

THIS PRINT COVERS CALENDAR ITEM NO.: 12

**SAN FRANCISCO
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY**

DIVISION: Transit

BRIEF DESCRIPTION:

Adopting the Muni Service Equity Strategy Report for Fiscal Years 2019 and 2020.

SUMMARY:

- In 2014, the SFMTA Board of Directors adopted a Muni Service Equity Policy requiring the submission of a biennial Service Equity Strategy to assess Muni service performance in select low income and minority neighborhoods, identify major Muni transit related challenges impacting selected neighborhoods, and develop strategies to address those major challenges before the SFMTA's two-year budget request. The first Equity Strategy Report was adopted in 2016. After extensive public engagement and data analysis, the second Equity Strategy Report is presented to the SFMTA Board for adoption. The goal is for route performance in Equity Neighborhoods to meet or exceed the rest of the Muni network as SFMTA continues to implement systemwide enhancements.
- In collaboration with community advocates, SFMTA staff identified eight Service Equity Strategy neighborhoods based on a number of demographic factors including: concentration of households with low-income; concentration of people of color; household density; and vehicle ownership. In addition, SFMTA staff identified and evaluated routes heavily used by seniors and people with disabilities based on feedback from community advocates.
- With the help of a Caltrans planning grant, this year's updated Equity Strategy Report included a much more extensive public engagement component than the original report. Key needs and proposed strategies were identified based on extensive outreach to transit riders and community based organizations, as well as analysis of key performance metrics for each neighborhood and for routes heavily used by seniors and people with disabilities. These proposed strategies were vetted through additional public outreach and finalized for inclusion in the enclosed Equity Strategy Report.

ENCLOSURES:

1. SFMTA Resolution
2. Equity Strategy Report for Fiscal Years 2019 and 2020

APPROVALS:

	DATE
DIRECTOR  _____	<u>3/13/2018</u>
SECRETARY  _____	<u>3/13/2018</u>

ASSIGNED SFMTAB CALENDAR DATE: March 20, 2018

PAGE 2.

PURPOSE

Adopting the Muni Service Equity Strategy Report for Fiscal Years 2019 and 2020.

STRATEGIC PLAN GOALS AND TRANSIT FIRST POLICY PRINCIPLES

This action supports the following SFMTA Strategic Plan Goals and Objectives:

Goal 2: Make transit, walking, bicycling, taxi, ridesharing and carsharing the preferred means of travel

Objective 2.1: Improve customer service and communications

Objective 2.2: Improve transit performance.

Objective 2.3: Increase use of all non-private auto modes.

This action supports the following Transit First Policy Principles:

2. Public transit, including taxis and vanpools, is an economically and environmentally sound alternative to transportation by individual automobiles. Within San Francisco, travel by public transit, by bicycle and on foot must be an attractive alternative to travel by private automobile.
4. Transit priority improvements, such as designated transit lanes and streets and improved signalization, shall be made to expedite the movement of public transit vehicles (including taxis and vanpools) and to improve pedestrian safety.

DESCRIPTION

In 2014, the SFMTA Board of Directors adopted a Muni Service Equity Policy requiring the submission of a biennial Service Equity Strategy to assess Muni service performance in select low income and minority neighborhoods, identify major Muni transit related challenges impacting selected neighborhoods, and develop proposed strategies to address the identified major challenges before the SFMTA's two-year budget request. The policy also directs staff to establish a performance baseline and conduct annual monitoring to track progress. The policy requires staff to present a Service Equity Strategy prior to adoption of the SFMTA's two-year budget and indicate what specific metrics, such as on-time performance, the Service Equity Strategy should evaluate.

Neighborhood Selection

The Service Equity Policy directs SFMTA staff to identify "Service Equity Strategy" neighborhoods based on the percentage of low-income households, private vehicle availability, race/ethnicity demographics, and disability status, and to establish a performance baseline. In collaboration with the Muni Service Equity Strategy working group, whose members represent advocacy and community-based organizations, SFMTA staff identified seven Equity Strategy neighborhoods in 2016: Chinatown, Tenderloin/SoMa, Western Addition, Mission, Bayview, Visitacion Valley, and Excelsior/Outer Mission. For this year's update to the Equity Strategy, SFMTA staff and the Muni Service Equity Strategy working group identified one additional neighborhood, Oceanview/Ingleside, for a total of eight neighborhoods.

PAGE 3.

In addition, while the policy does not require consideration of routes heavily used by seniors and people with disabilities, SFMTA staff chose to include accessibility for seniors and people with disabilities based on feedback from community advocates that participated in the Service Equity Strategy working group.

Rider Feedback, Operator Feedback and Data Analysis

This year's update to the Service Equity Strategy included a much more robust community outreach component than the first Equity Strategy Report. Through extensive engagement with riders and community based organizations, as well as operator focus groups at Muni bus and rail divisions, described further in the Stakeholder Engagement section below, SFMTA staff solicited input on key transit needs in Equity Strategy neighborhoods. Rider input was the first step in the process of identifying needs, which SFMTA staff then investigated further through data analysis.

Based on the results of community based organization and rider input and SFMTA staff's data analysis, different key needs were identified for each neighborhood. For example, for some neighborhoods, improving travel time on one or more lines was identified as one of the most important needs, while for other neighborhoods improving reliability or addressing crowding appeared to be more pressing.

Key Needs and Recommended Strategies

SFMTA staff identified two to three key needs for each neighborhood and for routes heavily used by seniors and people with disabilities based on feedback received during stakeholder outreach and where data revealed underperformance relative to peer lines. SFMTA staff were not looking to develop strategies that could address every single challenge to transit performance in the neighborhoods, but rather to focus on a few actionable strategies that could be implemented quickly and are expected to make a significant difference in the reliability and quality of service. In some cases, we identified larger needs that exceed current budget availability and have been noted these as priorities for future implementation when funding is available.

In many cases, identified needs were already addressed through work the SFMTA has underway, particularly by Muni Forward implementation, the previous Equity Strategy's recommendations, and SFMTA's overhaul of the entire Muni bus and rail fleet. These strategies were documented throughout this process. In other cases, our outreach process and data analysis were able to uncover needs and responsive proposed strategies that were not captured through existing investments, indicating the complementary way these efforts have identified transit service improvements.

After an initial round of outreach to riders, transit operators, and community based organizations, together with data analysis, to surface key needs, SFMTA staff shared draft recommended solutions with community members to solicit input and vet the proposed strategies before finalizing them. In a second round of community outreach, SFMTA received community feedback that helped to validate many of the recommendations, but also led to some changes and additions that improved the effectiveness of the recommendations in addressing key needs.

PAGE 4.

Below are the key needs and new potential strategies for each neighborhood. More detail on each proposed strategy, as well as work underway, is provided in the Service Equity Strategy Report, included as an enclosure.

Key Capital Needs and New Proposed Strategies

Neighborhood / Target	Route	Project Description
Ocean View-Ingleside	K Ingleside and M Ocean View	Explore solutions to train congestion at West Portal
Western Addition	5/5R Fulton	Implement Muni Forward improvements on Fulton from Arguello to 25th Avenue
Accessibility, Chinatown, Excelsior-Outer Mission, Visitacion Valley	8/8AX/8BX Bayshore	Explore transit reliability improvements in Visitacion Valley and on 3 rd Street in SoMa Explore adding NextMuni to more stops
Chinatown, Inner Mission, SoMa-Tenderloin	12 Folsom	Explore transit-only lanes on Folsom Street in SoMa to improve reliability
Accessibility, Excelsior-Outer Mission, Inner Mission, SoMa-Tenderloin	14/14R Mission	Explore transit reliability improvements on downtown Mission and in the Excelsior Explore adding NextMuni to more stops
Accessibility, Chinatown	30 Stockton and 45 Union Stockton	Explore travel time and reliability improvements in SoMa (e.g. 3 rd Street)
Accessibility, SoMa-Tenderloin, Western Addition	31 Balboa	Explore opportunities for quick and effective travel time improvements throughout the line

Key Service Needs and New Proposed Strategies

Neighborhood / Target	Route	Project Description
Ocean View-Ingleside	K Ingleside	Increase service frequency
Ocean View-Ingleside	M Ocean View	Increase service frequency
Bayview, Visitacion Valley	T Third	Increase service frequency
Western Addition	7 Haight-Noriega	Switch to 60' buses 7 days per week
Chinatown, Excelsior-Outer Mission, Visitacion Valley	8/8AX/8BX Bayshore	Increase service frequency
Inner Mission, Visitacion Valley	9/9R San Bruno	Switch to 60' buses on the 9 Rapid
Chinatown	10 Townsend	Focus on active line management to address gaps in service in peak periods
Chinatown, Inner	12 Folsom	Increase service frequency

Mission, SoMa-Tenderloin		Vet a more direct route to 24th Street BART Station
Bayview	23 Monterey	Exploring possibility of running on Industrial and Palou instead of deviating to Produce Market pending further outreach
Excelsior-Outer Mission, Ocean View-Ingleside	29 Sunset	Increase service frequency all-day
Chinatown	30 Stockton	Switch to 60' buses for all trips
Bayview	44 O'Shaughnessy	Increase service frequency all-day
SoMa-Tenderloin	47 Van Ness	Explore possibility of routing adjustments in SoMa
Inner Mission	48 Quintara-24 th St	Extend service to the Beach in midday
Visitacion Valley	56 Rutland	Implement schedule enhancements to improve reliability

TITLE VI ANALYSIS

Federal Transit Administration’s (FTA) Circular 4702.1B, "Title VI and Title VI-Dependent Guidelines" provides guidance to transit agencies serving large urbanized areas and requires that these agencies "shall evaluate significant system-wide service changes and proposed improvements at the planning and programming stages to determine whether these changes have a discriminatory impact." (Circular 4702.1B, Chapter IV-10) The FTA requires that transit providers evaluate the effects of service changes that qualify as major service changes under the SFMTA’s approved definition on low-income populations in addition to Title VI-protected categories (race, color and national origin). In addition, upon completion of the service equity analysis, SFMTA is required to submit the equity analysis to the SFMTA Board of Directors for its consideration, awareness and approval of the analysis and provide a copy of the board resolution to the FTA as documentation.

Approval of the Service Equity Strategy Report does not require a Title VI Service Equity Analysis. However, some individual service and route changes discussed in this Report may require a Title VI analysis prior to SFMTA Board approval to implement the proposed service or route change. For these service or route changes, following additional outreach, SFMTA staff will conduct any required Title VI analysis and submit a Title VI report for approval by the SFMTA Board.

STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT

During the first Equity Strategy process in 2016, we relied primarily on the Equity Working Group for stakeholder input. For the 2018 update to the Equity Strategy, we secured a Caltrans planning grant to fund community-based outreach to seek further input on key needs across all Equity Strategy neighborhoods. While this level of outreach is not explicitly required by the policy, it presented an opportunity to further vet how well our data analysis is revealing key needs. This extensive outreach process formed the backbone of this update to the Equity Strategy.

In summary, our approach to stakeholder engagement included the following major pieces:

- Summer and fall 2017: Pre-outreach to key Equity Neighborhood stakeholders about transit

PAGE 6.

challenges for their constituents, including stakeholder interviews with community groups. Outreach during this first phase of work included presentations to groups in the Bayview and Chinatown, among others, and attendance at community events such as Sunday Streets and student backpack giveaway events. This phase also included a text-message based rider survey that received over 1,100 responses.

- Round 1 outreach in December and January 2018: Direct outreach to community-based organizations and surveys targeting riders in Equity Strategy Neighborhoods as well as seniors, people with disabilities and youth to identify their top issues regarding transit service, receiving over 3,000 responses. This round also included focus groups with Muni operators who live and work in Equity Neighborhoods. Based on this feedback, SFMTA reviewed transit performance data for these routes and identified two to three key needs and responsive proposed strategies per neighborhood that could be addressed in the next one to two years. Through a Facebook ad campaign targeting Equity Strategy Neighborhoods, we reached over 33,600 people in English, 15,600 in Spanish, and 6,000 in Chinese to increase awareness of the Equity Strategy and encourage people to take the rider survey.
- Round 2 outreach in February 2018: Community workshops were held to share and vet these responsive proposed strategies and ensure they meet the needs of riders. With this final round of outreach, SFMTA refined the proposed strategies before finalizing them for inclusion in the next two year operating and capital budgets.

SFMTA staff presented the Equity Strategy to the Operations & Customer Service Committee of the Citizens' Advisory Council (CAC) on November 7, 2017 for initial feedback on our outreach approach. We will present the final recommendations to the CAC on March 22, 2018. We presented to the Multimodal Accessibility Advisory Committee on January 18, 2018.

Going forward, we will build on the relationships with community-based organizations developed during this outreach process to continue gathering input on an ongoing basis that will help further inform our service and capital planning processes. This will complement our continued data analysis of route performance in Equity Strategy neighborhoods and on lines that are heavily used by seniors and people with disabilities.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

For each key need, a range of alternatives were considered. Given the Equity Strategy's emphasis on improvements that can be implemented within one to two years, however, the SFMTA ultimately narrowed its recommendations to those that could be implemented within the current two-year budget cycle.

Moving forward, SFMTA staff will focus on further integrating Equity Strategy outreach and data analysis approaches into our day-to-day planning. Rather than conducting a separate planning process, Equity Strategy principles will be brought fully into the Muni Forward capital and service planning process, with an emphasis on maintaining ongoing relationships with community based organizations in Equity Strategy neighborhoods and seeking continuous feedback from riders on Equity Strategy routes. Individual transit capital projects and major service changes will be evaluated for consistency with Equity Strategy goals. SFMTA staff will outline this new approach as part of the next Equity Strategy update process, which begins after the adoption of this year's report.

PAGE 7.

FUNDING IMPACT

Costs for proposed new capital expenditures have not yet been finalized. These expenditures will be integrated into the five-year Capital Improvement Program and the SFMTA's two-year capital budget for FY2019 and FY2020.

While the service-related proposed strategies are expected to add costs on certain lines, they will be offset by efficiency investments such as travel time savings from Muni Forward and the identification and elimination of unproductive routes or route segments. All service changes are cost-neutral.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

On February 23, 2018, the SFMTA, under authority delegated by the Planning Department, determined that adoption of the Muni Service Equity Strategy Report for Fiscal Years 2019 and 2020 is not defined as a "project" under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations Sections 15060(c) and 15378(b).

A copy of the CEQA determination is on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Board of Directors and is incorporated herein by reference.

OTHER APPROVALS RECEIVED OR STILL REQUIRED

The City Attorney's Office has reviewed this calendar item.

RECOMMENDATION

SFMTA staff recommend that the SFMTA Board adopt the Muni Service Equity Strategy Report for Fiscal Years 2019 and 2020.

SAN FRANCISCO
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY
BOARD OF DIRECTORS

RESOLUTION No. _____

WHEREAS, In 2014, the SFMTA Board of Directors adopted the Muni Service Equity Policy requiring the submission of a biennial Service Equity Strategy to assess Muni service performance in select low income and minority neighborhoods, identify major Muni transit related challenges impacting selected neighborhoods, and develop proposed strategies to address the identified major challenges before the SFMTA's two-year budget request; and,

WHEREAS, SFMTA staff have prepared the second Service Equity Strategy Report for the FY2019 and FY2020 prior to adoption of the SFMTA's two-year budget; and,

WHEREAS, In collaboration with the Muni Service Equity Strategy working group, SFMTA staff identified eight Equity Strategy neighborhoods based on the percentage of low income households, private vehicle availability, race/ethnicity demographics, and disability status, and to establish a performance baseline; and,

WHEREAS, In addition, while the policy does not require consideration of routes heavily used by seniors and persons with disabilities, SFMTA staff chose to include accessibility for seniors and persons with disabilities based on feedback from community advocates that participated in the Muni Service Equity Strategy working group; and,

WHEREAS, With support from a Caltrans planning grant, the SFMTA conducted extensive outreach to transit riders and community based organizations in Equity Strategy Neighborhoods, as well as Muni operators, to identify key transit challenges; and,

WHEREAS, SFMTA staff identified two to three key needs and proposed strategies for each of the neighborhoods and for routes heavily used by seniors and people with disabilities based on data analysis of these performance metrics; and,

WHEREAS, SFMTA vetted these key proposed strategies through an additional round of public workshops and stakeholder outreach to ensure they meet the needs of transit riders in Equity Strategy neighborhoods; and,

WHEREAS, Approval of the Service Equity Strategy Report does not require a Title VI Service Equity Analysis at this time, and,

WHEREAS, Some individual service and route changes that are discussed in this Report may require a Title VI analysis prior to SFMTA Board approval to implement the proposed service or route change, and for these service or route changes, following additional outreach, SFMTA staff will conduct any required Title VI analysis and submit a Title VI report for approval by the SFMTA Board; and,

PAGE 9.

WHEREAS, On February 23, 2018, the SFMTA, under authority delegated by the Planning Department, determined that adoption of the Muni Service Equity Strategy Report for Fiscal Years 2019 and 2020 is not defined as a “project” under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations Sections 15060(c) and 15378(b); and,

WHEREAS, A copy of the CEQA determination is on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Board of Directors, and is incorporated herein by reference; and,

WHEREAS, To document the Equity Strategy process, findings and recommendations, SFMTA staff prepared a Service Equity Strategy Report; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors adopts the Muni Equity Strategy Report for Fiscal Years 2019 and 2020.

I certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors at its meeting of March 20, 2018.

Secretary to the Board of Directors
San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency