



# San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Citizens' Advisory Council

---

**MINUTES** • Meeting Date: March 3, 2022

## **REGULAR MEETING**

5:30 pm

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect our Council Members, SFMTA staff, and members of the public, the SFMTA Meeting Room (Union Square Conference Room) is closed.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Council in advance of the meeting, please send an email to [CAC@sfmta.com](mailto:CAC@sfmta.com) by 5 p.m. the day before the meeting, or call (415) 646-2388.

## **REMOTE MEETING ACCESS**

WATCH: (link can be found online <https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/citizens-advisory-council-cac-regular-meeting-march-3-2022>)

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: (415) 915-0757 | Conference ID: 761 115 52#

## **SFMTA CITIZENS' ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS**

Michael Chen, Chair  
Aaron Leifer, Vice-Chair  
Chris Arvin  
Sascha Bittner  
Queena Chen  
Steve Cornell  
John Lisovsky  
Obai Rambo  
Karim Salgado  
Yensing Sihapanya  
Connor Skelly  
Susan Vaughan  
Dorris Vincent  
Frank Zepeda

## **COUNCIL LIAISON**

Christine Silva

## **COUNCIL SECRETARY**

Keka Robinson-Luqman



## ORDER OF BUSINESS

### 1. Call to Order

Chair Chen called the meeting to order at 5:36 p.m.

### 2. Roll Call

CAC members present at Roll Call: Michael Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

CAC members absent at Roll Call: Sascha Bittner Obai Rambo

CAC members absent with notification: Chris Arvin, Queena Chen, and Connor Skelly

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound-producing devices during the meeting.

No announcement was made.

### 4. Approval of Minutes:

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of February 3, 2022:

ADOPTED: AYES – Michael Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Queena Chen Obai Rambo, and Connor Skelly

### 5. Report of the Chair (For discussion only)

Chair Chen reported that there will be a special CAC meeting on March 17<sup>th</sup>.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT:

Edward Mason stated that it was difficult to hear Chair Chen and Council member Zepeda.

David Pilpel asked if he missed the approval of the minutes. He stated that he had non-substantive edits to the minutes.

### 6. Public Comment



Edward Mason recommended that the J Church and 22 Fillmore line platform north of Church Street be restored. He also discussed casino buses impeding the flow of traffic on Geary Boulevard and 9<sup>th</sup> Avenue.

Hayden Miller stated that he talked to several operators and was told that the SFMTA is continuing to cancel certain bus runs, but it is not reflected in the posted schedule. This is an issue when students are trying to get to school. He requested that the schedule reflect the actual service that is being delivered.

Anastasia celebrated the return of the J Church. She stated that the platform north of Market Street is splintering and caving in. The platform needs to be restored.

Paulann Sternberg stated that she is a disabled senior and doesn't understand why the J Church stops were removed. She requested that they be restored.

## **REGULAR CALENDAR**

7. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding findings under new state urgency legislation to allow remote meetings during the COVID-19 emergency; continuing remote meetings for the next 30 days; and directing the Council Secretary to agendize a similar resolution at a council meeting within 30 days. (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

No public comment.

### **CAC MOTION 220303.01**

WHEREAS, California Government Code Section 54953(e) empowers local policy bodies to convene by teleconferencing technology during a proclaimed state of emergency under the State Emergency Services Act so long as certain conditions are met; and

WHEREAS, In March 2020, the Governor of the State of California proclaimed a state of emergency in California in connection with the Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic, and that state of emergency remains in effect; and

WHEREAS, On February 25, 2020, the Mayor of the City and County of San Francisco (the City) declared a local emergency, and on March 6, 2020, the City's Health Officer declared a local health emergency and both those declarations also remain in effect; and

WHEREAS, On March 11 and March 23, 2020, the Mayor issued emergency orders suspending select provisions of local law, including sections of the City Charter, that restrict teleconferencing by members of policy bodies; those orders remain in effect, so City law



currently allows policy bodies to meet remotely if they comply with restrictions in State law regarding teleconference meetings; and

WHEREAS, On September 16, 2021, the Governor signed AB 361, a bill that amends the Brown Act to allow local policy bodies to continue to meet by teleconferencing during a state of emergency without complying with restrictions in State law that would otherwise apply, provided that the policy bodies make certain findings at least once every 30 days; and

WHEREAS, While federal, State, and local health officials emphasize the critical importance of vaccination and consistent mask-wearing to prevent the spread of COVID-19, the City's Health Officer has issued at least one order (Health Officer Order No. C19-07y, available online at [www.sfdph.org/healthorders](http://www.sfdph.org/healthorders)) and one directive (Health Officer Directive No. 2020-33i, available online at <http://www.sfdph.org/directives>) that continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, such as masking, in certain contexts; and

WHEREAS, The California Department of Industrial Relations Division of Occupational Safety and Health (Cal/OSHA) has promulgated Section 3205 of Title 8 of the California Code of Regulations, which requires most employers in California, including in the City, to train and instruct employees about measures that can decrease the spread of COVID-19, including physical distancing and other social distancing measures; and

WHEREAS, Without limiting any requirements under applicable federal, state, or local pandemic-related rules, orders, or directives, the City's Department of Public Health, in coordination with the City's Health Officer, has advised that for group gatherings indoors, such as meetings of boards and commissions, people can increase safety and greatly reduce risks to the health and safety of attendees from COVID-19 by maximizing ventilation, wearing well-fitting masks (as required by Health Officer Order No. C19-07), using physical distancing where the vaccination status of attendees is not known, and considering holding the meeting remotely if feasible, especially for long meetings, with any attendees with unknown vaccination status and where ventilation may not be optimal; and

WHEREAS, On July 31, 2020, the Mayor issued an emergency order that, with limited exceptions, prohibited policy bodies other than the Board of Supervisors and its committees from meeting in person under any circumstances, so as to ensure the safety of policy body members, City staff, and the public; and

WHEREAS, The SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council has met remotely during the COVID-19 emergency and can continue to do so in a manner that allows public participation and transparency while minimizing health risks to members, staff, and the public that would be present with in-person meetings while this emergency continues; and



WHEREAS, On September 27, 2021, the SFMTA, under authority delegated by the Planning Department, determined that the AB 361 findings described above are not a “project” under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations Sections 15060(c) and 15378(b); and,

WHEREAS, A copy of the CEQA determination is on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council and is incorporated herein by reference;

WHEREAS, On October 14, 2021, in Recommendation No. 211014-117, the Council adopted the recommended findings allowing it to continue to meet remotely for 30 days; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council finds as follows:

1. As described above, the State of California and the City remain in a state of emergency due to the COVID-19 pandemic. At this meeting, the Council has reconsidered the circumstances of the state of emergency.
2. As described above, State and City officials continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, in some settings.
3. As described above, because of the COVID-19 pandemic, conducting meetings of this body and its committees in person would present imminent risks to the safety of attendees, and the state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability of members to meet safely in person; and, be it further

RESOLVED, for at least the next 30 days, meetings of the SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council and its committees will continue to occur exclusively by teleconferencing technology (and not by any in-person meetings or any other meetings with public access to the places where any policy body member is present for the meeting). Such meetings of the Council and its committees that occur by teleconferencing technology will provide an opportunity for members of the public to address this body and its committees and will otherwise occur in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of parties and the members of the public attending the meeting via teleconferencing; and, be it further

RESOLVED, That the Council Secretary is directed to place a resolution substantially similar to this resolution on the agenda of a future meeting of The SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council within the next 30 days. If the Council does not meet within the next 30 days, the Council Secretary is directed to place such a resolution on the agenda of the next meeting of the Council.



On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES –Michael Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Queena Chen, Obai Rambo, and Connor Skelly

8. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the SFMTA FY 2023 & 2024 Consolidated Budget and 2023-2027 Capital Improvement Program. (Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer, Finance & Information Technology. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Bonnie Jean Von Krogh, Manager, Public Affairs presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Hayden Miller spoke in favor of free Muni for youth. He suggested free fares on days that parking meters are free. It is not equitable to raise fares on riders when Sunday and evening meters are not being implemented.

Jaime Vilorio spoke about budget survey outreach. He suggested trying harder to get ahold of people in the Tenderloin so their voices can be heard.

Edward Mason stated that there should be a clipper card analysis by zip code. Commuter buses should be charged a franchise fee for operating in the city, similar to how the SFMTA charges taxi cabs for medallions.

9. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the Engineering, Maintenance, and Safety Committee (EMSC) report and recommendations.

Vice-Chair Leifer offered a brief report on the EMSC meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Edward Mason stated that the state of good repair presentation at the EMSC meeting was informative. He suggested that technical and engineering expertise should be included within the state of good repair and not just finance.



10. Council Member Information and Agenda Item Requests. (For discussion only)

Sue Vaughan asked who is responsible for making sure bus stops are clearly marked along construction zones.

**ADJOURN-** The meeting was adjourned at 7:53 p.m.

Submitted by:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'KAR Luqman'.

Keka Robinson-Luqman  
SFMTA CAC – Secretary