



# San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors & Parking Authority Commission

**MEETING MINUTES** • Meeting Date: Tuesday, September 19, 2023

## **REGULAR MEETING AND CLOSED SESSION**

1:00pm

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
Room 400, City Hall

Members of the SFMTA Board of Directors will attend this meeting in-person. Members of the public are invited to observe the meeting in-person or remotely online as described below. Members of the public attending the meeting in person will have an opportunity to provide public comment on every action or discussion item.

In addition to in-person public comment, the Board will hear up to 10 minutes of remote public comment on each action or discussion item. The Board will hear remote public comment on items in the order that commenters add themselves to the queue to comment on the item. Because of the 10-minute time limit, it is possible that not every person in the queue will have an opportunity to provide remote public comment. Remote public comment from people who have received an accommodation due to disability (as described below) will not count toward the 10-minute limit.

Members of the public are encouraged to provide public comment via email. Send an email to [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com) by 5pm the day before the meeting to ensure your comment is received by the Board in advance of the meeting.

## **REMOTE MEETING ACCESS**

WATCH: [www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE](http://www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE) or  
<https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/board-directors-meeting-september-19-2023>

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: 415.655.0001 ACCESS CODE: 2663 075 5324

## **SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

Amanda Eaken, Chair  
Stephanie Cajina, Vice Chair  
Steve Heminger  
Dominica Henderson  
Fiona Hinze  
Lydia So  
Manny Yekutieli

## **DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION**

Jeffrey Tumlin

## **BOARD SECRETARY**

Christine Silva



## **ORDER OF BUSINESS**

### 1. Call to Order

Chair Eaken called the meeting to order at 1:04pm.

Board Secretary Silva announced the 10-minute time limit for remote public comment.

### 2. Roll Call

Present: Steve Heminger  
Dominica Henderson  
Fiona Hinze  
Lydia So  
Manny Yekutieli  
Amanda Eaken

Absent (with notification): Stephanie Cajina

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting

Board Secretary Silva made the announcement.

### 4. Approval of Minutes

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of the September 5, 2023, Regular Meeting:

ADOPTED: AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, Yekutieli, and Eaken  
ABSENT – Cajina

### 5. Communications

None.

### 6. Introduction of New or Unfinished Business by Board Members

None.

### 7. Director's Report (For discussion only)



- Special Recognition
- State Legislation Update
- Ongoing Activities

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transit, Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer, and Kate Toran, Director of Taxis, Access, and Mobility Services, recognized staff.

Director Kirschbaum shared about the upcoming Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation Leaders Meeting (APEC), end of session state legislation, Muni Heritage Weekend on September 23-24, new Customer Information System (CIS) signs, and the Central Subway Project winning the Engineering News-Record California's Regional Best Project award in the Best Airport/Transit category for Northern California.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Barry Taranto thanked Annette Williams for her work with the agency and asked to be included in APEC planning.

Chair Eaken acknowledged Supervisor Myrna Melgar and welcomed her comment on Item 10.1A.

The Board heard Item 10.1A out of order.

8. Citizens' Advisory Council Report

Aaron Leifer, Chair of the Citizens' Advisory Council, presented the report.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Speaker expressed support for extending meter hours and shared that it would result in more parking availability.

Stacey Randecker expressed support for extended parking meter hours.

Herbert Weiner expressed opposition to extended parking meter hours and suggested charging bicyclists for licenses and parking to generate revenue.

9. Public Comment



Members of the public may address the SFMTA Board of Directors on matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction and are not on today's calendar.

Tom Radulovich commented on the San Francisco General Plan.

Evan Oravec expressed concern about pedestrian safety, Vision Zero, and the intersection at 4<sup>th</sup> and King streets.

Luke Bornheimer urged the SFMTA to implement no turn on red lights citywide, sharing that it would make SF safer.

Jordan Smith shared about receiving several parking citations and filing public records requests for records.

Evelyn Engel expressed concern about taxi renewals beginning again and about taxi medallion enforcement.

Barry Taranto invited Directors Henderson and So to a future Taxi Alliance meeting and urged the SFMTA to prioritize enforcement against soliciting vehicles.

Speaker asked about upon requests stops and whether transit operators were still honoring those for seniors with disabilities.

Allie expressed concern about pedestrian safety and urged the SFMTA for a greater safety response.

Liz Bernsen expressed concern about pedestrian safety and urged the SFMTA to make structural improvements at dangerous intersections.

Stacey Randecker expressed concern for Vision Zero staffing and data collection, questioning why so little progress has been made.

Michael Beck expressed concern for the pedestrian fatality on 4<sup>th</sup> and King streets and realized it was the fault of those that design the roads.

Herbert Weiner expressed concern for pedestrians on the sidewalk and provided comment regarding taxi medallions.

Aaliyah expressed concern about pedestrian safety, sharing that the agency needs to take a more proactive approach at intersections.



Marcel Conseco expressed concern for medallion holders.

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS BEFORE THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR ACTION AS STATED BY THE SFMTA DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION OR CITY ATTORNEY WHERE APPLICABLE. EXPLANATORY DOCUMENTS FOR ALL CALENDAR ITEMS ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. 7th FLOOR.

### **CONSENT CALENDAR**

10. All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and will be acted upon by a single vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Board of Directors or the public so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item.

10.1. Approving various routine parking and traffic modifications. (The Planning Department has found that items A-O are exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act [CEQA]. For these parking and traffic modifications that received a categorical exemption, the proposed action is the Approval Action as defined by Chapter 31 of the San Francisco Administrative Code. Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.):

- A. ESTABLISH – 4-HOUR PARKING, 8 AM TO 6 PM, MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY – Winston Drive, both sides, from Lake Merced Boulevard to Buckingham Way; Buckingham Way, both sides, Unit, 100, 200, and 300 Blocks.
- B. ESTABLISH - RESIDENTIAL PERMIT PARKING AREA AA –3215-3219 Mission Street.
- C. ESTABLISH – BUS ZONE – Donahue Street, north side, from 100 feet to 165 feet east of Innes Avenue.
- D. RESCIND – WHITE ZONE, ACCESSIBLE PASSENGER LOADING – 24th Street, south side, from 12 feet to 60 feet east of Mission Street.
- E. RESCIND – GENERAL METERED PARKING – 24th Street, south side, from 60 feet to 108 feet east of Mission Street.
- F. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING ANY TIME – 24th Street, south side, between Mission Street and Lilac Street.
- G. ESTABLISH – BUS ZONE – Chumasero Drive, west side, from Font Boulevard to 136 feet southerly.
- H. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING ANY TIME – Chumasero Drive, east side, from Font Boulevard to 150 feet southerly.
- I. RESCIND – BLUE ZONE – Buena Vista Avenue West, east side, from 3 to 13 feet north of Waller Street park entrance.



- J. RESCIND – TOW-AWAY NO PARKING ANY TIME, EXCEPT CAR SHARE – Buena Vista Avenue West, east side, from 13 to 33 feet north of Waller Street park entrance.
- K. ESTABLISH – BLUE ZONE – Buena Vista Avenue West, east side, from 3 to 21 feet north of Waller Street park entrance.
- L. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY NO PARKING ANY TIME, EXCEPT CAR SHARE – Buena Vista Avenue West, east side, from 21 to 41 feet north of Waller Street park entrance.
- M. ESTABLISH – PERPENDICULAR PARKING – Buena Vista Avenue West, east side, from 30 to 48 feet south of Waller Street park entrance.
- N. ESTABLISH – PARALLEL PARKING – Buena Vista Avenue West, east side, from 48 to 100 feet south of Waller Street park entrance, Buena Vista Avenue East, east side, from 475 to 525 feet north of Upper Terrace.
- O. ESTABLISH – RED ZONE – Buena Vista Avenue East, east side, from 525 to 535 feet north of Upper Terrace.

Item 10.1A was severed from the Consent Calendar.

No public comment (Items 10.1B-O).

On motion to approve the Consent Calendar (Items 10.1B-O):

ADOPTED:       AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, Yekutieli, and Eaken  
                  ABESENT – Cajina

Item 10.1A – ESTABLISH – 4-HOUR PARKING, 8 AM TO 6 PM, MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY – Winston Drive, both sides, from Lake Merced Boulevard to Buckingham Way; Buckingham Way, both sides, Unit, 100, 200, and 300 Blocks.

Tom Maguire, Director of Streets, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT (Item 10.1A):

Members of the public expressing support: Michael Kissinger

Members of the public expressing opposition: Speaker, Speaker, Speaker, Marlon Arostegui, Daisy, Jordan Smith, Sydney Reitenbach, Erick Arguello, Mercedes Bullock, Yessica Hernandez, Julian Highsmith, Eleana Binder, Serena Hughes, Margaret Gannon, Evandro Palheta, Yolanda Catzalco, Flo Kelly, Ian James, Susan Cieutat, Shiba Bandeeba, Vamario Smith, Speaker, Jennifer Friedenbach, Javier Bremond, Brenda Miles, Kevin Ortiz, Malena Mackey Cabada, Celeste Funez,



David, Ian Hall, Paul Neilson, Speaker, and Herbert Weiner

On motion to approve Item 10.1A and amend the resolution to direct staff to delay implementation of Item A for three months:

ADOPTED: AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, Yekutieli, and Eaken  
ABSENT – Cajina

RESOLUTION No. 230919-076

Chair Eaken recessed the meeting at 4:17pm and reconvened the meeting at 4:28pm.

### **REGULAR CALENDAR**

11. Amending Transportation Code, Division II, Article 1100, Section 1124(b)(5) to authorize the Director of Transportation to extend the Taxi Upfront Fare Pilot Program to a date no later than June 30, 2025, amending Section 1113(m) to authorize the Director of Transportation to establish security camera standards, amending Section 1114(f) to authorize the Director of Transportation to revise standards related to Electronic Trip Data and integration with the Electronic Taxi Access System, and other non-substantive clean up, including minor grammatical fixes. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

Kate Toran, Director of Taxis, Access and Mobility Services, presented the item.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENT:**

Members of the public expressing support: David Vincent, Muwaffaq Mustafa, Robert Nguyen, Richard Weiss, and Izzy Aala

Members of the public expressing opposition: Speaker, Speaker, Nuru Mamuye, Ali Asghaol, Speaker, Barry Taranto, Evelyn Engel, Sal, Stacey Randecker, and Speaker

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: Mary Maguire

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, Yekutieli, and Eaken  
ABSENT – Cajina

RESOLUTION No. 230919-077



12. Presentation and discussion regarding an Active Communities Plan update. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Maia Small, SFMTA Planning Director, and Chris Kidd, Transportation Planner, presented the item.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

Tom Radulovich expressed concern about the proposed goals.

Zach Lipton shared about safety and project delivery, urging the SFMTA to make a bold commitment and be transformational.

Stacey Randecker expressed concern over vehicles and motorists being prioritized, sharing that staff should be out building to reach vision zero.

Trish commented on climate change and shared that the agency must take positive steps to reducing green house gas emissions by shifting from car dependent lives.

Robin Pham urged the SFMTA work now that that the agency has the staff to execute the plan without gaps and in a timely manner.

Eric Rozel urged the SFMTA to secure funding sources and work with Fire and Public Works, and encouraging the city to prioritize the safety needs of Tenderloin community.

Cyrus Hall commented on resource constraints and asked the Board to consider voicing frustration over the lack of engagement with the mayor.

Chair Eaken announced that the Board would not meet in Closed Session.

13. Discussion and vote pursuant to Administrative Code Section 67.10(d) as to whether to invoke the attorney-client privilege and conduct a closed session conference with legal counsel.

The Board did not meet in Closed Session.

**RECESS REGULAR MEETING AND CONVENE CLOSED SESSION**

**CLOSED SESSION**

1. Call to Order



2. Roll Call
3. Pursuant to Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1) and (d)(2) and the Administrative Code Section 67.8 (a)(3) and 67.10(d)(1) and (2), the SFMTA Board of Directors will meet in Closed Session to discuss and take action on attorney client matters on the following:

CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL

Existing Litigation:

- A. Mark Donikian v. CCSF, SF Superior Court Case No. CGC-21-591417 filed 05/06/21 for \$650,000. Lawsuit involving allegations of personal injury from operator negligence (revenue vehicle and passenger). (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)
- B. SF Federal Credit Union v. SFMTA, SF Superior Court Case No. CGC-18-565325 filed 3/27/18, California Court of Appeal Case No. A164463.

ADJOURN CLOSED SESSION AND RECONVENE OPEN SESSION

14. Announcement of Closed Session

The Board did not meet in Closed Session.

15. Motion to disclose or not disclose the information discussed in Closed Session

The Board did not meet in Closed Session.

**ADJOURN** – Chair Eaken adjourned the meeting at 7:16pm.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.

Christine Silva  
Board Secretary

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code



Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call 415.554.5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call 415.554.5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: <https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf>.

The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax: 415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the website: <https://sfethics.org/>.

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on an agenda, please email the Board at [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com). Please know that the Board appreciates receiving such communication not later than 5pm the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.

### **KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at [sotf@sfgov.org](mailto:sotf@sfgov.org).

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at <https://sfgov.org/sunshine/>.