



SAN FRANCISCO
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY
CITIZENS' ADVISORY COUNCIL

MINUTES

October 14, 2021

WATCH: (link can be found online at <https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/citizens-advisory-council-cac-special-meeting-october-14-2021>)

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: (415) 915-0757 | Conference ID: 589 180 11#

SPECIAL MEETING
5:30 P.M.

COUNCIL MEMBERS

Michael Chen (Chair), Aaron Leifer (Vice Chair),
Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Queena Chen, Steve Cornell, John Lisovsky, Obai Rambo, Karim Salgado, Yensing Sihapanya, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

COUNCIL LIAISON
Christine Silva

COUNCIL SECRETARY
Keka Robinson-Luqman

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect our Council Members, SFMTA staff, and members of the public, the SFMTA Meeting Room (Union Square Conference Room) is closed.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Council in advance of the meeting, please send an email to CAC@sfmta.com by 5pm on Wednesday, October 13th or call (415) 646-2388.

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to Order

Vice Chair Leifer called the meeting to order at 5:35 p.m.

2. Roll Call

CAC members present at Roll Call: Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, and Yensing Sihapanya

CAC members absent at Roll Call: Sue Vaughan

CAC members absent with notification: Stephen Cornell, Obai Rambo, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting.

No announcement was made.

4. Approval of Minutes:

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that he offered edits to Secretary Robinson-Luqman earlier in the week and had no further edits or objections to the minutes.

On motion to approve the minutes of September 2, 2021:

ADOPTED: AYES –Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, and Yensing Sihapanya

ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Obai Rambo, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

5. Report of the Chair (For discussion only)

Vice Chair Leifer reported out on the results of the CAC member survey. He stated that these are the items the CAC membership chose to prioritize for the current term:

- Service Planning in the context of SFMTA financial constraints
- State of Good Repair (Infrastructure/Facilities Needs)
- Budget Priorities and Trade-Offs
- Vision Zero Action Strategy
- Community Outreach
- Equity in Service for Underserved Communities

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel requested that a list of the prioritized topics be listed in the minutes.

6. Public Comment:

Edward Mason provided an update on the commuter shuttle bus program. The buses are basically empty with only one or two passengers.

David Pilpel stated that the impact of get vaccinated or get terminated is coming down to the wire. He is very concerned about the impact that it may have on transit service. He suggested that the CAC monitor the situation.

Anastasia stated that the commuter buses are running through the streets empty. She inquired why the large commuter buses with no passengers are running through the streets polluting and taking up space. She suggested smaller buses.

REGULAR CALENDAR

7. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding findings under new state urgency legislation to allow remote meetings during the COVID-19 emergency; continuing remote meetings for the next 30 days; and directing the Council Secretary to agendize a similar resolution at a council meeting within 30 days. (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

CAC MOTION 211014.01

WHEREAS, California Government Code Section 54953(e) empowers local policy bodies to convene by teleconferencing technology during a proclaimed state of emergency under the State Emergency Services Act so long as certain conditions are met; and

WHEREAS, In March, 2020, the Governor of the State of California proclaimed a state of emergency in California in connection with the Coronavirus Disease 2019 pandemic (COVID-19 emergency), and that state of emergency remains in effect; and

WHEREAS, On February 25, 2020, the Mayor of the City and County of San Francisco (the City) declared a local emergency, and on March 6, 2020 the City's Health Officer declared a local health emergency, and both those declarations also remain in effect; and

WHEREAS, On March 11 and March 23, 2020, the Mayor issued emergency orders suspending select provisions of local law, including sections of the City Charter, that restrict teleconferencing by members of policy bodies; those orders remain in effect, so City law currently allows policy bodies to meet remotely if they comply with restrictions in State law regarding teleconference meetings; and

WHEREAS, On September 16, 2021, the Governor signed AB 361, a bill that amends the Brown Act to allow local policy bodies to continue to meet by teleconferencing during a state of emergency without complying with restrictions in State law that would otherwise apply, provided that the policy bodies make certain findings at least once every 30 days; and

WHEREAS, While federal, State, and local health officials emphasize the critical importance of vaccination and consistent mask-wearing to prevent the spread of COVID-19, the City's Health Officer has issued at least one order (Health Officer Order No. C19-07y, available online at

www.sfdph.org/healthorders) and one directive (Health Officer Directive No. 2020-33i, available online at www.sfdph.org/directives) that continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, such as masking, in certain contexts; and

WHEREAS, The California Department of Industrial Relations Division of Occupational Safety and Health (“Cal/OSHA”) has promulgated Section 3205 of Title 8 of the California Code of Regulations, which requires most employers in California, including in the City, to train and instruct employees about measures that can decrease the spread of COVID-19, including physical distancing and other social distancing measures; and

WHEREAS, Without limiting any requirements under applicable federal, state, or local pandemic-related rules, orders, or directives, the City’s Department of Public Health, in coordination with the City’s Health Officer, has advised that for group gatherings indoors, such as meetings of boards and commissions, people can increase safety and greatly reduce risks to the health and safety of attendees from COVID-19 by maximizing ventilation, wearing well-fitting masks (as required by Health Officer Order No. C19-07), using physical distancing where the vaccination status of attendees is not known, and considering holding the meeting remotely if feasible, especially for long meetings, with any attendees with unknown vaccination status and where ventilation may not be optimal; and

WHEREAS, On July 31, 2020, the Mayor issued an emergency order that, with limited exceptions, prohibited policy bodies other than the Board of Supervisors and its committees from meeting in person under any circumstances, so as to ensure the safety of policy body members, City staff, and the public; and

WHEREAS, the SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council has met remotely during the COVID-19 pandemic and can continue to do so in a manner that allows public participation and transparency while minimizing health risks to members, staff, and the public that would be present with in-person meetings while this emergency continues; and,

WHEREAS, On September 27, 2021, the SFMTA, under authority delegated by the Planning Department, determined that the AB 361 findings described above are not a “project” under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations Sections 15060(c) and 15378(b); and,

WHEREAS, A copy of the CEQA determination is on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council and is incorporated herein by reference; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That the SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council finds as follows:

1. As described above, the State of California and the City remain in a state of emergency due to the COVID-19 pandemic. At this meeting, the SFMTA Citizens’ Advisory Council has considered the circumstances of the state of emergency.
2. As described above, State and City officials continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, in some settings
3. As described above, because of the COVID-19 pandemic, conducting meetings of this body and its committees in person would present imminent risks to the safety of attendees, and the state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability of members to meet safely in person; and, be it

FURTHER RESOLVED, That for at least the next 30 days meetings of the SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council and its committees will continue to occur exclusively by teleconferencing technology (and not by any in-person meetings or any other meetings with public access to the places where any policy body member is present for the meeting). Such meetings of the SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council and its committees that occur by teleconferencing technology will provide an opportunity for members of the public to address this body and its committees and will otherwise occur in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of parties and the members of the public attending the meeting via teleconferencing; and, be it

FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Secretary of the SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council is directed to place a resolution substantially similar to this resolution on the agenda of a future meeting within the next 30 days. If the SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council does not meet within the next 30 days, the Secretary is directed to place such a resolution on the agenda of the next meeting of the SFMTA Citizens' Advisory Council.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel suggested edits to the resolution.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES –Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, Susan Vaughan, and Yensing Sihapanya

ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Obai Rambo, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

8. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding Paratransit. (Jonathan Cheng, Manager, Paratransit. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Jonathan Cheng, Manager, Paratransit presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that certification priority be given to people with temporary disabilities.

9. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding Transportation 2050 & General Obligation Bond. (Tim Manglicmot, Budget Manager; Jerad Weiner, Asset Management Manager; and Charlotte Wu, Principal Budget Analyst. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.

Jerad Weiner, Asset Management Manager presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that he had concerns on proposed programs in the package. He is not aware how the GO Bond, the new revenue source, and the SFCTA sales tax reauthorization measure interact. He is not aware how those three things interact. He is reserving judgment; however, he thinks there should be no new SFMTA revenue without new structural reform with a charter amendment.

10. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding Muni 2022 Service Plan. (Sean Kennedy, Manager, Transit Planning. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Steve Boland, Project Manager presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Kathy Setian stated concerns about the service cut of the J Church line and asked that the SFMTA restore service to the J Church line.

Sue stated that she does not trust that there is a good faith effort to restore service to the J Church line. It was never clear that this was going to be a permanent change. It is not safe to transfer at the Duboce triangle. Would like to see it restored as soon as possible.

Karen Kennard expressed support for restoring the service on the J Church line to downtown.

Anastasia stated that she would love the J Church line to restore its downtown service in the tunnel. The transfer at Market is not equitable.

Edward Mason stated that the pavement at Church and Market streets where the switch is for the F Line is cracked, broken, and disruptive. There is a lot of vehicular traffic. This has been very poorly handled.

Hayden Miller expressed concern about the entire proposal and that some of the routes will never come back if they are eliminated. It's very unlikely that a route will be restored. Once they are gone, then they will most likely be gone for good.

Brenda McConathy expressed concern for the J Church line. It's a real inconvenience for families.

Joshua Rudy Ochoa thanked the SFMTA for having town halls and encouraged the SFMTA to focus on students as well. Restoration of the 29R and the the L bus would be incredible.

Leah Polito voiced support for restoring the J Church service back to downtown.

Michael Shpizner spoke in support of restoring the J Church line to full service.

Elissa Matross stated that the transfer at Church and Market streets puts riders at risk. It's a scary intersection even for able-bodied people. Six minutes saved versus safety is not a good trade off.

Evelyn Posamentier stated that Eureka is not a replacement for the 48 Quintara line.

David Pilpel thanked the transit planning group for the presentation. He stated that all pre-Covid regular transit service should be restored as soon as possible with changes from there. There should be a broader look at routes into next year with a focus on coverage span and frequency.

CAC MOTION 211014.02

The SFMTA CAC urges the SFMTA Board of Directors to restore full service on the 23. Currently, there is no adequate transfer point between people traveling on the 28 or 29 to points east on Monterey Boulevard.

On motion to approve:

FAILED ADOPTION: AYES –Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Aaron Leifer, Karim Salgado, and Susan Vaughan

NAYES – John Lisovsky and Yensing Sihapanya

ABSENT – Stephen Cornell Obai Rambo, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

CAC MOTION 211014.03

The SFMTA CAC supports proposals to extend the 31 Balboa to South of Market. There is currently no service that starts in the Richmond District and travels into South of Market. This would be a great advantage to people who live in the Richmond District and South of Market.

Members of the public expressing support: Hayden Miller and David Pilpel

On motion to approve:

FAILED ADOPTION: AYES –Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Queena Chen, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, and Susan Vaughan

NAYES – Michael Chen and Yensing Sihapanya

ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Obai Rambo, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

CAC MOTION 211014.04

The SFMTA CAC supports extension of the 28 to Fisherman’s Wharf, a busy commercial area that deserves more transit service, including service that serves people on the westside of the city.

Members of the public expressing support: David Pilpel

Members of the public expressing opposition: Hayden Miller and Anastasia

On motion to approve:

FAILED ADOPTION: AYES –Susan Vaughan

NAYES –Chris Arvin, Sascha Bittner, Michael Chen, Queena Chen, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, and Yensing Sihapanya

ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Obai Rambo, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

11. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the Administration, Operations, and Customer Service Committee (AOCSC) report and recommendations.

No report.

12. Council Member Information and Agenda Item Requests. (For discussion only)

Sue Vaughan requested a presentation on alternative funding opportunities.

ADJOURN- The meeting was adjourned at 9:36 p.m.

Submitted by:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'KAR Luqman', written in a cursive style.

Keka Robinson-Luqman
SFMTA CAC – Secretary