SFMTA

West Portal Station Safety and Community Space Improvements



June 4, 2024 SFMTA Board Informational Item

West Portal Station history



Twin Peaks Tunnel Opening, 1918

West Portal Station today



About 5,000 people get on a bus or train at West Portal Station on an average weekday (April 2024)



West Portal station area traffic safety considerations



- Minimize frequency of pedestrian and vehicle conflicts
- At a busy, multi-modal intersection like West Portal Avenue and Ulloa Street, drivers are affected by stressors like vehicles behind them resulting in a sense of urgency and, at times, more aggressive driving.
- Intersection is large and unusually shaped, requiring longer pedestrian crossing distances.



Project goals

- **Provide more dedicated** and protected pedestrian space for community objectives.
- **Improve intersection safety** by clearly defining pedestrian, vehicle, and transit movements; and removing vehicle traffic from train tracks.



Original project proposal: calm the intersection through turn restrictions and transit lanes



*Diagram is conceptual and subject to refinement as design is advanced

Project proposal: Relocate SFMTA Operations parking at West Portal Station to create a new welcoming entrance

Visually enhance station entrance, provide more room for pedestrians to access the station, help direct pedestrians to the best path of travel to platforms



One of two draft conceptual horseshoe designs

SAM A.C.

PUBLIC

Outreach overview

- Stakeholder meetings
- Three pop-ups in neighborhood
- Online and paper survey

 Over 4,000 responses
- Website
- Blog
- Subscriber updates and Emails

 Over 800 emails received
- Translation/interpretation provided in Spanish and Chinese
- 15+ media stories drove additional interest

Stakeholder meetings held

- West Portal Merchants
- Greater West Portal
 Neighborhood Association
- West Portal Elementary School
- Self-Help for the Elderly
- SFMTA CAC
- SFMTA Multimodal Accessibility Advisory Committee
- Walk SF
- KidSafeSF
- San Francisco Bicycle Coalition
- SF Transit Riders
- Senior Disability Action

What we heard...and how we're responding

- Broad agreement on importance of improving traffic safety; diverging opinions on connection between proposals and recent crash
- Community members want
 - To have focused discussions to get the details right
 - To have a public forum to share feedback directly with stakeholders
- Project implementation, if approved by SFMTA Board, is best coordinated with return of rail service on L Taraval

- Re-articulate safety principles guiding proposals: minimize frequency of pedestrian/vehicle conflicts, decrease pedestrian crossing distance.
 - In response



- Welcoming West Portal Committee has been created
- Public hearing to be held at SFMTA Board meeting
- Traffic circulation changes would be implemented at same time as L Taraval rail



What we heard: design feedback 1) Opportunities for additional safety and traffic calming measures

- Ulloa Street eastbound towards West Portal Avenue
- Ulloa/Wawona streets intersection
- Vicente Street/West Portal Avenue intersection
- Five-corner Vicente/Madrona/ Wawona intersection
- 14th Avenue/West Portal Avenue intersection
- 15th Avenue/West Portal Avenue intersection
- Claremont Boulevard/Portola Avenue
- Crossing Taraval Street
- Dewey Circle
- Traffic calming on streets that may see increase in traffic due to diversions



What we heard: design feedback 2) Turn restrictions could make accessing businesses difficult, cause more traffic on other streets, or create confusion for people driving

- Suggestion of a traffic light instead
- Westbound Ulloa Street at Claremont Boulevard restriction
 - Access to Ulloa/Claremont parking lot
 - Food delivery driver access to northside Ulloa businesses
 - Access to west side 100 block of West Portal Avenue
 - Diverting more traffic to Vicente Street
- Eastbound Ulloa Street no through traffic restriction
 - Diverting more traffic to Vicente Street, Wawona Street, Madrone Way
- Northbound left turn at West Portal Avenue restriction
 - Diverting more traffic to Vicente Street, Wawona Street, Madrone Way
- One-Way Lenox Way
 - Concern about impact to school traffic circulation
 - Concern about speeding downhill
 - Concern about getting stuck if Muni rail vehicles need to pull out of subway due to a subway incident



What we heard: design feedback 3) Bus stops and terminal space on Ulloa Street pose challenges for businesses

- "Wall of buses"
- Crowded narrow sidewalk
- People waiting for the bus sit at restaurant table/chairs
- Trash
- Loss of evening customer parking
- Suggestion to have buses stop in horseshoe instead



What We Heard - Other

- Don't make any traffic circulation changes
- Do more to decrease car traffic near station
- Double-parking is a problem on West Portal Avenue
- Cars need to be able to use center lanes to pass double-parked vehicles
- Physical protection for people walking, waiting for transit
- Dislike of survey design
- Do not encourage people to gather in horseshoe
- Anything installed in horseshoe needs to be well-maintained
- Desire for more traffic enforcement







What We Heard – Level of Support for Project Proposal



Overall Proposal Support by Relationship to West Portal



What We Heard – Level of Support for Project Proposal





Welcoming West Portal Committee

11-member committee selected by Supervisor Melgar and West Portal Merchants

Meeting 1: Wednesday, May 15, 5:30-7:30pm Meeting 2: Monday, May 20, 5:30-7:30pm Meeting 3: Monday June 3, 5:30-7:30pm

[Additional slides to be presented that reflect a summary of Meeting 3 discussion]



Proposal building blocks

Common to all options

Options

Option-specific traffic calming and other improvements



Proposal building blocks

Common to all options

- Building on Committee and Community feedback, proposes a series of intersection safety improvements along Ulloa Street and Vicente Street corridors that signal to drivers to slow down approaching West Portal Avenue
- Explore additional traffic calming on Lenox Way

Options

Option-specific traffic calming and other improvements

Proposed improvements common to all options



Proposed improvements that still require SFFD review

- West Portal Avenue/Ulloa Street/Lenox Way: Create a protected pedestrian space at entrance to station
- Ulloa Street/Forrest Side Avenue, Ulloa Street/Madrone Avenue, Ulloa/Wawona streets, Ulloa Street/Claremont Boulevard, Portola Drive/Santa Clara Avenue: Decrease the size of the intersection, slow down traffic and improve the visibility of people walking with Painted Safety Zones
- Ulloa/Wawona streets: Consider pedestrian crossing beacon to improve visibility and yielding to pedestrians*
- Vicente Street/Wawona Street/Madrone Avenue: Restore prior painted safety zones and install concrete islands to further calm traffic and enhance safety (already planned)
- Vicente Street/West Portal Avenue: Consider left turn restriction(s) for one or more movement
- Lenox Way Explore additional traffic calming, add kissand-ride, explore Transit Operations protocol to mitigate potential for blockage

*Project delivery would need to occur after the initial improvements to allow for time for detailed design and construction

Proposal building blocks

Common to all Options

Building on Committee discussion at Meeting #2, proposes a series of intersection safety improvements along Ulloa and Vicente corridors that signal to drivers to slow down approaching West Portal
Explore additional traffic calming on Lenox

Options

1a Original proposal
1b Original with reduced transit lanes
2 Ulloa transit mall
3a Fewer vehicle restrictions
3b Fewest vehicle restrictions

Option-specific traffic calming and other improvements



Options overview





Qualitative comparison of options

Option	# of Vehicle restrictions	WP station area w/ fewer conflicts	Transit performance co-benefits	Increase in traffic on other streets
1a – Original proposal	5 (1,2,3,4,5)	+++	+++	++
1b – Original w/ reduced transit lanes	5 (1,2,3,4,5)	+++	++	++
2 – Ulloa transit mall	5 (1,2,4,5,6)	+++	+	++
3a – Fewer vehicle restrictions	3 (1,4,5)	++	+	+
3b – Fewest vehicle restrictions	2 (1,5)	+	+	





Option 1a – Original proposal



*Diagram is conceptual and subject to refinement as design is advanced

Safety:

 Significantly decreases private vehicle-pedestrian conflicts at West Portal Avenue/Ulloa Street intersection

Transit:

- Protects transit from vehicle traffic with transit lanes
- Significantly decreases transitprivate vehicle conflicts at West Portal/Ulloa

Community feedback:

Key areas of concern include: bus stops on Ulloa Street east of West Portal Avenue and decreased vehicular access



Option 1b – Original with reduced transit Janes



*Diagram is conceptual and subject to refinement as design is advanced

Safety:

 Significantly decreases private vehicle-pedestrian conflicts at West Portal Avenue/Ulloa Street intersection

Transit:

• Significantly decreases transitprivate vehicle conflicts at West Portal Avenue/Ulloa Street

Community feedback:

Responds to feedback suggesting shorter transit lanes given project's focus on safety (vs. transit speed and reliability)



Option 2 - Ulloa transit mall



*Diagram is conceptual and subject to refinement as design is advanced

Safety:

 Significantly decreases private vehiclepedestrian conflicts on Ulloa Street between West Portal Avenue and Wawona Street

Transit:

- Decreases transit-private vehicle conflicts on Ulloa Street between West Portal Avenue and Wawona Street
- Re-located 48 Quintara-24th
 Street bus stop could contribute to transit delays when pedestrians transfer diagonally across the tracks

Community feedback:

Responds to feedback requesting: 1)
Re-locating bus stops on Ulloa Street east of West Portal Avenue; 2)
Retaining westbound left turns on Ulloa Street from Claremont
Boulevard and westbound left to West
Portal Avenue; 3) Additional changes to calm traffic on Ulloa Street

Option 3a – Fewer vehicle restrictions



*Diagram is conceptual and subject to refinement as design is advanced

Safety:

 Decreases some private vehiclepedestrian conflicts at West Portal Avenue/Ulloa Street intersection

Transit:

Decreases some transit-private
 vehicle conflicts at West Portal
 Avenue/Ulloa Street

Community feedback:

Responds to feedback requesting:
1) No additional bus stop/terminal space on Ulloa Street east of West
Portal Avenue; 2) Retaining westbound vehicular access on
Ulloa Street from Claremont
Boulevard and westbound left to
West Portal Avenue; 3) Retaining
vehicular access for Ulloa
Street eastbound through movements



Option 3b – Fewest vehicle restrictions



*Diagram is conceptual and subject to refinement as design is advanced

Safety:

 Smaller decrease in private vehiclepedestrian conflicts at West Portal Avenue/Ulloa Street intersection

Transit:

Smaller decreases in transit-private
 vehicle conflicts at West Portal
 Avenue/Ulloa Street

Community feedback:

Responds to feedback requesting:
1) No additional bus stop/terminal space on Ulloa Street east of West
Portal Avenue; 2) Retaining westbound vehicular access on Ulloa Street from Claremont
Boulevard and westbound left to
West Portal Avenue; 3) Retaining
vehicular access for Ulloa
Street eastbound through
movements; 4) Retaining
westbound vehicular access for
Ulloa Street westbound through
movements

Proposal building blocks

Option-specific traffic calming and other	3b Fewest vehicle restrictions • Treatments like speed humps and speed tables on residential streets (Wawona Street) where traffic may re-distribute to
Options	 1a. Original proposal 1b. Original with reduced transit lanes 2 Ulloa transit mall 3a Fewer vehicle restrictions
Common to all Options	 Building on Committee discussion at Meeting #2, proposes a series of intersection safety improvements along Ulloa and Vicente corridors that signal to drivers to slow down approaching West Portal Explore additional traffic calming on Lenox



Option-specific traffic calming and other improvements (draft)



Proposed Vertical Speed Control Elements (Options 1a and 1b only)

Proposed Vertical Speed Control Elements (Options 1a, 1b, and 2 only)

Proposed Removal 57-Parkmerced Stop (Options 2, 3a, 3b)

Proposed Intersection Improvements (All Options)

Consider Additional Lenox Traffic Calming (All Options)

Existing Vertical Speed Control Element

*Vertical Speed Control elements refer to traffic calming treatments like speed bumps, speed humps, speed cushions, etc.

*Proposed improvements that still require SFFD review and input from residents on streets where traffic calming devices are proposed



Existing traffic volumes

Traffic Count Locations



Daily traffic and speeds



M

Peak hour turning movement

Daily Traffic Volumes ¹	Roadway Segments
7,000 to 10,000	Claremont Blvd (both segments)
4,000 to 7,000	 Taraval St Vicente St Ulloa St between Wawona and West Portal
2,000 to 4,000	Ulloa St between Forest Side and WawonaUlloa St between West Portal and Claremont
~2,000	Wawona St between Ulloa and Vicente
~1,000	 Ulloa St between Claremont and Dorchester Wawona St between Taraval and Ulloa Lenox Way

Notes:

1. Preliminary traffic counts from Spring 2024, these counts are still being calibrated to local conditions.

SFMTA

Turning movement restrictions under consideration

Red indicates movements that would be prohibited in the option, green includes movements that would still be allowed



Turning movement counts from Spring 2024



Traffic redistribution principles

- Options 1 and 2 would reduce the number of places to cross West Portal Avenue from four to three locations. Claremont Boulevard or Wawona Street, Madrone Avenue, Forest Side Avenue are also available to reach Taraval Street and traffic circle.
- For this preliminary analysis, we assumed that 50% of people driving across West Portal Avenue at Ulloa Street would shift to Vicente Street. Remaining would shift to 14th Avenue, 15th Avenue, Taraval Street, or other routes.
- Focus first on the effects of Vicente and Wawona Streets for this preliminary analysis.





- The combination of the redistribution could result in 200 peak hour trips shifting to Vicente and Wawona streets, or 3 to 4 additional vehicles per minute
- Trips would be distributed between other routes to cross West Portal Avenue (14th Avenue, 15th Avenue, Claremont Boulevard and Taraval Street)
- Changes would be lower on other roadways given that Vicente Street is the closest and most likely to see vehicles shift



Percent Changes to Key Roadways (Preliminary Redistribution)

Daily Traffic Volumes	Roadway Segments	Scenario 1a – Original Proposal	Scenario 2 – Ulloa Transit Mall
4,000 to 7,000	Vicente Street	20-30%	25-35%
~2,000	Wawona Street between Ulloa and Vicente streets	50-60%	65-75%

Qualitative comparison of options

Option	# of Vehicle restrictions	WP station area w/ fewer conflicts	Transit performance co-benefits	Increase in traffic on other streets
1a – Original proposal	5 (1,2,3,4,5)	+++	+++	++
1b– Original w/ reduced transit lanes	5 (1,2,3,4,5)	+++	++	++
2– Ulloa Street transit mall	5 (1,2,4,5,6)	+++	+	++
3a – Fewer vehicle restrictions	3 (1,4,5)	++	+	+
3b – Fewest vehicle restrictions	2 (1,5)	+	+	





Summary of Committee Meeting #3 discussion

- Majority liked Options 3a and 3b the most
 - 3b 5 committee members liked most
 - 3a -4 committee members liked most
 - 1a 1 committee member liked most
 - 1b/2 no committee member liked most
- Option 2
 - Ranked #3 by 5 committee members
 - Ranked #2 and #5 by 1 committee member each
- Strong support of safety improvements common to all options.
- Desire for more safety improvements at Ulloa/Wawona streets and along Ulloa Street.
- Concern with increased traffic on other streets with Options 1 and 2



Station Area Place-Making and Beautification

Graphic Inspiration



HISTORIC WEST PORTAL TUNNEL

MUNI MAP

LOCAL MUNI LINES


Wayfinding mural concepts

LINES



PORTAL



DOTS











Horseshoe design concept

Graduated pattern

M

SFMTA

PUBLIC WORKS



Horseshoe design concept

Universal pattern

M

SFMTA

PUBLIC WORKS



Horseshoe design concept

Street mural, bikeshare station and planters

GRADUATED PATTERN



UNIVERSAL PATTERN





PERSPECTIVE VIEW GRADUATED PATTERN



PERSPECTIVE VIEW UNIVERSAL PATTERN



Horseshoe design concepts

GRADUATED PATTERN



UNIVERSAL PATTERN





Proposal status and next steps

- Today: Public hearing and receive input from SFMTA Board
- Tentative next steps
 - July 16: SFMTA Board considers approving transportation circulation changes
 - August: begin implementing improvements in horseshoe
 - Fall: launch turn restrictions at same time L-Taraval rail resumes



Discussion questions for SFMTA Board

- 1. Do you think the current design of Ulloa Street from Wawona Street to Claremont Boulevard reflects the values and goals of the SFMTA? Does it reflect our Transit First and Vision Zero goals given all the competing priorities for the street (while we have ambitious city-wide goals, when applied at specific locations they may need to be modified)? Why or why not?
- 2. If no, were any of the designs discussed something you want staff to pursue that would better reflect SFMTA values and goals at this location? Given any changes will come with tradeoffs, are there specific concerns you want staff to mitigate?
- 3. If yes, are there any further refinements you recommend staff bring forward?
- 4. Acknowledging that there are many competing needs, if you had to pick, what would be your priority for use specifically on Ulloa Street between Wawona Street and Claremont Boulevard:
 - Business access
 - East-west private auto travel
 - Pedestrian safety and overall activity
 - Transit operations/reliability
 - Commercial loading/access (e.g. deliveries)
- 5. Is there anything staff did not bring up that you think important to mitigate/prioritize?



Thank you

SFMTA.com/WestPortalProject

WestPortalProject@SFMTA.com

415.646.2410



1-way Lenox Way – additional information

- SFMTA received petition opposing 1-way Lenox Way sent by Lenox Way residents and community members
- Coordinating to try to address main concerns: potential for speeding, concern about blockage by Muni rail
- SFMTA coordinated with SFUSD and have plan in place to maintain school loading needs during West Portal Elementary School construction



Ranking of options by Committee members



Existing Ulloa Street bus stop and terminal space



Proposed Ulloa Street bus stop and terminal space



🕅 SFMTA

Proposed 57 Parkmerced and 91 3rd St/19th Avenue Owl re-routes





What 48 Quintara-24th Street to subway transfer looked like when stop was west of West Portal Avenue in 2019 and the L Taraval rail was in service



