



# San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors & Parking Authority Commission

---

**MEETING MINUTES** • Meeting Date: Tuesday, April 19, 2022

## **REGULAR MEETING AND CLOSED SESSION**

1:00pm

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
Room 400, City Hall

This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. As authorized by California Government Code Section 54953(e) and Mayor Breed's 45th Supplement to her February 25, 2020 emergency proclamation, it is possible that some members of the SFMTA Board of Directors may attend this meeting remotely. In that event, those members will participate and vote by video. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or online at [www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE](http://www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE). Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Board in advance of the meeting, please send an email to [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com) by 5pm the day before the meeting or call 415.646.4470.

## **REMOTE MEETING ACCESS**

WATCH: [www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE](http://www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE) or  
<https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/board-directors-meeting-april-19-2022>

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: 415.655.0001 Access Code: 2491 993 9700

## **SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

Gwyneth Borden, Chair  
Amanda Eaken, Vice Chair  
Stephanie Cajina  
Steve Heminger  
Fiona Hinze  
Sharon Lai  
Manny Yekutieli

## **DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION**

Jeffrey Tumlin

## **BOARD SECRETARY**

Christine Silva



## **ORDER OF BUSINESS**

### 1. Call to Order

Chair Borden called the meeting to order at 1:01pm.

Board Secretary Silva announced information about the hybrid meeting format and reviewed how members of the public could watch the meeting and address the Board.

### 2. Roll Call

Present: Stephanie Cajina  
Steve Heminger  
Fiona Hinze  
Sharon Lai  
Manny Yekutieli  
Amanda Eaken  
Gwyneth Borden

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting

Board Secretary Silva announced that ringing and the use of cell phones and similar sound-producing electronic devices were prohibited at the meeting.

### 4. Approval of Minutes

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of the April 5, 2022 Regular Meeting:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Lai, Yekutieli, Eaken and Borden

### 5. Communications

None.

### 6. Introduction of New or Unfinished Business by Board Members

Director Lai requested an update on parking supply management and the Residential Parking Permit Program.



Director Yekutieli requested a tour of the sign and paint shops including going out in the field.

Director Cajina requested an update on tow policy.

No public comment.

#### 7. Director's Report (For discussion only)

- Transit Safety
- Vision Zero
- Central Subway Project
- Climate Action Update
- Ongoing Activities

Director Tumlin provided updates on transit safety, mask mandates, the Gender Equity Safety Initiative, quarterly Muni maintenance, transit service changes, Vision Zero, the Central Subway Project, JFK Drive, and climate action.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT:

Richard Rothman expressed concern over traffic safety and shared about his experience riding the Golden Gate Park shuttle.

Calvin thanked the SFMTA for bringing back the 8AX/8BX Bayshore Express lines.

Mark Norton encouraged the SFMTA to maintain the mask mandate and keep riders safe.

Herbert Weiner expressed concern over pedestrian safety when needing to cross the street to access the 49 Van Ness line.

Edward Mason commented on the climate program and expressed concern over air circulation and air conditioning on transit vehicles.

Barbra Thomson commented that it was not appropriate to make political statements.

Adam Mesa expressed concern over meter parking.

Peter Strauss expressed concern over the mask mandate and asked that it be continued.



Anonymous urged the SFMTA to consider supporting students with a free transit pass.

Ben Valis expressed support for the mask mandate on Muni and taxis.

Heather Brandt urged the SFMTA to consider providing City College students with free transit passes.

#### 8. Citizens' Advisory Council Report

Board Secretary Silva presented the item.

No public comment.

#### 9. Public Comment

Members of the public may address the SFMTA Board of Directors on matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction and are not on today's calendar.

Ben Valis was concerned over allowing Uber and Lyft to charge less than the meter rate and expressed support for a living wage for San Franciscans.

Garrett Dela Concepcion expressed concern for parking meter rates in the Mission Bay neighborhood and urged the Board to investigate the issue.

Petr Lidskiy expressed concern for Mission Bay parking and asked the SFMTA for help.

John Michael Santos expressed concern over parking in the Mission Bay neighborhood and urged the Board to provide relief.

Anonymous shared about the very few parking spaces and meter cost in Mission Bay and urged the SFMTA to resolve the issue.

Daryl Lamy expressed concern about the inadequate parking in Mission Bay and shared about the difficulty for those that live in low-income buildings.

Virginia Molina expressed concern over parking meters in Mission Bay, sometimes paying \$480 a month because meters are from 9am-10pm including Sundays and event days.

Roberta Moore expressed concern for parking in Mission Bay, sharing that the meters are so high that residents cannot afford to pay rent.



Michelle Hernandez expressed concern over parking availability in Mission Bay, sharing that her rent is less than what she pays for the meters.

Sherrie Gaines expressed concern over parking meters and availability in the Mission Bay neighborhood and urged the SFMTA to implement a parking permit solution for residents.

Adel Parkrad expressed concern over having to pay \$8 an hour for parking and asked the SFMTA for a discount or program to make parking more affordable.

Zhixing Yan expressed concern over parking, sharing his experience of commuting from Mission Bay to the airport, transporting his family, and asking the SFMTA to resolve the issue.

Anonymous expressed concern over parking affordability in Mission Bay and having to search 1-2 hours for parking on game days.

Matthew Sutter expressed concern over taxi medallions and urged the SFMTA to ensure drivers get the meter rate.

Anonymous urged the SFMTA to provide a parking solution to residents in the Mission Bay neighborhood.

Barbra Thomson expressed concern over parking enforcement and a lack of coordination between the SFMTA and SFPD for stolen cars.

Christine Erickson expressed concern over parking in Mission Bay and suggested residents pay a reduced parking meter amount using license plate reading technology.

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS BEFORE THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR ACTION AS STATED BY THE SFMTA DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION OR CITY ATTORNEY WHERE APPLICABLE. EXPLANATORY DOCUMENTS FOR ALL CALENDAR ITEMS ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. 7th FLOOR.

### **CONSENT CALENDAR**

10. All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and will be acted upon by a single vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Board of Directors or the public so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item.



10.1. Requesting the Controller to allot funds and to draw warrants against such funds available or will be available in payment of the following claims against the SFMTA:

A. Iheem Antone v. CCSF, Superior Ct. #CGC-19-579006 filed 9/04/2019 for \$25,000. (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 220419-032

10.2 Adopting the Muni Service Equity Strategy Report for Fiscal Years 2023 and 2024 to assess Muni service performance in select low income and minority neighborhoods, identify major Muni transit related challenges impacting selected neighborhoods, and develop proposed strategies to address the identified major challenges. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 220419-033

No public comment.

On motion to approve the Consent Calendar:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Lai and Borden  
ABSENT – Eaken and Yekutieli

## **REGULAR CALENDAR**

11. Amending the Transportation Code, Division II, Section 702 to reduce the speed limit from 25 miles per hour to 20 miles per hour on the following 12 City street segments: 3rd Street, between Williams Avenue and Evans Avenue; Balboa Street, between 3rd Avenue and 7th Avenue; Castro Street, between Market Street and 19th Street; Divisadero Street, between Golden Gate Avenue and Haight Street; Divisadero Street, between Pine Street and O'Farrell Street; Geneva Avenue, between Gloria Court and Paris Street; Market Street, between Castro Street and Octavia Street; Mission Street, between Cortland Avenue and 14th Street; Noriega Street, between 19th Avenue and 27th Avenue; Noriega Street, between 30th Avenue and 33rd Avenue; Stockton Street, between Market Street and Bush Street; and West Portal Avenue, between 15th Avenue and Ulloa Street. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution. All of the proposed actions listed above are Approval Actions as defined by SF Administrative Code Chapter 31.)

Ryan Reeves, Vision Zero Program Manager, and Uyen Ngo, Vision Zero Education and Outreach Lead, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:



Members of the public expressing support: Brian Haagsman and Anonymous

RESOLUTION No. 220419-034

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Lai, Yekutieli, Eaken and Borden

Items 12a and 12b were called together.

- 12a. Approving the SFMTA's Fiscal Year 2023-2027 Capital Improvement Program in the amount of \$2.6 billion, including 157 proposed projects within ten capital programs, including transit reliability, street safety, state of good repair, facilities, taxi, system safety, and accessibility. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 220419-035

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Lai, Yekutieli, Eaken and Borden

- 12b. Approving various actions related to the SFMTA two-year Fiscal Year (FY) 2023 and 2024 Budget including approving the SFMTA FY 2023 and FY 2024 Operating Budget, in the amounts of \$1,357.1 million and \$1,400.1 million, respectively; and the Capital Budget in the amounts of \$424 million and \$338 million, respectively; certifying that the FY 2023 and FY 2024 Operating and Capital budgets are adequate in making substantial progress towards meeting the performance standards established pursuant to SF Charter Section 8A.103; authorizing changes to various fines, fees, fares, rates, and charges for the fiscal years beginning July 1, 2022, and July 1, 2023; approving the suspension of the Automatic Indexing Implementation Plan on Municipal Railway fares and extension of free Municipal Railway fares for all youth 19 and under; approving the Title VI analysis of the impact of the proposed fare change on low-income and minority communities in San Francisco, which determined that there is no disparate impact to minority populations or disproportionate burden to low-income populations; acting as both the SFMTA Board of Directors and the Parking Authority Commission approving increases to various fines, fees, rates, and charges including, among other things, making increases and decreases for late payment penalties, special collection fees, and boot removal fees; Transportation Code penalties; Vehicle Code penalties; color curb, general loading, and red zone driveway fees; towing and storage fees; community service and payment plan processing fees; parking meter use fees; temporary no-parking sign posting fees; signs and parking space



removal/relocation fees; intellectual property license fees (film permits); Clipper Card and Lifeline ID card replacement fees; non-standard vehicle permit fees; planning and development transportation analysis review fees; development project review fees; citywide variable parking meter rates; and fees for various types of permits including special traffic, temporary exclusive use of parking meters, residential area parking, contractor, vanpool, stationless bicycle share program application, SFMTA permit, on-street shared vehicle, on-street shared electric moped parking, press, designated shuttle stop use, farmer's market parking, temporary street closure (ISCOTT) and bus substitution; waiving all taxi permit fees for FY 2022-2023 and 2023-2024; revising various provisions of the Residential Parking Permit program; and adding a fee for color curb no parking zone where the applicant is more than 1,000 feet from the no parking zone; authorizing the Director to implement short-term experimental fares and parking rates which enable the SFMTA to respond effectively to community requests and public health and safety emergencies; concurring with the Controller's certification that parking citation processing and collection services; facility security services; paratransit services; parking meter collection and coin counting services; transit shelter maintenance services; and vehicle towing, storage and disposal services can be practically performed by private contractors at a lesser cost than to provide the same services with City employees; and authorizing the Director to make necessary technical and clerical corrections to the approved FY 2023 and FY 2024 Operating and Capital budgets of the SFMTA and to allocate additional revenues and/or City and County discretionary revenues in order to fund additional adjustments to the operating or capital budget, provided that the Director of Transportation shall return to the SFMTA Board of Directors for approval of technical or clerical corrections that, in aggregate, exceed a ten percent change to the SFMTA operating and or capital budget respectively. (Explanatory documents include a staff report, amendment, budget, analysis, fare, fee and fine changes and resolution.)

Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer, presented the items.

Director Heminger requested quarterly budget updates.

PUBLIC COMMENT (Items 12a & 12b):

Members of the public expressing support: Zack Deutsch-Gross, Jodie Medeiros, Wesley Savers, Ed Rodick, Vinita Goyal, Clare Amable, Barry Taranto, Margot Reed, Adrienne Zang and Eric Rozell

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: Flo Kelly, Anonymous, Chaz, Herbert Weiner, Heather Grant, Claire Lau and Anne Stuhldreher

RESOLUTION No. 220419-036



On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Lai, Yekutieli, Eaken and Borden

13. Authorizing the Director to execute Contract No. SFMTA-2022-13, for Parking Meter Coin and Parking Data Collection Services, with LAZ Parking California for a total amount not to exceed \$50.8 million and for a total term of ten years (five base years, with an option to extend for up to five additional years). (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

Ted Graff, Director of Parking, and Alexiy Sukhenko, Project Manager, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing opposition: John Michael Santos

RESOLUTION No. 220419-037

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Lai, Yekutieli and Borden  
ABSENT – Eaken

14. Discussion and vote pursuant to Administrative Code Section 67.10(d) as to whether to invoke the attorney-client privilege and conduct a closed session conference with legal counsel.

No public comment.

On motion to go into closed session:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Lai, Yekutieli and Borden  
ABSENT – Eaken

RECESS REGULAR MEETING AND CONVENE CLOSED SESSION

The Board recessed at 5:14pm.

### **CLOSED SESSION**

1. Call to Order



Chair Borden called the closed session to order at 5:18pm.

2. Roll Call

Present: Stephanie Cajina  
Steve Heminger  
Fiona Hinze  
Sharon Lai  
Manny Yekutieli  
Gwyneth Borden

Absent: Amanda Eaken (at Roll Call)

Also present: Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation  
Stephanie Stuart, Deputy City Attorney  
Jim Emery, Deputy City Attorney  
Jaime Huling-Delays, Deputy City Attorney  
Deanna DeSedas, Interim Director of Communications, Marketing,  
Outreach  
Kate Toran, Director Taxis, Access & Mobility Services Division  
Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transit  
Tom Maguire, Director of Streets  
Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer  
Christine Silva, Board Secretary

3. Pursuant to Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1) and the Administrative Code Section 67.10(d), the SFMTA Board of Directors will meet in Closed Session to discuss and take action on attorney-client matters on the following:

Director Eaken joined the closed session.

CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL

Existing Litigation:

S.F. Federal Credit Union v. SFMTA, San Francisco Superior Court #CGC-18-565325 filed 3/27/2018, California Court of Appeal Case No. A164463

4. Pursuant to Government Code Section 54957.6(a) and Administrative Code Section 67.10(e) the Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors shall meet in closed session for:



CONFERENCE WITH NEGOTIATOR – COLLECTIVE BARGAINING

CCSF Representative: Gina Roccanova and/or her designees

Employee Organizations:

1. Transportation Workers Union Local 250-A
2. Transportation Workers Union Local 200
3. International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers Local 6
4. International Association of Machinists & Aerospace Workers Local 1414
5. Service Employees International Union Local 1021
6. Municipal Executives Association
7. Service Employees International Union City Wide Contract
8. The International Federation of Professional and Technical Engineers, Local 21

To discuss:

- Wages
- Hours
- Benefits
- Working Conditions
- Other
- All

ADJOURN CLOSED SESSION AND RECONVENE OPEN SESSION

The closed session adjourned at 6:05pm.

15. Announcement of Closed Session

Board Secretary Silva announced that the Board of Directors met in closed session and took no action.

16. Motion to disclose or not disclose the information discussed in closed session

On motion to not disclose:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Lai, Yekutieli, Eaken and Borden

**ADJOURN** – The meeting adjourned at 6:07pm.



A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.

  
Christine Silva  
Board Secretary

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call 415.554.5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call 415.554.5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: <https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf>.

The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax: 415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the website: <https://sfethics.org/>.

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on an agenda, please email the Board at [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com). Please know that the Board appreciates receiving such communication not later than 5pm the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.



### **KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at [sotf@sfgov.org](mailto:sotf@sfgov.org).

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at <https://sfgov.org/sunshine/>.