



SAN FRANCISCO
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY
CITIZENS' ADVISORY COUNCIL

MINUTES

July 9, 2020

WATCH: (link can be found online at <https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/citizens-advisory-council-cac-special-meeting-july-9-2020>)

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: (415) 646-2800 | Conference ID: 681238

SPECIAL MEETING
5:30 P.M.

COUNCIL MEMBERS

Daniel Weaver (Chair), Frank Zepeda (Vice Chair), Neil Ballard,
Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Steve Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Christopher Man,
Daniel Murphy, Karim Salgado, Susan Vaughan, and Dorris Vincent

COUNCIL LIAISON
Roberta Boomer

COUNCIL SECRETARY
Keka Robinson-Luqman

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect our Council Members, SFMTA staff, and members of the public, the SFMTA Meeting Room (Union Square Conference Room) is closed.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Council in advance of the meeting, please send an email to CAC@sfmta.com by 5pm on Wednesday, July 8th or call (415) 646-2388.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to Order

Chair Weaver called the meeting to order at 5:31 p.m.

2. Roll Call

CAC members present at Roll Call: Neil Ballard, Michael Chen, Queena Chen,
Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Christopher Man,
Daniel Murphy, Karim Salgado, Susan Vaughan Dorris
Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

CAC members absent at Roll Call: Stephen Cornell and Daniel Weaver

3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting.

There was no announcement.

4. Approval of Minutes:

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel expressed support for the minutes.

On motion to approve the minutes of June 4, 2020:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron
Leifer, John Lisovsky, Christopher Man, Daniel Murphy, Karim
Salgado, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank
Zepeda

5. Report of the Chair (For discussion only)

Chair Weaver reported that the CAC has gotten itself together in a very excellent way with not only crafting but passing motions. The CAC is closer than he's ever seen it as far as working together. He congratulated the CAC for helping members of the public in understanding how to ask questions and get results from the SFMTA. It's an excellent achievement.

Vice Chair Zepeda stated that he looks forward to keeping the good work going within the CAC.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that he thinks that Chair Daniel Weaver and Vice Chair Frank Zepeda have done a great job steering the CAC ship in choppy waters. When the Council makes recommendations to the SFMTA Board, it would be helpful if the public was able to see them. Having more exposure to the formal recommendations of the CAC at the SFMTA Board meetings would be a lasting tribute to the work of the CAC.

6. Public Comment:

David Pilpel stated that there was a recent passing of note. Art Curtis, who worked his way up from an Operator to Chief Inspector and spent about 20 years in that role recently passed away at age 80. He knew every inch of the system. That's a huge loss. He's not the only one but there have been a lot of people who have worked in the agency for generations. Mr. Pilpel stated that he just wanted to take a moment to mention Art.

Edward Mason gave an update on the private commuter shuttle buses during the pandemic. He stated that there has been a gradual increase in the number of empty buses. One of the consequences of the pandemic has been to reverse the stated benefits of having the commuter buses instead of people driving their individual vehicles. The empty buses seem to be creating more pollution. The bottom line is, these buses are completely empty. He has not observed any standees.

REGULAR CALENDAR

7. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the election of the CAC Chair and Vice Chair.

CAC Secretary Robinson-Luqman opened the floor for nominations for the position of Chair.

Member Lisovsky nominated Member Ballard for Chair of the CAC. There were no additional nominations, so nominations were closed.

No public comment.

On motion to elect Neil Ballard as Chair:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Christopher Man, Daniel Murphy, Karim Salgado, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

Chair Ballard opened the floor for nominations for the position of Vice Chair.

Chair Ballard nominated Frank Zepeda for Vice Chair of the CAC. There were no additional nominations, so Chair Ballard closed nominations.

On motion to elect Frank Zepeda as Vice Chair:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Christopher Man, Daniel Murphy, Karim Salgado, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

8. Presentation and discussion regarding the restructuring of CAC Committees.

Chair Ballard led the discussion. He stated that the Engineering, Maintenance, and Safety Committee (EMSC) will now meet every other month (starting in February each year) on the fourth Wednesday of the month at 1 p.m.

He also stated that there will no longer be an Operations and Customer Service Committee (OCSC) or a Finance and Administration Committee (FAC). Instead, the two committees will merge to form the Administration, Operations, and Customer Service Committee (AOCSC) Which will meet every other month on opposite months of the EMSC starting in March each year. The meeting day and time will be the third Thursday of every other month at 4 p.m.

Chair Ballard appointed Aaron Leifer the Chair of the newly formed AOCSC. Frank Zepeda will remain the Chair of the EMSC.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that he has no problem trying something new. The budget is best discussed by the full CAC rather than a committee. He suggested that the next time the CAC reviews and restructures committees that they consider creating a Muni operations committee, an SFMTA Capital Projects committee, and a Parking and Traffic committee. He encouraged the CAC to think about the three committees he suggested that track closely to the organizational structure.

Edward Mason suggested several committees including a governance and audit committee, a policy and advisory committee, and a technical advisory committee for vehicle procurement. It's extremely important that the public is involved in the vehicle procurement and technical specification developments.

9. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding SFMTA Sanitation Policies. (Robert Lim, Project Manager. No explanatory documents.)

Robert Lim, Project Manager, presented the item. He stated that normally, he is a traffic engineer. However, for the past three months he has been working on this as a special assignment during the pandemic. Pre-Covid, the SFMTA had three types of cleaning. There was general cleaning, detailed cleaning, and a mobile relief unit.

General cleaning consists of mopping, wiping down, and disinfecting the Operator's general area as well as windows, stairs, seats, and other hard surfaces. This process took about 15 minutes per coach and was usually done between 8 p.m. and 7 a.m. Detailed cleaning was done every 30-60 days per coach and consisted of wiping down and disinfecting the entire coach from ceiling to floor using a pressure washer. The mobile relief unit were vans throughout the City that could respond to incidents on the bus such as spills, so that the bus wouldn't need to be pulled out of service.

Once the Shelter in Place Order was issued, the SFMTA instituted new cleaning protocols in accordance with the latest CDC and DPH guidelines in facilities as well as vehicles. In facilities, general cleanings, which include vacuuming, sweeping, and wiping down high-touch surfaces

have been increased. Janitorial services that usually work in the subways have been assigned to open facilities to help with the increased general cleanings. In anticipation of the reopening of the subways, the SFMTA is taking the opportunity to pressure clean the walls and other areas in the subways, which has not been done in about five years.

As for Muni vehicles, a supplemental afternoon cleaning service has been added to the regular cleaning schedule. This service is being staffed by Disaster Service Workers and takes place from 12 p.m. to 4 p.m. It takes place at three of the Muni yards and the staffing ranges from about eight people at Islais Creek to about 17 people at Woods Division, as most buses are being pulled in and out of Woods Division. It's a seven day a week service. Since Operator swaps have been suspended, this service ensures that every Operator gets a fresh coach.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Hayden Miller stated that the SFMTA needs to show the ridership that the buses are being cleaned. In San Rafael in the middle of the route, someone got on the bus and cleaned the bus. Every bus shelter in this city has some sort of defect. The bus shelters are in disrepair across the city. Clear Channel doesn't follow up with the complaints at 311 because they are not a City agency.

Eric Rozell agreed with previous concerns about bus shelters and cleaning from Clear Channel. He was particularly concerned about cleaning policies and procedures in the Tenderloin. He asked what the policy and procedures are when Clear Channel arrives at a shelter for cleaning and the shelter is occupied by drug users or homeless people using the shelter. Living in the Tenderloin in a building with a view of a bus shelter, he's regularly witnessed Clear Channel drop by and see the bus shelter occupied and then drive off while leaving the shelter uncleaned. Mr. Rozell stated that he recognizes the sensitivity of the situation, but it appears that after dropping by they often will not return to the bus shelter for several days and sometimes longer to clean it. It's particularly concerning since the shelter is located near a senior center where seniors and disabled people frequently use it.

10. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding transit service changes. (Sean Kennedy, Transit Planning Manager. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Sean Kennedy, Transit Planning Manager, discussed upcoming Muni service changes including the current Muni core service network and the proposed rail service plan.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Edward Mason asked how many trains will be in the subway per hour under the proposed plan and will the SFMTA be mixing Bredas with Siemens cars. Regarding social distancing, the Valley Transportation Authority (VTA) has plastic chains and signs that block off seats. He inquired if the truncated J-Church plan is just a temporary fix to speed along service during the pandemic or will this be something that continues after that.

Hayden Miller stated that he is in favor of the rail plan and service increases, but he is concerned about social distancing. Agencies like Golden Gate Transit and VTA have blocked off the seats. It helps customers spread out and helps Operators realize when they are at their

capacity. The SFMTA passenger capacity limits are way too high. He urged the SFMTA to lower the capacity limits and to block off seats.

Leuwam Tesfai stated that essential workers are providing healthcare, food, and other services so that everyone else can stay home and be comfortable. LatinX and Black workers have the highest rates of employment in these jobs and, as a result, face greater risk of exposure to Covid-19. She spoke in favor of reinstating lines like the 21 Hayes and increasing service to reduce crowding on lines like the T Third, and the 14R Mission to improve services to historically Black and LatinX neighborhoods. She also suggested giving out free face coverings to people who are on the buses who may not have them. Clear Channel should be paying the City to clean the stops.

David Pilpel stated that when rail service returns, Muni should coordinate for shared BART stations on Saturdays and Sundays so that BART can open the stations at 6am and Muni can avoid early morning metro bus substitutions. He stated that a complete draft Level Four Service map would be helpful. The proposed transfers at Church and West Portal Stations create unnecessary health risks and should not be pursued but if they are implemented, they will need close monitoring. Continuing to not operate most routes is not equitable or fair to the public, all of whom are residents and taxpayers. The SFMTA should restore all routes at minimum service levels to maximize mobility. Even with the new cleaning requirements, there are enough vehicles and Operators to do that.

Scott Lawrie stated that the cutting of bus lines is of great concern and the ability to provide safe transport to essential workers and underserved communities should be a high priority. He urged the SFMTA to reconsider the proposed service cuts.

CAC MOTION 200709.01

Whereas the J-Church and the K-Ingleside are crucial lines that serves historic commercial corridors, and whereas passengers of the K-Ingleside streetcar currently board and alight on outdated boarding islands that cannot accommodate two-car boarding of modern Light Rail Vehicles and in order to ensure the optimal capacity of the newly interlined L-K streetcar line, the SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA institute bus shuttle substitutes for the K-Ingleside and J-Church until rail service returns and to expedite its planned project to lengthen the streetcar boarding islands of Ocean Avenue.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Queena Chen, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Christopher Man, Daniel Murphy, Karim Salgado, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Michael Chen

ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Dorris Vincent, and Daniel Weaver

CAC MOTION 200709.02

The SFMTA CAC recommends bike lanes and/or slow streets where transit service has been lost; transit lanes throughout the full duration of the MTA budget crisis; 3-car N-Judah trains; and robust public outreach, particularly on rail vehicles themselves, to discern riders' reaction to the rail changes, and if supported, to make those changes permanent.

Members of the public expressing support: Hayden Miller
Members of the public expressing opposition: David Pilpel

On motion to approve:

FAILED ADOPTION: AYES – Neil Ballard, Michael Chen, John Lisovsky, Daniel Murphy
NAYES – Queena Chen, Aaron Leifer, Christopher Man, Karim Salgado, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda,
ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Dorris Vincent, and Daniel Weaver

CAC MOTION 200709.03

The SFMTA CAC supports the planned rail service restoration with the caveat that the agency provides a detailed plan to help ensure proper social distancing and cleaning in subways and on trains.

Members of the public expressing both support and opposition: David Pilpel

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Aaron Leifer, Christopher Man, Daniel Murphy, Karim Salgado, and Frank Zepeda
NAYES – John Lisovsky and Susan Vaughan
ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Dorris Vincent, and Daniel Weaver

CAC MOTION 200709.04

The SFMTA CAC endorses the plan to trial realigning the subway lines to encourage greater efficiency and minimize time in the subway. However, if or when passengers must wait more than 10 minutes for a scheduled transfer between streetcar service (J, K-L) and tunnel service (M-T, S), the L-K and J lines should enter the tunnel and terminate at Embarcadero station. This will improve rider experience, operational stability, and service consistency.

Members of the public expressing opposition: David Pilpel and Hayden Miller

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Aaron Leifer, Christopher Man, Daniel Murphy, Karim Salgado, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – John Lisovsky and Susan Vaughan

ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Dorris Vincent, and Daniel Weaver

11. Council Member Information and Agenda Item Requests. (For discussion only)

Sue Vaughan asked what Clear Channel is doing to clean the bus shelters during the pandemic.

John Lisovsky asked what amount of money it takes and the impacts it would have on service to only clean buses at the yards and not the terminals.

Sue Vaughan requested a presentation on SFMTA efforts to secure Federal, State, and Metropolitan Transportation Commission operating funds for the duration of the pandemic

Sue Vaughan requested a presentation on SFMTA plans for permanent reductions in service in the event that operating funds are not secured.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel suggested that future CAC presenters talk about their items both in general and considering the current virus situation.

ADJOURN- The meeting was adjourned at 9:24 p.m.

Submitted by:



Keka Robinson-Luqman
SFMTA CAC – Secretary

Next regular meeting: Thursday, August 6th at 5:30pm | Online via Skype