



SAN FRANCISCO  
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY  
CITIZENS' ADVISORY COUNCIL

MINUTES

November 4, 2021

**WATCH:** (link can be found online <https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/citizens-advisory-council-cac-regular-meeting-november-4-2021>)

**PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN:** (415) 915-0757 | Conference ID: 589 180 11#

REGULAR MEETING  
5:30 P.M.

COUNCIL MEMBERS

Michael Chen (Chair), Aaron Leifer (Vice Chair),  
Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Queena Chen, Steve Cornell, John Lisovsky, Obai Rambo, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

COUNCIL LIAISON  
Christine Silva

COUNCIL SECRETARY  
Keka Robinson-Luqman

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect our Council Members, SFMTA staff, and members of the public, the SFMTA Meeting Room (Union Square Conference Room) is closed.

**Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Council in advance of the meeting, please send an email to [CAC@sfmta.com](mailto:CAC@sfmta.com) by 5pm on Wednesday, November 3<sup>rd</sup>, or call (415) 646-2388.**

## ORDER OF BUSINESS

### 1. Call to Order

Chair Chen called the meeting to order at 5:31 p.m.

### 2. Roll Call

CAC members present at Roll Call: Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Obai Rambo, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Susan Vaughan, and Dorris Vincent

CAC members absent at Roll Call: Frank Zepeda

CAC members absent with notification: Queena Chen

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound-producing devices during the meeting.

No announcement was made.

### 4. Approval of Minutes:

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of October 14, 2021:

ADOPTED: AYES –Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Obai Rambo, Karim Salgado, Susan Vaughan, Yensing Sihapanya, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Queena Chen

### 5. Report of the Chair (For discussion only)

Chair Chen reported on the SFMTA vaccination mandate.

No public comment.

### 6. Public Comment:

Hayden Miller stated that there have been a lot of missed trips on the weekend. It would be great if the SFMTA would communicate what runs are being proactively canceled.

Edward Mason stated that there was no taxi zone at Outside Lands. It was converted to a bus stop and caused TNC surge pricing. There should be an investigation on that. He also provided an update on commuter shuttle buses. They are running near empty. At 24<sup>th</sup> and Church, they are not picking up many passengers. They are creating more pollution instead of reducing it.

Evelyn Engel stated that taxi drivers who bought medallions are struggling desperately. She expressed disappointment in the October 5<sup>th</sup> comments that Jeff Tumlin made after the

conclusion of the trial. His lack of understanding is devastating. Taxi drivers are not coming out of Covid in good shape. It is a time of desperation.

Tina Han stated that empty Muni buses are going by every few minutes on California street and they are always pretty much empty. They run really late at night.

#### REGULAR CALENDAR

7. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding findings under new state urgency legislation to allow remote meetings during the COVID-19 emergency; continuing remote meetings for the next 30 days; and directing the Council Secretary to agendize a similar resolution at a council meeting within 30 days. (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

#### CAC MOTION 211104.01

WHEREAS, California Government Code Section 54953(e) empowers local policy bodies to convene by teleconferencing technology during a proclaimed state of emergency under the State Emergency Services Act so long as certain conditions are met; and

WHEREAS, In March 2020, the Governor of the State of California proclaimed a state of emergency in California in connection with the Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic, and that state of emergency remains in effect; and

WHEREAS, On February 25, 2020, the Mayor of the City and County of San Francisco (the City) declared a local emergency, and on March 6, 2020, the City's Health Officer declared a local health emergency and both those declarations also remain in effect; and

WHEREAS, On March 11 and March 23, 2020, the Mayor issued emergency orders suspending select provisions of local law, including sections of the City Charter, that restrict teleconferencing by members of policy bodies; those orders remain in effect, so City law currently allows policy bodies to meet remotely if they comply with restrictions in State law regarding teleconference meetings; and

WHEREAS, On September 16, 2021, the Governor signed AB 361, a bill that amends the Brown Act to allow local policy bodies to continue to meet by teleconferencing during a state of emergency without complying with restrictions in State law that would otherwise apply, provided that the policy bodies make certain findings at least once every 30 days; and

WHEREAS, While federal, state, and local health officials emphasize the critical importance of vaccination and consistent mask-wearing to prevent the spread of COVID-19, the City's Health Officer has issued at least one order (Health Officer Order No. C19-07y, available online at [www.sfdph.org/healthorders](http://www.sfdph.org/healthorders)) and one directive (Health Officer Directive No. 2020-33i, available online at <http://www.sfdph.org/directives>) that continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, such as masking, in certain contexts; and

WHEREAS, The California Department of Industrial Relations Division of Occupational Safety and Health (Cal/OSHA) has promulgated Section 3205 of Title 8 of the California Code of Regulations, which requires most employers in California, including in the City, to train and instruct employees about measures that can decrease the spread of COVID-19, including physical distancing

and other social distancing measures; and

WHEREAS, Without limiting any requirements under applicable federal, state, or local pandemic-related rules, orders, or directives, the City's Department of Public Health, in coordination with the City's Health Officer, has advised that for group gatherings indoors, such as meetings of boards and commissions, people can increase safety and greatly reduce risks to the health and safety of attendees from COVID-19 by maximizing ventilation, wearing well-fitting masks (as required by Health Officer Order No. C19-07), using physical distancing where the vaccination status of attendees is not known, and considering holding the meeting remotely if feasible, especially for long meetings, with any attendees with unknown vaccination status and where ventilation may not be optimal; and

WHEREAS, On July 31, 2020, the Mayor issued an emergency order that, with limited exceptions, prohibited policy bodies other than the Board of Supervisors and its committees from meeting in person under any circumstances, so as to ensure the safety of policy body members, City staff, and the public; and

WHEREAS, The SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council has met remotely during the COVID-19 emergency and can continue to do so in a manner that allows public participation and transparency while minimizing health risks to members, staff, and the public that would be present with in-person meetings while this emergency continues; and

WHEREAS, On September 27, 2021, the SFMTA, under authority delegated by the Planning Department, determined that the AB 361 findings described above are not a "project" under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations Sections 15060(c) and 15378(b); and,

WHEREAS, A copy of the CEQA determination is on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council and is incorporated herein by reference;

WHEREAS, On October 14, 2021, in Recommendation No. 211014-117, the Council adopted the recommended findings allowing it to continue to meet remotely for 30 days; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council finds as follows:

1. As described above, the State of California and the City remain in a state of emergency due to the COVID-19 pandemic. At this meeting, the Council has reconsidered the circumstances of the state of emergency.
2. As described above, State and City officials continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, in some settings.
3. As described above, because of the COVID-19 pandemic, conducting meetings of this body and its committees in person would present imminent risks to the safety of attendees, and the state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability of members to meet safely in person; and, be it further

RESOLVED, for at least the next 30 days, meetings of the SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council and its committees will continue to occur exclusively by teleconferencing technology (and not by any in-person meetings or any other meetings with public access to the places where any policy body member is present for the meeting). Such meetings of the Council and its committees that occur by teleconferencing technology will provide an opportunity for members of the public to address this body and its committees and will otherwise occur in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of parties and the members of the public attending the meeting via teleconferencing; and, be it further

RESOLVED, That the Council Secretary is directed to place a resolution substantially similar to this resolution on the agenda of a future meeting of The SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council within the next 30 days. If the Council does not meet within the next 30 days, the Council Secretary is directed to place such a resolution on the agenda of the next meeting of the Council.

Members of the public expressing support: David Pilpel

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES –Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Obai Rambo, Karim Salgado, Susan Vaughan, Yensing Sihapanya, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda  
ABSENT – Queena Chen

8. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding Muni 2022 Service Plan. (Sean Kennedy, Manager, Transit Planning. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Sean Kennedy, Manager, Transit Planning presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Kathy Setian stated that it is not okay to just restore the J Church at night. There are disabled people who ride during the day. She spoke in favor of the restoration of the line.

Karen Kennard asked whether staff plans to recommend an option to the Board at the December 7<sup>th</sup> meeting and, if so, which option. She asked why the SFMTA is working so hard to avoid option two.

Anastasia stated that option two works and would not strain the system.

Hayden Miller offered suggestions for route planning. The 27 Bryant line should be restored to the previous route.

Edward Mason spoke in favor of option two. He recommended giving the option a try and collecting data on it.

David Pilpel stated that there is too much service in the early morning and late evenings and not enough in the middle of the day. He appreciates the commitment to continued public outreach.

Anonymous said the planners have their priorities wrong. Frequency is not the point. Access to the lines is important.

9. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the Engineering, Maintenance, and Safety Committee (EMSC) report and recommendations.

Council member Frank Zepeda, Chair, EMSC, presented the item.

No public comment.

10. Council Member Information and Agenda Item Requests. (For discussion only)

None.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel offered suggestions on how to title the service planning item on the November 18<sup>th</sup> AOCSC agenda.

Kathy Setian expressed hope that going forward, the SFMTA will include the community in their decisions.

ADJOURN- The meeting was adjourned at 8:29 p.m.

Submitted by:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'KAR Luqman', written over a horizontal line.

Keka Robinson-Luqman  
SFMTA CAC – Secretary