

# SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY **BOARD OF DIRECTORS AND** PARKING AUTHORITY COMMISSION AND **RECREATION AND PARK COMMISSION**

# **MINUTES**

Thursday, June 10, 2021

### SPECIAL MEETING 1 P.M.

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect our Board Members, SFMTA staff, and members of the public, the Board's Meeting Room (Room 400) is closed.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Board in advance of the meeting, please send an email to MTABoard@sfmta.com by 5pm on Wednesday, June 9 or call (415) 646-4470. Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.

SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS Gwyneth Borden, Chair Amanda Eaken, Vice Chair Cheryl Brinkman Steve Heminger **Fiona Hinze** Sharon Lai Manny Yekutiel

RECREATION AND PARK COMMISSION Mark Buell, President Eric McDonnell, Vice President Kat Anderson Joe Hallisy Annie Jupiter-Jones Allan Low Larry Mazzola, Jr.

Jeffrey Tumlin DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION

> Christine Silva SECRETARY

San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency

1 South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor

San Francisco, CA 94103

SFMTA.com

#### ORDER OF BUSINESS

#### 1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order by Recreation and Park Commission Vice President Eric McDonnell at 1:01 pm.

#### 2. Roll Call

Present:

SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS	RECREATION AND PARK COMMISSION
Gwyneth Borden	Eric McDonnell
Amanda Eaken	Kat Anderson
Cheryl Brinkman	Joe Hallisy
Steve Heminger	Annie Jupiter-Jones
Fiona Hinze	Allan Low
Sharon Lai	Larry Mazzola, Jr.
Manny Yekutiel	

Absent: Mark Buell – with notification

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS BEFORE THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR ACTION AS STATED BY THE SFMTA DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION OR CITY ATTORNEY WHERE APPLICABLE. EXPLANATORY DOCUMENTS FOR ALL CALENDAR ITEMS ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. 7<sup>th</sup> FLOOR.

#### **REGULAR CALENDAR**

3. Information and discussion regarding staff update and community input on the current use of the Great Highway; and regarding the development of a possible pilot project of up to two years to close all or part of the Great Highway south of Lincoln Way to vehicle traffic, subject to environmental review and approval by the Board of Supervisors (Explanatory documents include a staff report and slide presentation.)

Phil Ginsburg, General Manager, Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation, Stacy Bradley, Deputy Director of Planning, Sarah Jones, SFMTA Planning Director, and Timothy Doherty, Transportation Planner, presented the item.

## PUBLIC COMMENT:

Nicole Bohn, Director of the San Francisco Mayor's Office on Disability, expressed appreciation for the attention given to thinking about people with disabilities should the pilot move forward.

Luke Bornheimer urged the Board and Commission to support the Great Highway and a pilot for a fourlane promenade seven days a week.

Stephanie Teal compared parks and traffic in San Francisco and shared that the City needs the highway to be reopened instead of having another park.

Steve Gorski expressed concern for motorized bikes and scooters, discrimination, and traffic.

Peter Belden appreciated the hearing and urged the Board and Commission to keep the space open.

Howard Ludick observed people enjoying the recreation experience and expressed support for closing all four lanes.

Andy expressed opposition to the highway closure and questioned data collection by the SFMTA.

Anonymous thanked the Board and Commission for the data collection and thoughtful approach to the project.

Adam Jamon expressed support for keeping the Great Highway a great walkway and support for the pilot program.

Brian Adler urged the Board and Commission to reopen all four lanes of the highway and expressed concern over dangerous traffic on side streets.

Aleta Dupree advocated for a car-free Great Highway so that people can enjoy it.

Zack Lipton expressed support for a car-free Great Highway seven days a week.

Chris expressed opposition to the bias in the presentation and data collection and suggested bringing on an independent third party if the pilot proceeds.

Richard Rothman expressed concern regarding traffic on Chain of Lakes Drive and encouraged all users to share the roadway.

Jodie Medeiros expressed support for a two-year 24/7 pilot program, sharing that any hybrid would be complicated, confusing, and more expensive.

Charlie Kirkham expressed concern for alternate traffic routes and shared that the study is flawed.

Barry Taranto expressed concern regarding the closure impact on traffic and ability for taxis to serve people, urging compromise.

Erin Davis expressed support for the pilot program and keeping the Great Highway open for those walking and on bikes.

John Elliot thanked staff for their work and expressed support for the pilot program.

Patricia Eric expressed opposition to a pilot study, urging that the highway be opened to cars during the week and open for recreation on the weekends.

Jason Ford expressed support for keeping the highway closed to cars and reflected on the happiness and joy felt when using the space.

Jean Barish urged the Board and Commission to fully reopen the Great Highway until a thorough environmental review has been conducted.

Claudia Benitatos expressed support for a car-free Great Highway.

Judy Gorski expressed traffic concerns and suggested that the study be done while the Great Highway is open to traffic.

Marcia Rand urged the Board and Commission to approve the pilot and keep the Great Highway kidsafe and car-free.

Catherine Mathison shared negative implications of a closed Great Highway and suggested compromise.

Cliff Barger appreciated the work done by staff and urged the Board and Commission pursue the option to close all four lanes.

Melissa advocated for keeping the Great Highway open to pedestrians 24/7 and shared her experience of shopping at nearby small businesses.

Michael Coppin expressed support to reopen the Great Highway and is opposed to any closure, sharing that recreation users have other options.

Kristen Leckie expressed support for permanent 24/7 closure of the Great Highway.

Kay Lenonial shared transportation policies from the General Plan and urged the Board and Commission to consider the Great Highways as an incredible resource.

Anonymous shared her experience of walking the Great Highway and urged the Board and Commission to keep the road closed.

Anonymous expressed support for keeping Great Highway closed to cars and shared her experience of having a safe space to bike.

Carol Brownson shared her experience of using a scooter on the Great Highway and expressed appreciation and support for the closure.

Anonymous supported reopening all four lanes of the highway and shared that recreational users have no lack of open space in the City.

Amy Tanner expressed support for keeping Great Highway closed to cars, sympathized with traffic concerns, but was hopeful that traffic challenges could be worked out.

Jim Maza expressed opposition to the permanent closure of the highway and shared traffic concerns.

Lisa Church thanked staff and expressed support for approval of the pilot project.

Susan Pfeiffer discussed traffic mitigations that were added to the Sunset neighborhood and suggested improvements to Chain of Lakes Drive along with additional trash removal.

Renee expressed opposition to closing all four lanes permanently and shared that there should be an alternative against closing the Great Highway.

Kimberly Johnson expressed support for permanent closure of the Great Highway seven days a week, full-time.

Anonymous expressed support for permanent closure of the highway.

Elliot Schwartz expressed support for keeping the Great Highway car-free 24/7 and shared that we should take the small step of closing the highway.

Anna Leary expressed opposition to the pilot program and shared that there needs to be better data collection.

Robin Kala shared her experience of street closures without notification or alternatives and expressed frustration from driving through the City.

Kristin Tieche expressed support for car-free space on the Great Highway and the pilot project, thanking staff for the presentation.

Dan Cabrera proposed that the highway be car-free at least on weekends and asked the Board and Commission to consider the mental benefits from closure.

Matt Brezina urged the Board and Commission to save the Great Highway for a year-round, four-lane promenade, seven days a week and shared his experience of traveling to the zoo by bike.

Jim Natoli expressed support of closure and keeping Great Highway open to people, also thanking staff for their work.

Luke Sterling expressed support for a car-free Great Highway and shared his observations of people using the space.

Ira Kaplan expressed support for Concept 3 and shared climate change concerns.

Dan Suderman expressed support for a four-lane full promenade and urged the Board and Commission keep the highway open to people not cars.

Anonymous questioned public attendance at the meeting and urged the Board and Commission to open the Great Highway.

Pam strongly opposed any conditional closings and shared that the road needs to remain open to people in vehicles.

Joe Mare shared his experience of using Great Highway everyday and reminded the Board and Commission that this is not a car-first city.

Charles Finley expressed support for a car-free Great Highway and shared concerns about climate change.

Anonymous expressed support for the proposal and shared his experience of biking through the Great Highway.

Jose expressed concern regarding traffic on Chain of Lakes Drive and MLK Drive.

Lauren Frost encouraged the Board and Commission to keep the Great Highway closed to traffic and shared her experience running and biking down the highway.

Arlene Vokin expressed concern about pedestrian and bike counts and questioned whether the proposal was a credible project.

Gary Levenberg hoped that challenges could be resolved and expressed support for the pilot program.

Anonymous expressed traffic and safety concerns, sharing that the highway needs to remain open.

Gina Bartholomew expressed support for a car-free Great Highway and shared her experience of using the highway.

Martin Munoz shared about the urgency of climate change and urged the Board and Commission to continue the pilot for two additional years.

Steven Hill expressed concern about Lincoln Way becoming a highway and encouraged compromise.

Anonymous discussed impact on tourism and expressed concern for essential workers that use the highway.

Mara Lewis expressed concern for elderly users not being able to access the beach and encouraged the Board and Commission to study the full impact of closure.

Elena expressed support for a four-lane promenade pilot program and shared her experience as a cyclist accessing the space.

Paulina Sawyer expressed support to open Great Highway for those that drive, sharing that the goal of a more livable city doesn't exclude motorists.

Steven Markle discussed fuel efficiency for travelers using the Great Highway and shared that the closure undermines Vision Zero.

Neil Market expressed support for the pilot and keeping the Great Highway closed to cars and reminded everyone to share the space.

Richie Rosaro expressed support for year-round closure indicating that anything less is unjust and shared his experience using the space this past year.

Scott Bauer urged the Board and Commission to keep the Great Highway closed to cars 24/7 and discussed benefits of using the highway.

Ignacio expressed concern related to cars using 46<sup>th</sup> Avenue as an alternate route.

Dave Alexander thanked staff, the Board and Commission and expressed support for a full promenade on the Great Highway.

Jay Bing shared that re-routing and using Chain of Lakes Drive has resulted in only a few minutes delay and expressed support for the pilot program.

Will Holland shared his experience visiting the Great Highway and expressed support to close the highway to cars.

Julia Eroa expressed support for the pilot and appreciates the current traffic mitigations and would want them expanded further east through the neighborhood.

Mike Knorr shared that traffic observations and urged the SFMTA to open up Slow Streets to encourage traffic movement.

Kristen shared that now is the time make big sweeping changes and expressed support for closure of the Great Highway.

Christina expressed concern regarding traffic, the environment and carbon damage, sharing that we should not close the Great Highway until we have more information.

Cynthia Kauffman expressed opposition to keeping the Great Highway closed and shared traffic concerns, explaining that traffic mitigations are not needed if we open the highway.

Sheila Stewart shared that the roadway is an essential road for north south travel, expressed concern for data collection and urged the Board and Commission to delay data collection.

Kelly Summon expressed support for a car-free Great Highway with a four-lane promenade, sharing that the closure has been transformative.

Anonymous shared traffic concerns when travelling between Lake Merced and the Marina District and expressed opposition to continued closure of the highway.

Olga Gervel expressed support for the pilot study and support for keeping all four lanes open to pedestrians.

Anonymous expressed opposition for continued closure of the Great Highway and shared that he finds the District 4 Mobility Study and presentation flawed.

Sarah Joy expressed support for the pilot project and keeping the road as a promenade 24/7, sharing appreciation for the safety felt while using the space.

Sarah Bars shared a limerick supporting the pilot project.

Anne Green expressed opposition to the pilot project and believed there needs to be more work done.

Jeff questioned the District 4 Mobility Study and is supportive of careful, unbiased planning.

Ben expressed support for the pilot study and a four-lane promenade.

Vicky Ansley was in favor of reopening the Great Highway, sharing that this is now a problem in search of a solution.

Mary expressed opposition to the project, sharing that keeping the road closed is ruining the neighborhoring areas of the Sunset and Richmond Districts.

Shaheem expressed support for the pilot program and urged the Board and Commission to approve the pilot to keep the Great Highway safe.

Shayla expressed support for 24/7 closure, sharing that she has enjoyed it daily for recreation and transportation.

Ted Vicky thanked staff for their work and expressed support for a four-lane bikeway as it's benefitted mental health.

Monet questioned whether the collected data is skewed and proposed expanding the sidewalk instead of closing all four lanes.

Paula Cat urged the Board and Commission adopt Concept 3 of the pilot and loves walking on the Great Highway.

Susan Malaney advocated for North Lake, Middle Lake and South Lake, sharing that a remodel is needed of Sunset Boulevard so that cars go to Lincoln Way instead of through the park.

Sam Deitch thanked staff for opening the Great Highway to those who don't own a car and believed that the solution is to be able to get around better without cars.

Robin Ham shared that she enjoys the Great Highway weekly, patronizes the nearby small businesses, and urged support for the full pilot.

Albert shared that opening the Great Highway to cars would be detrimental and it is crucial to develop alternative modes of transit.

Michael shared that the current proposal worsens greenhouse gas emissions and contributes to climate change by pushing cars to streets that were not designed to handle the traffic.

Luke Spray expressed support for keeping the Great Highway open to the people and deserves to be a full promenade seven days a week.

Clifford expressed support for leaving the Great Highway open as a promenade and pilot study, sharing that parking is still available for those visiting from other parts of the City.

Raul Maldonado expressed support for the two year closure for the pilot project and thanked staff for the study.

Catherine expressed support for opening the Great Highway immediately and shared that the proposal should be studied once an unbiased study could be conducted.

Anonymous expressed support for reopening all four lanes of the Great Highway, sharing that the Mobility Study data is flawed and biased and closing the highway only reroutes traffic.

Shirley shared safety and traffic concerns explaining that the use of the highway for cars alleviates traffic from residential streets.

Fennel expressed support for 24/7 open access to the Great Highway explaining that we need enjoy this sacred space.

Nancy shared traffic concerns and was in full favor of reopening the Great Highway, proposing consideration of creating a boardwalk on the ocean side of the roadway.

Matthew Sheradon expressed support for opening the Great Highway and questioned outreach for the meeting.

Jim Murphy agrees with those that are urging for the reopening of the Great Highway and proposed putting in a new bike lane along the pathway.

Michael observed that the Great Highway was an efficient north south corridor that is currently missing on the western side of the city.

Brian Vee shared that closure creates a world class amenity for a world class city, also discussing car use subsidy.

Eric Chase expressed support for keeping the Great Highway a car-free promenade that should be preserved and nurtured.

Jasmine expressed opposition to the pilot program and support of reopening the highway explaining that clear, unbiased data is needed before proposing changes.

Adam Brock shared that there is currently no traffic on Sunset Boulevard and expressed capitulation of having the highway opened and closed at different times.

Paula expressed opposition to the pilot but is open to compromise and shared that closure reroutes traffic to other areas.

Catherine Roberts expressed appreciation for finally having a place to bike in San Francisco without worrying, also sharing that we need fewer cars in the City.

Anonymous shared his experience of getting coffee and walking up and down the highway and expressed support for keeping the road closed to cars.

Anonymous expressed support for a four-lane promenade pilot program and encouraged all to think of alternatives for how to move around the City.

Anonymous shared that the Great Highway is an evacuation route for the City and shared that closure is a burden on working class people in the area.

Ryan expressed support for keeping the highway open to bikes, pedestrians and people with a full promenade.

Anonymous expressed opposition to the pilot, requested that the City reopen the Great Highway, and shared observations that the highway is empty unless it's a rare sunny day.

Jerry Nueva expressed support for keeping the Great Highway open to people and closing it to cars and thinks that any compromise would be worse for residents.

Jake McGoldrick shared history about partially closing JFK Drive and suggested a similar compromise for Great Highway to be closed on weekends and holidays.

Anonymous discussed the low usage of Great Highway and shared that the public forum is not reaching those that it needs to reach.

Anonymous shared that community needs need to be balanced and roads should be open most of the time.

Bobeck expressed support to close the Great Highway to cars and open it to people and encouraged we move the City to mass transit, walking, biking while deemphasizing car use.

Emily Houston shared that her small business has benefited from closure of the Great Highway and expressed support for the closure.

Anonymous expressed opposition to the closure of the Great Highway, sharing that disaster and emergency workers depend on the highway to get to work.

Samantha Gurillo expressed support to keep the Great Highway as a park and shared her observation while living on Taraval and Great Highway.

Doug Shultz disagreed with closing down the Great Highway because it's been mismanaged by the City.

Anonymous shared that the highway should be kept open for the people.

Kevin observed the traffic at Chain of Lakes Drive, Lincoln Way and Sloat Boulevard and is open to weekend closure.

Lauren Crabb shared her small business experience indicating that the extra pedestrian foot traffic saved her business.

Anonymous expressed support for reopening the Great Highway to cars, people, and bikes as it was prior to the closure.

Suzanne Armstrong expressed support for the pilot program and keeping the Great Highway open to people and not for cars and shared how incredible it's been to enjoy the space.

Russ shared that it is a matter of life and death, that cyclists cannot coexist with cars.

Chris May expressed opposition to keeping the Great Highway closed to cars and shared his experience with driving and biking in the space.

Rosemary Newton expressed opposition to a pilot program seeing no justification to closing it to cars.

Alicia shared that there is an inherent bias with the data and spoke to the inherent need of cars for some people.

Steve Dillick expressed opposition to the closure of the Great Highway and shared concern of bringing children to school in the fall.

Ariel thanked the Board and Commissioners for today's meeting and expressed support to give the beach space to people not cars.

Alex Star shared experience of using the Great Highway without fear of cars and expressed appreciation to staff, the Board, and the Commission.

Chris May proposed widening walking trail east of the highway.

Catherine Art looked forward to street reopening and urged the Board and Commission to reopen the Great Highway, looking to other ways to expand recreation area.

Eugene Gregor expressed support to pilot closure and permanent closure of the Great Highway and highlighted recent work by SPUR.

Stacy Randecker shared experience of biking across the city and encouraged the City to change we move around the City.

Emily Glick expressed support for the closure of Great Highway to cars and shared that San Francisco has a better chance of meeting Vision Zero with these kinds of projects.

Anonymous discussed the need to share.

Maddy Fox urged the Board and Commission to reopen the Great Highway.

Julia urged the Board and Commission to reopen the Great Highway sharing that closure would adversely affect the quality of life in San Francisco.

Laurie Griffner expressed opposition to closing the Great Highway to cars.

Joshua voiced support for keeping the Great Highway as the Great Walkway.

Anonymous believed that the Great Highway should reopen as the City is starting to reopen.

Anonymous discussed erosion concerns including water table rising and barrier walls.

Anonymous expressed concern with high monthly car usage and the use of the road as an evacuation route.

Brian voiced support for keeping Great Highway open to pedestrians and closed to cars.

4. Adjournment - The meeting was adjourned at 7:21 p.m.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.

Christine Silva Board Secretary

<u>California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31</u>: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption

determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call (415) 554-5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

<u>Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions</u>: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call (415) 554-5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: <a href="https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf">https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf</a>.

The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax: 415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the web site: sfgov.org/ethics.

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on a agenda, please email the Board at <u>MTABoard@sfmta.com</u>. Please know that the Board appreciates receiving such communication not later than Monday, the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.

#### KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at sotf@sfgov.org.

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at sfgov.org.