



San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Citizens' Advisory Council

MINUTES • Meeting Date: June 2, 2022

REGULAR MEETING

5:30 pm

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect our Council Members, SFMTA staff, and members of the public, the SFMTA Meeting Room (Union Square Conference Room) is closed.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Council in advance of the meeting, please send an email to CAC@sfmta.com by 5 p.m. the day before the meeting, or call (415) 646-2388.

REMOTE MEETING ACCESS

WATCH: (link can be found online <https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/citizens-advisory-council-cac-regular-meeting-june-2-2022>)

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: (415) 915-0757 | Conference ID: 761 115 52#

SFMTA CITIZENS' ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS

Michael Chen, Chair

Aaron Leifer, Vice-Chair

Chris Arvin

Sascha Bittner

Queena Chen

Steve Cornell

John Lisovsky

Obai Rambo

Karim Salgado

Yensing Sihapanya

Connor Skelly

Susan Vaughan

Dorris Vincent

Frank Zepeda

COUNCIL LIAISON

Christine Silva

COUNCIL SECRETARY

Keka Robinson-Luqman



ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to Order

Chair Chen called the meeting to order at 5:31 p.m.

2. Roll Call

CAC members present at Roll Call: Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Aaron Leifer, Obai Rambo, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

CAC members absent at Roll Call: Chris Arvin

CAC members absent with notification: Stephen Cornell and John Lisovsky

CAC members absent without notification: Queena Chen and Dorris Vincent

3. Announcement of prohibition of sound-producing devices during the meeting.

No announcement was made

4. Approval of Minutes:

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that he had not had a chance to review the minutes. He said that there was a lot of feedback on the line and reminded everyone to mute themselves when not speaking to cut down on reverberation.

On motion to approve the minutes of May 5, 2022:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Aaron Leifer, Obai Rambo, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Queena Chen, Stephen Cornell, John Lisovsky, and Dorris Vincent

5. Report of the Chair (For discussion only)

Chair Chen reported that elections for Chair and Vice Chair will be held during the July CAC meeting. He reminded members that there is a vacancy on the Bond Oversight Committee and to let him know if any member is interested in filling that vacancy. Chair Chen also reported that he would be calling item 9 before item 8 due to a staff request.

No public comment.



6. Public Comment

Edward Mason discussed the lack of time on the new bus displays and rail slapping.

Hayden Miller discussed the SFMTA survey about potentially eliminating service on the 36 Teresita line. It's essential to have transit access to the parks for equity reasons.

REGULAR CALENDAR

7. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding findings under new state urgency legislation to allow remote meetings during the COVID-19 emergency; continuing remote meetings for the next 30 days; and directing the Council Secretary to agendize a similar resolution at a council meeting within 30 days. (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

No public comment.

CAC MOTION 220602.01

WHEREAS, California Government Code Section 54953(e) empowers local policy bodies to convene by teleconferencing technology during a proclaimed state of emergency under the State Emergency Services Act so long as certain conditions are met; and

WHEREAS, In March 2020, the Governor of the State of California proclaimed a state of emergency in California in connection with the Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic, and that state of emergency remains in effect; and

WHEREAS, On February 25, 2020, the Mayor of the City and County of San Francisco (the City) declared a local emergency, and on March 6, 2020, the City's Health Officer declared a local health emergency and both those declarations also remain in effect; and

WHEREAS, On March 11 and March 23, 2020, the Mayor issued emergency orders suspending select provisions of local law, including sections of the City Charter, that restrict teleconferencing by members of policy bodies; those orders remain in effect, so City law currently allows policy bodies to meet remotely if they comply with restrictions in State law regarding teleconference meetings; and

WHEREAS, On September 16, 2021, the Governor signed AB 361, a bill that amends the Brown Act to allow local policy bodies to continue to meet by teleconferencing during a state of emergency without complying with restrictions in State law that would otherwise apply, provided that the policy bodies make certain findings at least once every 30 days; and

WHEREAS, While federal, State, and local health officials emphasize the critical importance of vaccination and consistent mask-wearing to prevent the spread of COVID-19, the City's Health Officer has issued at least one order (Health Officer Order No. C19-07y,



available online at www.sfdph.org/healthorders) and one directive (Health Officer Directive No. 2020-33i, available online at <http://www.sfdph.org/directives>) that continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, such as masking, in certain contexts; and

WHEREAS, The California Department of Industrial Relations Division of Occupational Safety and Health (Cal/OSHA) has promulgated Section 3205 of Title 8 of the California Code of Regulations, which requires most employers in California, including in the City, to train and instruct employees about measures that can decrease the spread of COVID-19, including physical distancing and other social distancing measures; and

WHEREAS, Without limiting any requirements under applicable federal, state, or local pandemic-related rules, orders, or directives, the City's Department of Public Health, in coordination with the City's Health Officer, has advised that for group gatherings indoors, such as meetings of boards and commissions, people can increase safety and greatly reduce risks to the health and safety of attendees from COVID-19 by maximizing ventilation, wearing well-fitting masks (as required by Health Officer Order No. C19-07), using physical distancing where the vaccination status of attendees is not known, and considering holding the meeting remotely if feasible, especially for long meetings, with any attendees with unknown vaccination status and where ventilation may not be optimal; and

WHEREAS, On July 31, 2020, the Mayor issued an emergency order that, with limited exceptions, prohibited policy bodies other than the Board of Supervisors and its committees from meeting in person under any circumstances, so as to ensure the safety of policy body members, City staff, and the public; and

WHEREAS, The SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council has met remotely during the COVID-19 emergency and can continue to do so in a manner that allows public participation and transparency while minimizing health risks to members, staff, and the public that would be present with in-person meetings while this emergency continues; and

WHEREAS, On September 27, 2021, the SFMTA, under authority delegated by the Planning Department, determined that the AB 361 findings described above are not a "project" under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations Sections 15060(c) and 15378(b); and,

WHEREAS, A copy of the CEQA determination is on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council and is incorporated herein by reference;

WHEREAS, On October 14, 2021, in Recommendation No. 211014-117, the Council adopted the recommended findings allowing it to continue to meet remotely for 30 days; now, therefore, be it



RESOLVED, That SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council finds as follows:

1. As described above, the State of California and the City remain in a state of emergency due to the COVID-19 pandemic. At this meeting, the Council has reconsidered the circumstances of the state of emergency.
2. As described above, State and City officials continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, in some settings.
3. As described above, because of the COVID-19 pandemic, conducting meetings of this body and its committees in person would present imminent risks to the safety of attendees, and the state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability of members to meet safely in person; and, be it further

RESOLVED, for at least the next 30 days, meetings of the SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council and its committees will continue to occur exclusively by teleconferencing technology (and not by any in-person meetings or any other meetings with public access to the places where any policy body member is present for the meeting). Such meetings of the Council and its committees that occur by teleconferencing technology will provide an opportunity for members of the public to address this body and its committees and will otherwise occur in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of parties and the members of the public attending the meeting via teleconferencing; and, be it further

RESOLVED, That the Council Secretary is directed to place a resolution substantially similar to this resolution on the agenda of a future meeting of The SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council within the next 30 days. If the Council does not meet within the next 30 days, the Council Secretary is directed to place such a resolution on the agenda of the next meeting of the Council.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Aaron Leifer, Obai Rambo, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Queena Chen, Stephen Cornell John Lisovsky, and Dorris Vincent

8. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) proposal for fare integration pilots. (Adina Levin, Advocacy Director, Seamless Bay Area. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)



Adina Levin, Advocacy Director, Seamless Bay Area presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that he supports the pilot project but not the overall plan. He suggested starting with subregional consolidation in the Bay Area. Muni, Bart, and AC Transit have always carried more than two-thirds of Bay Area transit riders and are doing a great job. He is not sure that this is a problem that requires such a heavy intervention. Transit service levels are locally determined, and money spent on new signage and branding could be spent on service. Good coordination could be accompanied without state legislation.

Cyrus Hall expressed support for the pilot program. It's vital to make cross-agency travel easy. The pilot program is the first step towards that goal. It sucks to pay two or three base fares because your destination is in a different county.

Liz Broekhuysen spoke in favor of the pilot program. The pilot program is a meaningful first step toward a fairer fare system.

Graham Smith spoke in favor of the pilot program. The Bay Area's transit systems are disjointed. The pilot is a good idea and would hopefully move the Bay Area toward a less byzantine transit system.

CAC MOTION 220602.04

The SFMTA CAC supports the All-Agency Transit Pass Pilot Program to study the effects of fare integration on ridership, rider experience, serving low-income riders in equity goals, and revenue/costs.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Aaron Leifer, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Queena Chen, Stephen Cornell, John Lisovsky, Obai Rambo, and Dorris Vincent

9. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding Muni Forward. (Sean Kennedy, Transit Planning Manager. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Sean Kennedy, Transit Planning Manager, presented the item.



PUBLIC COMMENT:

Edward Mason said there was no public outreach for the forced transfer on the L at West Portal Station. He spoke in favor of the mask mandate. Muni is behind the curve when it comes to hiring.

David Pilpel stated that he has not been able to reach Sean Kennedy in over a month and is extremely disappointed that he has left the meeting. He does not understand the service changes on the 23, 57, or 58 lines. The map is confusing. He also discussed reliability issues on the 28 line. The forced transfer is not what the public was promised for the L Taraval project.

Paula Katz discussed the L Taraval. Muni should not take away the option to ride the bus all the way downtown instead of forcing a transfer. The proposal is short sided and a breach of the promise that the L Taraval bus would go downtown.

Cyrus Hall Spoke in favor of a mask mandate.

Hayden Miller stated that there should be a 15 and 8 minute split to provide more service on the L Taraval line.

CAC MOTION 220602.02

Whereas:

- The city of San Francisco is experiencing a surge in COVID cases
- COVID cases among transit operators have delayed service restoration, and further outbreaks could prevent or delay additional service restoration
- A goal of service restoration is to encourage more riders to return to transit
- Some Muni lines are experiencing crowded conditions as ridership returns

The SFMTA CAC requests that the SFMTA board reinstate a mask mandate on Muni in order to: protect the health of operators and riders, especially those who are immunocompromised; to create a safe environment to encourage riders to return to transit; to be consistent with and support mask policies currently in place by BART; to help prevent missed service; and to help prevent additional delays in service restoration.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Aaron Leifer, Obai Rambo, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, John Lisovsky, and Dorris Vincent



CAC MOTION 220602.03

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA prioritize staff hiring and study process improvements that may accelerate the agency's frontline hiring goals. The CAC recommends that the agency plan service conservatively with a buffer so that the agency can absorb future public health emergencies, including COVID surges, without a loss of service.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Aaron Leifer, Obai Rambo, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda
ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, John Lisovsky, and Dorris Vincent

10. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the Administration, Operations, and Customer Service Committee (AOCSC) report and recommendations.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Edward Mason stated that it's cheaper to buy and maintain a personal bicycle than to use bikeshare due to the pricing structure.

AOCSC Motion 220519.01

The SFMTA CAC recommends a simpler, more transparent Bay Wheels pricing schedule that:

1. Increases ridership to promote the city's climate and mode shift goals
2. Demands financial modeling from Lyft to show the impact of its price schedule on revenue and ridership
3. Communicates prices upfront and reduces sticker shock for new riders, who can pay \$10 for a 15-minute ride
4. Reduces and simplifies the number of fees which cause confusion to riders: unlock fee, ebike per-minute fee, out-of-dock parking fee
5. Limits monthly membership costs to no more than 150% of annual membership (e.g. for \$169 annual = \$14/month, the cap for monthly is \$21/month)
6. Clearly marks special zones that cap or waive fees in the app for transparency
7. Better incentivizes riders who return ebikes to stations and load balance the network, lowering operational costs
8. Expands eligibility and uptake for Bikeshare for All
9. Sets an expectation for revenue that does not meet cost recovery



CAC MOTION 220602.05

The SFMTA CAC recommends a simpler, more transparent Bay Wheels pricing schedule that:

1. Increases ridership to promote the city's climate and mode shift goals
2. Demands financial modeling from Lyft to show the impact of its price schedule on revenue and ridership
3. Communicates prices upfront and reduces sticker shock for new riders, who can pay \$10 for a 15-minute ride
4. Reduces and simplifies the number of fees which cause confusion to riders: unlock fee, ebike per-minute fee, out-of-dock parking fee
5. Limits monthly membership costs to no more than 150% of annual membership (e.g. for \$169 annual = \$14/month, the cap for monthly is \$21/month)
6. Clearly marks special zones that cap or waive fees in the app for transparency
7. Better incentivizes riders who return ebikes to stations and load balance the network, lowering operational costs
8. Expands eligibility and uptake for Bikeshare for All
9. Sets an expectation for revenue that does not meet cost recovery

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Aaron Leifer, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Queena Chen, Stephen Cornell, John Lisovsky, Obai Rambo, and Dorris Vincent

AOCSC Motion 220519.02

Whereas the costs of bikeshare rides and memberships – especially with regards to e-bikes – has made bikeshare unaffordable and SFMTA stats show that high prices are discouraging ridership, the SFMTA CAC urges the SFMTA to not pursue renewals of bikeshare agreements with Lyft and encourages the SFMTA to support and work towards a program that is publicly-operated or operated with a not-for-profit partner.

CAC MOTION 220602.06

Whereas the costs of bikeshare rides and memberships – especially with regards to e-bikes – has made bikeshare unaffordable and SFMTA stats show that high prices are discouraging ridership, the SFMTA CAC urges the SFMTA to not pursue renewals of



bikeshare agreements with Lyft and encourages the SFMTA to support and work towards a program that is publicly-operated or operated with a not-for-profit partner.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Aaron Leifer, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan,

NAYES – Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Queena Chen, Stephen Cornell, John Lisovsky, Obai Rambo, and Dorris Vincent

11. Council Member Information and Agenda Item Requests. (For discussion only)

None.

No public comment.

ADJOURN - The meeting was adjourned at 8:22 p.m.

Submitted by:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'KAROLINA LUQMAN'.

Keka Robinson-Luqman
SFMTA CAC – Secretary

Next regular meeting: Thursday, July 7th at 5:30pm | Online via Microsoft Teams