



San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors & Parking Authority Commission

MEETING MINUTES • Meeting Date: Tuesday, March 4, 2025

REGULAR MEETING

1:00pm

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
Room 400, City Hall

REMOTE MEETING ACCESS

WATCH: www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE or
<https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/board-directors-meeting-march-4-2025>

SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Janet Tarlov, Chair
Stephanie Cajina, Vice Chair
Mike Chen
Steve Heminger
Dominica Henderson
Fiona Hinze

ACTING DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION

Julie Kirschbaum

BOARD SECRETARY

Christine Silva



ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to Order

Director Tarlov called the meeting to order at 1:07pm.

2. Roll Call

Present: Mike Chen
Dominica Henderson
Fiona Hinze
Janet Tarlov
Stephanie Cajina

Absent (with notification): Steve Heminger

3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting

Board Secretary Silva made the announcement.

4. Approval of Minutes

- February 18, 2025, Regular Meeting

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of the February 18, 2025, Regular Meeting:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chen, Henderson, Hinze, Cajina, and Tarlov
ABSENT – Heminger

5. Communications

None.

6. Director's Report (For discussion only)

- Streets Updates
- Muni Updates
- Valencia Bike Lane Update
- Ongoing Activities & Events



Acting Director Kirschbaum shared an update on the closure of Great Highway, All-Star Weekend and Chinese New Year Parade ridership data, an update to the 30S Stockton bus line, a Valencia construction update, the Hop on Muni Pub Crawl event, and the Safe Driver Awards.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Patricia Vaughey expressed concern about a lack of cooperation with the agency.

Christopher White expressed opposition to reintroducing left turns on Valencia Street, urging the agency to stand firm.

Fiona Yim expressed concern about left turns on Valencia Street, shared about safety, and urged the agency to keep left turn restrictions.

Theirry commented on safety and expressed general opposition.

Griffin Lee expressed concern about the addition of bike lanes and urged the Board to prioritize the budget deficit.

Yolanda Catzalco expressed concern for immigrants and the 14 Mission bus line.

Pete Wilson commented on the 30S Stockton bus line change and expressed concern about transit operator vacation sign-ups.

Bob Feinbaum expressed concern about the agency's mission and asked about Muni service.

Herbert Weiner expressed concern about Muni service and urged the agency to preserve and enhance bus lines.

7. Citizens' Advisory Council Report

None.

8. New or Unfinished Business by Board Members

None.

9. Public Comment



Members of the public may address the SFMTA Board of Directors on matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction and are not on today's calendar.

Thierry expressed opposition to the closure of Great Highway and Waymo.

Joel Kamisher thanked the agency for withdrawing the proposal to eliminate the crossing guards program.

Patricia Vaughey commented about a recent hearing and asked that the HOV lane on Lombard Street hearing be continued for another month.

Megan Rohrer expressed opposition to eliminating the tow subsidies, sharing that it would be devastating to the low-income community and those that rely on their vehicles.

Cheryl Sinclair expressed concern about tow subsidies.

Lisa Platt supported using the reserves to close the budget and expressed concern about cutting Muni service.

Speaker expressed support to fill the \$15M gap with the reserve or a general fund transfer, sharing that cutting service would lead to more congestion and higher parking costs.

Lukas Illa expressed opposition to eliminating tow subsidies and shared about the recent closure of safe parking sites.

Gulal Muse expressed concern about tow fee discounts and urged the Board to protect low-income communities.

Flo Kelly expressed concern about tow discounts and urged the agency to let people park, sharing that it is devastating to get towed.

Armando Martinez shared about living in a RV and expressed opposition to towing and the process.

Anne Stuhldreher expressed concern about eliminating the tow discount and urged the Board to look for other ways to offset costs.

Speaker urged the Board to preserve Muni by preventing budget cuts to service.

Sara Greenwald expressed concern about the environment and urged the Board to consider options that are sensible.



Aidin Jones expressed concern that the proposed cuts to Muni would become permanent and shared that now was the time to use the reserve or a general fund transfer.

Speaker thanked staff for new in-language signs at bus stops and being responsive to taking input.

Speaker expressed concern about housing at 24th and Valencia, towing and losing one's home.

Dahlia Quinn expressed opposition to eliminating towing discounts, sharing that doing so would exacerbate the problem.

Hans Wenger expressed concern about eliminating the tow discount program and shared that there were many other proposals to address budget issues.

Shiba expressed opposition to eliminating the tow discount program and instead urged the agency to use the reserve and increase parking meter charges.

Ian James expressed opposition to eliminating tow discounts, sharing that more vehicles would sit unclaimed and increase expenses for the agency.

Eleana Binder expressed opposition to eliminating or reducing low-income tow subsidies and shared that there was a broader issue with the agency's towing contract and losing money.

Tricia urged the Board to prioritize programs and considering what are the most important things to be safe when money is tight.

Melodie requested that the agency stop taking away parking and doing sweeps and shared about a recent experience of RV vandalism.

Dylan Fabris urged the Board to use the SFMTA reserves to fill the \$15M deficit instead of service or program cuts, sharing that the agency needs to lead with its values.

Oscar expressed interest in hearing about revenue solutions.

Speaker expressed concern about Slow Streets and shared that it was time to reconsider many of them.

Speaker shared that March 18 is Transit Operator Appreciation Day and gave credit to operators for their work.



Jaime Vilorio urged the Board use \$15M from the reserve instead of service or program cuts, urging the agency to do longer outreach for cuts starting next year.

Cyrus Hall expressed support with the tow coalition and crossing guards and encouraged the Board to use reserve funds.

Bob Feinbaum expressed support for using \$ 15M from reserves to cover the short term budget deficit and raised doubts about support for ballot initiatives to increase transit funding.

Pete Wilson thanked staff for the new in-language signage and expressed concern about the operator vacation sign-up.

Maya Chefy urged the Board to not cut service or programs this summer and instead use the reserve or the general fund, sharing that the agency should not break trust with riders now.

Richard Swans urged the Board to reconsider making service cuts to lines and expressed concern for operators being unable to do vacation sign-ups.

Al Ackerman requested fiscal prudence from the Board and was in support of taking on the infrastructure for the Biking and Rolling Plan.

Griffin Lee urged the Board to not rely on the reserves for the \$15M deficit and instead be used for the bigger deficit in 2026.

Sri Vijayaraghavan hoped that the agency would find the right balance for service during the day and evening commutes and would consider extending parking meter hours.

David Joe suggested that the agency should consider cutting the S Shuttle.

Herbert Weiner urged the Board to listen to the public about service and public transportation, also asking about motorists having a seat at the table.

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS BEFORE THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR ACTION AS STATED BY THE SFMTA DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION OR CITY ATTORNEY WHERE APPLICABLE. EXPLANATORY DOCUMENTS FOR ALL CALENDAR ITEMS ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. 7th FLOOR.



CONSENT CALENDAR

10. All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be simple or routine by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and will be acted upon by a single vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Board of Directors or the public so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item.

10.1. Approving two Roadway Shared Spaces street closure applications by local restaurants for Mark Lane between Bush Street and Harlan Place, Tuesday, April 1, 2025, through Tuesday, March 31, 2026, 11 am to 11 pm, daily; and Via Bufano from Columbus Avenue to 75-feet northerly, Sunday, March 23, 2025, through Sunday, March 22, 2026, 4 pm to 11:30 pm, each Tuesday through Thursday; 4 pm to midnight, each Friday; 1 pm to midnight, each Saturday; and 1 pm to 10 pm, each Sunday; and making environmental review findings. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

Speaker requested the item be severed from the consent calendar.

Eddie Tsui presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: Patricia Vaughey

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chen, Henderson, Hinze, Cajina, and Tarlov
ABSENT – Heminger

RESOLUTION No. 250304-013

10.2. Authorizing the Director of Transportation to execute Contract Modification No. 2 to Contract No. 1307, Divide Feeder Circuit Carl 11, with GECMS, Inc., dba Giron Construction, for non-compensable delays to the construction of a new traction power electrical circuit and the installation of new switch equipment along Church St. between Market Street and Duboce Avenue, increasing the Term of the Contract by 1,471 days to the actual substantial completion date of June 11, 2023, and for reduced scope and bid item final quantity adjustments decreasing the Contract Amount by \$25,263.26, bringing the final Contract Amount to \$1,461,496.74. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)



RESOLUTION No. 250304-014

- 10.3. Authorizing the Director of Transportation to execute Contract Modification No. 2 to Contract No. 1314, Replacement of Manual Trolley Switch System Phase 1, with GECMS, Inc., dba Giron Construction, for non-compensable delays to traction power cable work and fiber optic cable connection work, increasing the Contract term by 1,425 days to the actual substantial completion date of March 11, 2024, and for reduced scope and bid item final quantity adjustments decreasing the Contract Amount by \$562,348.58, bringing the final Contract Amount to \$2,607,551.42. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 250304-015

- 10.4. Amending the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) and the Transport Workers' Union (TWU), Local 250A (9163 Transit Operators) to add a sideletter concerning Inconvenience Pay to be effective June 19, 2027. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 250304-016

No public comment.

On motion to approve (Item 10.1 severed):

ADOPTED: AYES – Chen, Henderson, Hinze, Cajina and Tarlov
 ABSENT – Heminger

REGULAR CALENDAR

11. Adopting San Francisco's Biking and Rolling Plan to guide biking and rolling policies, programs, and establishing the North Star network for people using human-powered and low-speed devices in alignment with San Francisco's Transit First policy, Vision Zero policy, Climate Action Plan, and Racial Equity Action Plan; supporting and memorializing the actions and goals of the Community Action Plans; and supporting exploration of Active Transportation Actions. (The Planning Department has found that the project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act [CEQA]. The SFMTA Board action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 31.04(h). Explanatory documents include a plan, staff report, resolution, and slide presentation.)



Maia Small, SFMTA Planning Director, and Christy Osorio, Project Manager, presented the item.

Chair Tarlov shared a series of questions to which staff provided responses:

1. Chair Tarlov asked whether the Board was voting to approve specific bikeway projects and staff responded that the Biking and Rolling Plan does not include specific bikeway projects, nor does it allocate funds for any projects.
2. Chair Tarlov asked if the plan closes any additional streets to cars and staff responded that the plan does not close any additional streets.
3. Chair Tarlov asked if there were any future bike lanes planned on merchant corridors and staff responded that there were no future bike plans specifically for merchant corridors.
4. Chair Tarlov asked that if the Northstar map was fully built out within 20 years, what percentage of streets would be impacted and staff responded that if it were fully built out, it would impact less than 10% of the streets in San Francisco.
5. Chair Tarlov asked if funding from voter-approved propositions B, D, and L could be used for Muni service and staff responded that funds from those propositions could not be used for service and further clarified that the propositions were specifically designated for street safety projects.

Director Cajina requested that staff return in nine months with a draft Slow School Zones plan and in a year with a final plan.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing support: Susan Green, Pedro Conceicao, CJ Burkland, Andrew Nguyen, Kevin Mauer, Jimmy Levi, Caroline Ayers, Adam Bristol, Pooja Muddasani, Charlotte Crawford, Josie Domiguez Chan, Carol Brownson, Susan George, Fiona Yim, Gabriel Brown, Kyle Montville, Lam, Jeff Doleman, Dylan Fabris, Tom Radulovich, Maya Chaffee, Alyssa Cheung, Sri Vijayaraghavan, Cyrus Hall, Cyndi Bakir, Matt Baker, Ryan Patterson, Eric Rozell, Rachel Clyde, Claire Amable, Christopher White, Claire Garvey, Zach Lipton, Speaker, Jaime Vilorio, and Emma

Members of the public expressing opposition: Patricia Vaughey, Bob Feinbaum, Speaker, Griffin Lee, Susan Ford, Tricia, Speaker, Speaker, Linda Ackerman, Speaker, Sarah, Kathleen Gee, Herbert Weiner, and George Wooding

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: Flo Kelly



On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chen, Henderson, Hinze, Cajina, and Tarlov
ABSENT – Heminger

RESOLUTION No. 250304-017

Chair Tarlov recessed the meeting at 6:05pm and reconvened the meeting at 6:23pm.

12. Appointing Julie Kirschbaum to the position of Director of Transportation, effective March 1, 2025, and approving the execution of an employment agreement with Julie Kirschbaum that includes the following key terms: a term ending on March 1, 2030, annual base compensation in the amount of \$425,000 with a retroactive salary adjustment from January 1, 2025, benefits equivalent to specified benefits provided to members of the Executive Management bargaining unit under the 2024-2027 Memorandum of Understanding between the Municipal Executives Association and the SFMTA (MEA MOU) including specified wage increases, and nine months severance pay and compensation for nine months of employee's health care benefits if the Board terminates the employment agreement for convenience, subject to the limitations in Government Code Section 53260. (Explanatory documents include a staff report, agreement, and resolution.)

Chair Tarlov presented the item.

No public comment.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chen, Henderson, Hinze, Cajina, and Tarlov
ABSENT – Heminger

RESOLUTION No. 250304-018

ADJOURN – Chair Tarlov adjourned the meeting at 6:33pm.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Christine Silva', is written over a thin horizontal line.

Christine Silva
Board Secretary



California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call 415.554.5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call 415.554.5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: <https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf>.

The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax: 415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the website: <https://sfethics.org/>.

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on an agenda, please email the Board at MTABoard@sfmta.com. Please know that the Board appreciates receiving such communication by 12pm the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail



to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at sotf@sfgov.org.

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at <https://sfgov.org/sunshine/>.