



# San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Citizens' Advisory Council

---

**MINUTES** • Meeting Date: August 4, 2022

## **REGULAR MEETING**

5:30 pm

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect our Council Members, SFMTA staff, and members of the public, the SFMTA Meeting Room (Union Square Conference Room) is closed.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Council in advance of the meeting, please send an email to [CAC@sfmta.com](mailto:CAC@sfmta.com) by 5pm on the Wednesday before the meeting, or call (415) 646-2388.

## **REMOTE MEETING ACCESS**

WATCH: (link can be found online <https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/citizens-advisory-council-cac-regular-meeting-august-4-2022>)

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: (415) 915-0757 | Conference ID: 761 115 52#

## **SFMTA CITIZENS' ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS**

Michael Chen, Chair  
Aaron Leifer, Vice-Chair  
Chris Arvin  
Sascha Bittner  
Queena Chen  
Steve Cornell  
John Lisovsky  
Obai Rambo  
Karim Salgado  
Yensing Sihapanya  
Connor Skelly  
Susan Vaughan  
Dorris Vincent  
Frank Zepeda

## **COUNCIL LIAISON**

Christine Silva

## **COUNCIL SECRETARY**

Keka Robinson-Luqman



## **ORDER OF BUSINESS**

### 1. Call to Order

Chair Chen called the meeting to order at 5:35 p.m.

### 2. Roll Call

CAC members present at Roll Call: Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

CAC members absent with notification: Obai Rambo

CAC members absent without notification: Queena Chen

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound-producing devices during the meeting.

No announcement was made.

### 4. Approval of Minutes:

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of July 7, 2022:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Queena Chen and Obai Rambo

### 5. Report of the Chair (For discussion only)

Chair Chen asked the Council members for detailed presentation topics for future meetings.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel offered suggestions on how to handle presentation requests with SFMTA staff.

### 6. Public Comment

Paula Katz stated that the SFMTA violated the City Charter when it substantially changed the L Taravel bus route by eliminating the West Portal to Embarcadero section without a public hearing or approval by the SFMTA Board of Directors as required by the Charter, and she



asked the CAC to place this issue on a future Agenda and to ask SFMTA what written exception to the clear Charter language justified their making this change without Board approval.

Edward Mason stated that the staircase at Market and Eighth streets into the Muni station needs management attention.

### **REGULAR CALENDAR**

7. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding findings under new state urgency legislation to allow remote meetings during the COVID-19 emergency; continuing remote meetings for the next 30 days; and directing the Council Secretary to agendize a similar resolution at a council meeting within 30 days. (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

No public comment.

#### **CAC MOTION 220804.01**

WHEREAS, California Government Code Section 54953(e) empowers local policy bodies to convene by teleconferencing technology during a proclaimed state of emergency under the State Emergency Services Act so long as certain conditions are met; and

WHEREAS, In March 2020, the Governor of the State of California proclaimed a state of emergency in California in connection with the Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic, and that state of emergency remains in effect; and

WHEREAS, On February 25, 2020, the Mayor of the City and County of San Francisco (the City) declared a local emergency, and on March 6, 2020, the City's Health Officer declared a local health emergency and both those declarations also remain in effect; and

WHEREAS, On March 11 and March 23, 2020, the Mayor issued emergency orders suspending select provisions of local law, including sections of the City Charter, that restrict teleconferencing by members of policy bodies; those orders remain in effect, so City law currently allows policy bodies to meet remotely if they comply with restrictions in State law regarding teleconference meetings; and

WHEREAS, On September 16, 2021, the Governor signed AB 361, a bill that amends the Brown Act to allow local policy bodies to continue to meet by teleconferencing during a state of emergency without complying with restrictions in State law that would otherwise apply, provided that the policy bodies make certain findings at least once every 30 days; and

WHEREAS, While federal, State, and local health officials emphasize the critical importance of vaccination and consistent mask-wearing to prevent the spread of COVID-19, the City's Health Officer has issued at least one order (Health Officer Order No. C19-07y,



available online at [www.sfdph.org/healthorders](http://www.sfdph.org/healthorders)) and one directive (Health Officer Directive No. 2020-33i, available online at <http://www.sfdph.org/directives>) that continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, such as masking, in certain contexts; and

WHEREAS, The California Department of Industrial Relations Division of Occupational Safety and Health (Cal/OSHA) has promulgated Section 3205 of Title 8 of the California Code of Regulations, which requires most employers in California, including in the City, to train and instruct employees about measures that can decrease the spread of COVID-19, including physical distancing and other social distancing measures; and

WHEREAS, Without limiting any requirements under applicable federal, state, or local pandemic-related rules, orders, or directives, the City's Department of Public Health, in coordination with the City's Health Officer, has advised that for group gatherings indoors, such as meetings of boards and commissions, people can increase safety and greatly reduce risks to the health and safety of attendees from COVID-19 by maximizing ventilation, wearing well-fitting masks (as required by Health Officer Order No. C19-07), using physical distancing where the vaccination status of attendees is not known, and considering holding the meeting remotely if feasible, especially for long meetings, with any attendees with unknown vaccination status and where ventilation may not be optimal; and

WHEREAS, On July 31, 2020, the Mayor issued an emergency order that, with limited exceptions, prohibited policy bodies other than the Board of Supervisors and its committees from meeting in person under any circumstances, so as to ensure the safety of policy body members, City staff, and the public; and

WHEREAS, The SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council has met remotely during the COVID-19 emergency and can continue to do so in a manner that allows public participation and transparency while minimizing health risks to members, staff, and the public that would be present with in-person meetings while this emergency continues; and

WHEREAS, On September 27, 2021, the SFMTA, under authority delegated by the Planning Department, determined that the AB 361 findings described above are not a "project" under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations Sections 15060(c) and 15378(b); and,

WHEREAS, A copy of the CEQA determination is on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council and is incorporated herein by reference;

WHEREAS, On October 14, 2021, in Recommendation No. 211014-117, the Council adopted the recommended findings allowing it to continue to meet remotely for 30 days; now, therefore, be it



RESOLVED, That SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council finds as follows:

1. As described above, the State of California and the City remain in a state of emergency due to the COVID-19 pandemic. At this meeting, the Council has reconsidered the circumstances of the state of emergency.
2. As described above, State and City officials continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, in some settings.
3. As described above, because of the COVID-19 pandemic, conducting meetings of this body and its committees in person would present imminent risks to the safety of attendees, and the state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability of members to meet safely in person; and, be it further

RESOLVED, for at least the next 30 days, meetings of the SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council and its committees will continue to occur exclusively by teleconferencing technology (and not by any in-person meetings or any other meetings with public access to the places where any policy body member is present for the meeting). Such meetings of the Council and its committees that occur by teleconferencing technology will provide an opportunity for members of the public to address this body and its committees and will otherwise occur in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of parties and the members of the public attending the meeting via teleconferencing; and, be it further

RESOLVED, That the Council Secretary is directed to place a resolution substantially similar to this resolution on the agenda of a future meeting of The SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council within the next 30 days. If the Council does not meet within the next 30 days, the Council Secretary is directed to place such a resolution on the agenda of the next meeting of the Council.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Queena Chen and Obai Rambo

8. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding Community Outreach. (Kate McCarthy, Manager, Public Outreach and Engagement. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)



Kate McCarthy and Ashish Patel presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Jaime Vloria suggested that the SFMTA utilize volunteers that care about transit to expand outreach. It would be great to have outreach data on the performance metrics.

Edward Mason asked if the SFMTA makes content with the general assembly of senior organizations or if they just reach out to staff. There needs to be more disclosure.

Evy Posamentier stated that she was happy with the presentation. It was a breath of fresh air. She also discussed Noe Valley listening sessions regarding the 48 Quintara line.

Written 150-Word Public Testimony by David Pilpel for Minutes of SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council Regular Meeting August 4, 2022: Agenda Item #8, Community Outreach:

1. Not funny; very serious; too much focus on accessibility and language, not enough concern for the regularly engaged public; generally unable to reach MTA staff directly, especially decisionmakers.
2. Inconsistent outreach across the MTA (Transit, Streets, budget, other / construction versus not); web sites are not maintained consistently; some projects record comments and respond, while others do not.
3. Rarely does staff change a project or recommendation based on public feedback; just checking a box; public engagement is not meaningful; it's a big failing agency; too many projects being handled poorly.
4. Is there an example of an Outreach Action Plan; not posted on project websites; outreach starts and stops; MTA avoids people that MTA staff don't like; public cannot track status of projects and outreach.
5. Ultimately, we need a Monthly Outreach Update of projects with surveys and outreach underway.

CAC MOTION 220804.02

The SFMTA CAC makes the following recommendations regarding outreach:

- 1) That 311 and non-online feedback channels are more publicized to riders on bus advertising and at bus stops;



- 2) That temporary relocation of bus stops during construction are better publicized and that construction contracts improve processes to encourage contractor compliance;
- 3) That the SFMTA focus on hiring for public outreach (as well as with other areas);
- 4) That SFMTA lobby the city Department of Human Resources to provide certifications in more languages than Cantonese and Spanish.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, , Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda  
NAYES – Stephen Cornell  
ABSENT – Queena Chen and Obai Rambo

9. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the Bayshore Boulevard Quick Build Project. (Jonathan Chimento, Junior Engineer. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Jonathan Chimento and Adrienne Heim presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Written 150-Word Public Testimony by David Pilpel for Minutes of SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council Regular Meeting August 4, 2022: Agenda Item #9, Bayshore Boulevard Quick Build Project:

1. It would be helpful to show key businesses on and near Bayshore, like Lowe's, OPR, etc; outreach should include other public agencies (DPW PUC USD); narrow sidewalks; needs sidewalk signage.
2. The 9-San Bruno has been proposed as a Trolley Coach several times, would that be facilitated here; how does staff plan to facilitate truck traffic here; not everyone who uses Bayshore lives near there.
3. I can follow-up with appropriate MTA staff on any further comments or questions that I might have.

CAC MOTION 220804.03



The SFMTA CAC supports the Bayshore Boulevard Quick Build Project, and recommends Option 2 for Section 2, between Oakdale to Jerrold. The CAC supports efforts to reduce cyclist & pedestrian injuries and fatalities on this section of the city's High Injury Network. The CAC regrets that gaps in the protected bike lanes were deemed necessary because of the road design and encourages the agency to be more aggressive in the future about implementing Vision Zero by removing all gaps in cyclist protection and increasing the frequency of bollards so that cars cannot pass through them.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Stephen Cornell

ABSENT – Queena Chen, Obai Rambo, and Dorris Vincent

10. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding motion crafted by CAC Chair Michael Chen. (No explanatory documents)

The SFMTA CAC re-affirms the MTA Board's August 3, 2021 vote to make Lake Street, Golden Gate Avenue, Sanchez Street, and Shotwell Street into long-term Slow Streets that provide safe corridors for the movement of people walking and biking and discourage private automobile through traffic. The SFMTA CAC also supports Page Street as a long-term Slow Street.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that the motion is unnecessary since the board already acted. The program is divisive and controversial.

Edward Mason stated that Sanchez Street is a party zone. It is absurd that there is an increased traffic flow on Church Street. The amount of traffic is unbelievable. It is because the traffic is diverted off Sanchez Street and onto Church Street, which then delays the J Church line.

CAC MOTION 220804.04

The SFMTA CAC re-affirms the MTA Board's August 3, 2021 vote to make Lake Street, Golden Gate Avenue, Sanchez Street, and Shotwell Street into long-term Slow Streets that provide safe corridors for the movement of people walking and biking and



discourage private automobile through traffic. The SFMTA CAC also supports Page Street as a long-term Slow Street.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, and  
NAYES – Stephen Cornell and Frank Zepeda  
ABSENT – Queena Chen, Obai Rambo, and Dorris Vincent

11. Council Member Information and Agenda Item Requests. (For discussion only)

No requests.

Edward Mason asked for a review of the car share service GetAround.

**ADJOURN** - The meeting was adjourned at 9:10 p.m.

Submitted by:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'KAROLINA LUQMAN'.

Keka Robinson-Luqman  
SFMTA CAC – Secretary

Next regular meeting: Thursday, September 1<sup>st</sup> at 5:30pm | Online via Microsoft Teams