because of Shared Spaces.

Herbert Weiner shared about a recent transit experience, having to walk a long distance and wait a very long time.

Director Lai left the meeting.

Mark Gruberg shared about a recent taxi town hall and expressed concern over the Board of Supervisors resolution for the SFMTA and the San Francisco Federal Credit Union that did not include taxi medallion holders.

Matthew Sutter commented on drivers that cannot make taxi medallion payments and urged the SFMTA to help medallion holders.

Spanky Woods shared that the City and SFMTA bear responsibility for the situation that taxi medallion holders are in and suggested a moratorium until the pandemic is over.

Anonymous expressed concern for taxi medallion holders and suggested that it was time to buy back the medallions.

Michael Murphy shared about leaving the taxi industry, having to foreclose on a medallion, and still having a loan for \$200,000.

Gloria Barry shared about accumulating several parking tickets and expressed concern about riding T Third line.

Evelyn Engel expressed support for those calling in about taxi medallions and urged the SFMTA to reevaluate the taxi program.

Victor Pogacar shared about his experience as a taxi dispatcher and medallion holder and urged the SFMTA to fix the problem.

Michael Sachs expressed opposition to free parking in Union Square and urged the SFMTA to ban private vehicles.

Greg Austin shared his experience as a taxi medallion holder and urged the SFMTA to use federal money to help taxi drivers in the City.

Barry Taranto expressed concern over the taxi medallion program, also commenting on taxi access at the Chase Center and in the Castro during a recent event.

Marcello Canseco expressed concern over K medallion enforcement and requirements, sharing that the entire taxi industry is paying the price for the failed taxi program.

Ge Tu urged the SFMTA to buy back medallion loans and questioned how the City was going to fix the problem.

David Pilpel commented on 2022 Muni sign-ups, the Mayor's budget instructions, the 109<sup>th</sup> Muni anniversary, and wished SFMTA staff Ian Trout well.

Mary Maguire expressed concern over mask wearing and suggested prorating the driving requirement for taxi drivers.

James Reagan shared his experience as a foreclosed on taxi medallion holder and urged the Board to provide relief to taxi medallion holders.

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS BEFORE THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR ACTION AS STATED BY THE SFMTA DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION OR CITY ATTORNEY WHERE APPLICABLE. EXPLANATORY DOCUMENTS FOR ALL CALENDAR ITEMS ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. 7<sup>th</sup> FLOOR.

#### CONSENT CALENDAR

10. All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and will be acted upon by a single vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Board of Directors or the public so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item.

(10.1) Requesting the Controller to allot funds and to draw warrants against such funds available or will be available in payment of the following claims against the SFMTA:

- A. Rob Anderson v. CCSF, Superior Ct. #050805 filed on 7/25/2005 for \$50,000. (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

Directors Eaken and Heminger severed Item 10.1.

(10.2) Amending Transportation Code, Division II, Section 801 to implement parking restrictions except for City-owned San Francisco Police Department vehicles displaying SFMTA permits along Santiago Street between 22nd and 24th Avenues; and approving the following parking modifications:

- A. ESTABLISH – RED ZONE - Santiago Street, south side, from 24th Avenue to 30 feet easterly; and Santiago Street, south side, from 22nd Avenue to 30 feet westerly (adds daylighting).
- B. ESTABLISH – PERPENDICULAR PARKING - Santiago Street, south side, from 30 feet to 520 feet east of 24th Avenue.
- C. ESTABLISH - TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING ANYTIME, EXCEPT CITY-OWNED MARKED SFPD VEHICLES - Santiago Street, south side, from 30 feet to 210 feet east of 24th Avenue. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution. The proposed action is the Approval Action as defined by Chapter 31 of the San Francisco Administrative Code.)

RESOLUTION 211221-148

(10.3) Authorizing the Director or designee to establish a special event rate retroactive to November 26, 2021 for up to 36 days, not to exceed two hours, with a floor of zero dollars per hour where the agency has determined that on-street parking was significantly reduced in the immediate vicinity due to a public safety response, which currently includes the Sutter-Stockton Garage, the Ellis-O’Farrell Garage, and the Union Square Garage. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION 211221-149

Director Lai returned to the meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing support: Barry Taranto (10.3)

Members of the public expressing opposition: Zach Lipton, Aleta Dupree, Alice Dudiker, Michael Sachs, and Calvin Hick (10.3)

On motion to sever Item 10.1 and continue the item to a future meeting:

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Eaken, Heminger, Hinze, Lai and Yekutiel

On motion to approve the Consent Calendar (Items 10.2 and 10.3):

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Eaken, Heminger, Hinze, Lai and Yekutieli

#### REGULAR CALENDAR

11. Presentation and discussion regarding the Transportation Sales Tax Reauthorization. (Explanatory documents include a report and slide presentation.)

Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer, and Michelle Beaulieu, San Francisco County Transportation Authority Principal Transportation Planner, Government Affairs, Policy and Programming, presented the item.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT:

Herbert Weiner expressed concern over community outreach, shared that the Muni fleet should increase, and questioned by a bond measure is needed.

Anastasia Yovanopoulos commented on the Controller's Report and questioned by the SFMTA does not apply for grants.

Edward Mason expressed concern for transportation sustainability and street, also sharing that he was disappointed with Expenditure Plan Advisory Committee attendance.

David Pilpel discussed transportation funding and shared that he anticipates opposition to the sales tax measure and other measures for those unhappy with the SFMTA.

12. Discussion and vote pursuant to Administrative Code Section 67.10(d) as to whether to invoke the attorney-client privilege and conduct a closed session conference with legal counsel.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel commented on the loss of Gus Vardakastanis and hoped that the SFMTA made traffic engineering and enforcement changes to the produce area so that no more loss of life occurs.

On motion to invoke the attorney-client privilege:

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Eaken, Heminger, Hinze, Lai and Yekutieli

#### RECESS REGULAR MEETING AND CONVENE CLOSED SESSION

#### CLOSED SESSION

1. Call to Order

Chair Borden called the closed session to order at 4:52 p.m.

2. Roll Call

Present: Gwyneth Borden  
Amanda Eaken  
Steve Heminger  
Fiona Hinze  
Sharon Lai  
Manny Yekutieli

Also present: Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation  
Susan Cleveland-Knowles, Deputy City Attorney  
David Delbon, Deputy City Attorney  
Tom Maguire, Director of Streets  
Christine Silva, Board Secretary

3. Pursuant to Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1) and the Administrative Code Section 67.8 (a)(3), the Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors will meet in Closed Session to discuss and take action on attorney-client matters on the following:

CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL

Existing Litigation:

- A. Paul Senatori v. CCSF, Superior Ct. No. CGC-19-578549 filed on 8/21/19 for \$200,000
- B. Georgia Vardakastanis v. CCSF, Superior Ct. No. CGC-18-570237 filed on 10/02/18 for \$200,000

RESOLUTION 211221-150

On motion to approve item A:

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Eaken, Heminger Hinze, and Lai  
NAYES – Yekutieli

On motion to approve item B:

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Eaken, Heminger Hinze, Lai, and Yekutieli

ADJOURN CLOSED SESSION AND RECONVENE OPEN SESSION – The closed session was adjourned at 5:21 p.m.

Director Heminger left the meeting.

13. Announcement of Closed Session.

Board Secretary Silva announced that the SFMTA Board of Directors met in closed session to discuss the cases with the City Attorney. The Board voted to settle both cases.

14. Motion to disclose or not disclose the information discussed in closed session.

On motion to not disclose the information discussed:

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Eaken, Hinze, Lai and Yekutieli  
ABSENT – Heminger

ADJOURN – The meeting was adjourned at 5:24 p.m.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.



Christine Silva  
Board Secretary

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call (415) 554-5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call (415) 554-5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: <https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf>.

The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist

Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax: 415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the web site: [sfgov.org/ethics](http://sfgov.org/ethics).

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on a agenda, please email the Board at [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com). Please know that the Board appreciates receiving such communication not later than Monday, the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.

#### KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at [sotf@sfgov.org](mailto:sotf@sfgov.org).

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at [sfgov.org](http://sfgov.org).