

**THIS PRINT COVERS CALENDAR ITEM NO.: 12**

**SAN FRANCISCO  
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY**

**DIVISION:** Transit Services

**BRIEF DESCRIPTION:**

Approving traffic modifications to permanently implement transit-only lanes on Church Street, which is included in the Muni Forward Service-Related Capital Improvements and Travel Time Reduction Proposals, and amending Transportation Code, Division II, Section 601 to designate a transit-only lane on Church Street between 16<sup>th</sup> Street and Duboce Avenue in both directions.

**SUMMARY:**

- On March 23, 2013, the SFMTA implemented the Church Street Transit Only Lanes Pilot project to evaluate the effectiveness of various service improvement strategies that were introduced as part of the Agency's larger Muni Forward program.
- The pilot established center-running, dedicated transit-and-taxi-only lanes along three blocks of Church Street, in both directions, between 16<sup>th</sup> Street and Duboce Avenue, as well as left turn restrictions, parking changes, and red paint treatment that has proven effective at reducing transit only lane violations.
- Recently, comprehensive data analysis was conducted that reveals that these transit-only lanes achieved the Muni Forward program's objectives at relatively little cost.

**ENCLOSURES:**

1. SFMTA Board Resolution
2. Church Street Transit Lanes Final Report
3. Transportation Code, Division II Amendment
4. SFMTA Resolution No. 14-041
5. TEP FEIR <http://www.sf-planning.org/index.aspx?page=2970>

**APPROVALS:**

**DATE**

DIRECTOR \_\_\_\_\_ 5/26/15

SECRETARY \_\_\_\_\_ 5/26/15

**ASSIGNED SFMTAB CALENDAR DATE:** June 2, 2015

## **PAGE 2**

### **PURPOSE**

Approving traffic modifications to permanently implement transit-only lanes on Church Street, which are included in the Muni Forward Service-Related Capital Improvements and Travel Time Reduction Proposals, and amending Transportation Code, Division II, Section 601 to designate a transit-only lane on Church Street between 16<sup>th</sup> Street and Duboce Avenue in both directions.

### **GOAL**

This action supports the following SFMTA Strategic Plan Goal and Objectives:

- Goal 1: Create a safer transportation experience for everyone
  - Objective 1.3: Improve the safety of the transportation system.
- Goal 2: Make transit, walking, bicycling, taxi, ridesharing and carsharing the preferred means of travel
  - Objective 2.2: Improve transit performance.
  - Objective 2.3: Increase use of all non-private auto modes.
- Goal 3: Improve the environment and quality of life in San Francisco
  - Objective 3.1: Reduce the Agency's and the transportation system's resource consumption, emissions, waste, and noise.
  - Objective 3.3: Allocate capital resources effectively.

### **DESCRIPTION**

Prior to 2013, the portion of Church Street between 16<sup>th</sup> Street and Duboce Avenue, which is served by Muni's J Church and 22 Fillmore routes, was characterized by high rates of congestion and transit travel time delay. Specifically, congestion along this street segment represented the single highest contributor to delay and unreliability for both routes. Furthermore, the effects on the rider experience were widespread, as it impacted many riders who use and connect to and from the J Church metro station and the 22 Fillmore, which is one of Muni's busiest bus lines systemwide.

To address these issues, the SFMTA launched the Church Street Transit Only Lanes Pilot in 2013 to evaluate the effectiveness of various service improvement strategies that were introduced as part of the Agency's larger Muni Forward program [at that time known as the Transit Effectiveness Project (TEP)]. The pilot established center-running, dedicated transit-and-taxi-only lanes along three blocks of Church Street, in both directions, between 16<sup>th</sup> Street and Duboce Avenue. To protect the integrity of these lanes, the pilot also included left turn restrictions, parking changes, and red paint treatment that has proven effective at reducing transit lane violations in New York City and abroad. Except for a small segment of the northbound 22 Fillmore, both the 22 Fillmore (trolley bus) and the J Church (LRV) operated in the transit only lane, using the existing boarding islands for passenger loading. Due to constraints in the overhead wiring infrastructure, it was necessary for the 22 Fillmore to merge into the curbside mixed-flow lane north of Market Street.

## PAGE 3

Comprehensive data collection and analysis was undertaken to understand the Pilot's impact on transit service, local circulation, driver compliance, and finally, to assess the durability of the red paint treatment. The findings from this analysis suggest that:

1. The dedicated lanes have reduced transit travel times and improved reliability:
  - a. The lanes have largely eliminated congestion-related delay through the corridor, resulting in average travel time savings of up to 14% (1 minute).
  - b. The lanes have largely reduced congestion-related reliability issues through the corridor, resulting in average reductions in travel time variability of up to 27%. This helps keep trains running on schedule, and reduces the bunching and gapping that can lead to overcrowding.
2. These benefits come at minimal additional cost to people in personal vehicles:
  - a. The pilot has not significantly increased delays for drivers through the corridor (~800 drivers per peak hour), except at the northbound approach to Duboce Avenue, where multiple factors have combined to add up to a minute of additional delay.
  - b. The pilot has not reduced parking supply, and has in fact expanded it by truncating commercial loading hours to better meet local merchants' needs.
3. These benefits were achieved cost effectively:
  - a. Implementation costs—material and labor required to restripe and repaint the lanes—were relatively minor (~\$140k total or ~\$280k per mile)
  - b. The red paint treatment has been an effective enforcement strategy
  - c. The red paint treatment has held up well, with the majority of the painted lanes retaining over 90% coverage after 18 months.

As a result of the positive findings of this analysis, SFMTA proposes to make the transit-only lanes permanent, as well as associated traffic modifications. This will allow the improvements to continue providing transit-related benefits on Church Street to maximize these benefits at a minimal cost.

The SFMTA proposes the following:

- A. ESTABLISH – TRANSIT AND TAXI ONLY LANE AT ALL TIMES - Church Street northbound, center lane, from 160 feet south of 16<sup>th</sup> Street to Duboce Avenue; and Church Street southbound, center lane, from 16<sup>th</sup> Street to Duboce Avenue.
- B. ESTABLISH – NO LEFT TURNS EXCEPT TRANSIT AND TAXIS, 7AM TO 7PM, MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY - Church Street, both directions, at 16<sup>th</sup> Street.
- C. ESTABLISH – NO LEFT TURNS, 7AM TO 7PM, MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY - Church Street, both directions, at 15<sup>th</sup> Street.

## ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

The SFMTA considered removing the modifications that were implemented as a part of the Pilot program and reinstating the conditions that existed prior to March 2013. However, due to the data analysis, which indicate a high level of effectiveness and success at reducing travel times and

addressing congestion-related delays, allowing the modifications to remain in-place as permanent  
**PAGE 4**

features of the Muni system appears more optimal. Additionally, elimination of the Pilot program's modifications, which would include the removal of traffic signs and multiple blocks of red lane paint, would incur significant costs that SFMTA would prefer to avoid.

### **FUNDING IMPACT**

There is no funding impact associated with this project.

### **PUBLIC OUTREACH**

In 2013, prior to the launch of the Pilot, extensive outreach related to the Church Street improvements was conducted along the Church Street corridor. Specifically, mailers were sent to corridor area residents, posters were delivered to businesses along the corridor, and staff members conducted door-to-door merchant outreach about the upcoming changes. Additionally, fliers about the Pilot were provided to transit operators to both inform them about the changes to enable them to discuss them with riders and answer questions. Furthermore, after the installation of the modifications, executive-level Muni personnel conducted a walking tour of the corridor and discussed the red-painted transit-only lanes, as well as other changes, with members of the press.

### **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

Muni Forward Rapid Network Improvements  
(Formerly, the Transit Effectiveness Project)

The Transit Effectiveness Project Final Environmental Impact Report (FEIR) was certified by the San Francisco Planning Commission in Motion No. 19105 on March 27, 2014. On March 28, 2014, in Resolution No. 14-041, the SFMTA Board of Directors approved the Transit Effectiveness Project, including Travel Time Reduction Proposals (TTRP) to improve transit performance along various Municipal Railway routes, including the TTRP.J: J Church. The transit-only lanes on Church Street proposed here are included as part of the TTRP.J Expanded Alternative. As part of the Resolution No. 14-041, the SFMTA Board of Directors adopted findings under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the CEQA Guidelines, and Chapter 31 of the Administrative Code (CEQA Findings) and a Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP).

Because the SFMTA Board of Directors did not determine whether to approve the Moderate or Expanded TTRP.J when it approved the TEP as a whole on March 28, 2014, the SFMTA Board of Directors, in approving part of the TTRP.J Expanded Alternative, now adopts additional findings rejecting the TTRP.J Moderate Alternative as infeasible.

The City Attorney's Office has reviewed this calendar item.

**PAGE 5**

**RECOMMENDATION**

SFMTA staff recommends that the SFMTA Board of Directors approve traffic modifications to permanently implement transit-only lanes on Church Street, and amend Transportation Code, Division II, Section 601 to designate a transit-only lane on Church Street between 16<sup>th</sup> Street and Duboce Avenue in both directions.

SAN FRANCISCO  
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY  
BOARD OF DIRECTORS

RESOLUTION No. \_\_\_\_\_

WHEREAS, The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency has proposed traffic modifications to permanently implement transit-only lanes on Church Street as follows:

- A. ESTABLISH – TRANSIT AND TAXI ONLY LANE AT ALL TIMES - Church Street northbound, center lane, from 160 feet south of 16<sup>th</sup> Street to Duboce Avenue; and Church Street southbound, center lane, from 16<sup>th</sup> Street to Duboce Avenue.
- B. ESTABLISH – NO LEFT TURNS EXCEPT TRANSIT AND TAXIS, 7AM TO 7PM, MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY - Church Street, both directions, at 16<sup>th</sup> Street.
- C. ESTABLISH – NO LEFT TURNS, 7AM TO 7PM, MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY - Church Street, both directions, at 15<sup>th</sup> Street.

WHEREAS, This project was analyzed in the Transit Effectiveness Project Final Environmental Impact Report (FEIR) certified by the San Francisco Planning Commission in Motion No. 19105 on March 27, 2014, and referred to therein as the TTRP.J; and,

WHEREAS, Approval for the installation of various parking and traffic modifications along the Church Street corridor included in the Transit Effectiveness Project's (TEP) Service-Related Capital Improvements and Travel Time Reduction Proposals (TTRP) relies on said FEIR, and the findings information pertaining to the FEIR and its certification are set forth in a SFMTA Resolution No 14-041, which is on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Board of Directors and are incorporated herein by reference; and,

WHEREAS, As part of Resolution No. 14-041, the SFMTA Board of Directors adopted findings under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the CEQA Guidelines, and Chapter 31 of the Administrative Code (CEQA Findings) and a Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP), which Resolution, CEQA Findings, and MMRP are on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Board of Directors and are incorporated herein by reference as though fully set forth; and,

WHEREAS, The SFMTA Board adopts additional findings rejecting the TTRP.J Moderate Alternative as infeasible and supporting its approval of the proposed project, due to the fact that, while the Expanded Alternative includes all of the same parking and traffic improvements that are included in the Moderate Alternative, it also includes the implementation of new transit-only lanes in both directions on Church Street, which is not specified within the Moderate Alternative; and,

WHEREAS, Even though the Expanded Alternative is found to have a significant and unavoidable impact at one intersection within the project corridor, it offers substantial benefits that make it more favorable than the Moderate Alternative for implementation; specifically, the new transit-only lanes will provide dedicated lanes of passage for Muni vehicles on Church Street between Duboce Avenue and 16th Street, which is the most congested segment of both the J Church and 22 Fillmore transit corridors; and,

WHEREAS, Traffic congestion in this segment, which has traditionally caused substantial delays for 22 Fillmore and J Church vehicles operating in mixed lanes of traffic, has been shown to be the greatest cause of delays along the entire 22 and J corridors; and,

WHEREAS, With new transit-only lanes, 22 and J vehicles will be able to navigate the segment in dedicated, congestion-free lanes with minimal interaction with non-transit vehicles which will therefore allow reduced travel time and improved service reliability for the entire 22 and J corridors; and,

WHEREAS With more reliable transit service on two of its busiest lines, SFMTA will have fewer needs for last-minute service adjustments, a more stable service environment for resource-need assessment, and will be able to more reliably and effectively allocate transit resources and deliver service overall; and,

WHEREAS, The SFMTA Board has reviewed the FEIR and hereby finds that since certification of the FEIR, no changes have occurred in the proposed project or in the circumstances under which the project would be implemented that would cause new significant impacts or a substantial increase in the severity of impacts identified and analyzed in the FEIR, and that no new information has emerged that would materially change the analyses or conclusions set forth in the FEIR. The actions approved herein would no necessitate implementation or additional or considerably different mitigation measures that those identified in the FEIR; and,

WHEREAS, The public has been notified about the proposed modifications and has been given the opportunity to comment on those modifications through the public hearing process; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, The SFMTA Board of Directors has reviewed and considered the TEP EIR and record as a whole, and finds that the proposed approvals herein are within the scope of the TEP and incorporates the CEQA findings contained in Resolution No. 14-041, including the Statement of Overriding Considerations by this reference thereto as though fully set forth, and be it further

RESOLVED, That the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors approves traffic modifications set forth in items A through C above to permanently implement transit-only lanes on Church Street, and be it further

RESOLVED, That the San Francisco Municipal Agency Board of Directors amends Transportation Code, Division II, Section 601 to designate a transit-only lane on Church Street between 16<sup>th</sup> Street and Duboce Avenue in both directions; and be it further

RESOLVED, That the SFMTA Board adopts additional findings rejecting the Travel Time Reduction Proposals Moderate Alternative as infeasible.

I certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors at its meeting of June 2, 2015.

---

Secretary to the Board of Directors  
San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency

## RESOLUTION

[Transportation Code – Church Street Transit Only Lane]

### **Resolution amending Division II of the Transportation Code by amending Section 601 to designate transit only lanes in both directions on Church Street between 16th Street and Duboce Avenue.**

NOTE: Additions are single-underline Times New Roman;  
deletions are ~~strike-through Times New Roman~~.

The Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors of the City and County of San Francisco enacts the following regulations:

Section 1. Article 600 of Division II of the Transportation Code is hereby amended by amending Section 601, to read as follows:

#### **Sec. 601 DESIGNATED TRANSIT-ONLY AREAS.**

(a) The locations listed in this Section 601 are designated as Transit-only Areas. Any vehicle operating within a Transit-only Area during times that the Transit-only Area is enforced is in violation of Transportation Code, Division I, Section 7.2.72 (Driving in Transit-only Area).

(1) **Cable Car Lanes On Powell Street Between California Street and Sutter Street.** Except as to cable cars, Municipal Railway vehicles, and authorized emergency vehicles, no vehicle may operate within, over, upon or across the cable car lanes, or make any left or U-turn on the exclusive cable car lanes on Powell Street between California and Sutter Streets except to pass a disabled vehicle.

(2) **West Portal Avenue Between 15th Avenue and Sloat Boulevard.** Except as to streetcars and Municipal Railway vehicles, no vehicle may operate within Transit-only Areas on West Portal Avenue between 15th Avenue and Sloat Boulevard.

(3) **Exclusive Commercial Vehicle/Transit Area on Sansome Street.** Except as to buses, taxis, authorized emergency vehicles, and commercial vehicles, no

vehicle may operate within the Transit-only Area running southbound on Sansome Street between Washington Street and Bush Street.

(4) **Judah Street, from 9th Avenue to 20th Avenue.** Except as to streetcars and Municipal Railway vehicles, no vehicle may operate within Transit-only Areas on Judah Street from 9th Avenue to 20th Avenue.

(5) **Other Transit-Only Areas.** Except for buses, taxicabs, vehicles preparing to make a turn, vehicles entering into or existing from a stopped position at the curb, and vehicles entering into or exiting from a driveway, no vehicle may operate in the following Transit-only Areas during the times indicated:

	<b>Hours of Operation</b>	<b>Street</b>	<b>From</b>	<b>To</b>
1	All Times	1st St.	Market St.	Howard St.
2		3rd St.	Townsend St.	Market St.
3		4th St.	Harrison St.	Townsend St.
4		4th St.	Market St.	Howard St.
5		<u>Church St.</u>	<u>16th St.</u>	<u>DuBoce Ave.</u>
6		Clay St.	Sansome St.	Davis St.
7		Fremont St.	Mission St.	Market St.
8		Geary St.	Market St.	Powell St.
9		Geary St.	Mason St.	Gough St.
10		Judah St.	20th Ave.	La Playa St.
11		Market St. (Inbound)	12th St.	5th St.
12		Market St. (Outbound)	So. Van Ness Ave.	8th St.
13	All Times	O'Farrell St.	Gough St.	Hyde St.
14		O'Farrell St.	Jones St.	Powell St.
15		Post St.	Gough St.	Grant St.
16		Potrero Ave. (SB)	25th St.	18th St.

	<b>Hours of Operation</b>	<b>Street</b>	<b>From</b>	<b>To</b>
17		Stockton St.	Bush St.	Geary St.
18		Sutter St.	Gough St.	Kearny St.
19	7:00 AM-7:00 PM, Monday-Friday	Sacramento St.	Drumm St.	Kearny St.
20	7:00 AM-7:00 PM, Monday-Saturday	Stockton St.	Geary St.	O'Farrell St.
21	7:00 AM-6:00 PM, Monday-Friday	Mission St. (Inbound)	5th St.	Beale St.
22		Mission St. (Outbound)	Main St.	4th Street
23	7:00 AM-9:00 PM, Monday-Friday	Mission St. (Inbound)	11th St.	5th St.
24		O'Farrell St.	Hyde St.	Jones St.
25		Clay St.	Powell St.	Battery St.
26	4:00 PM-6:00 PM, Monday-Friday	Mission St. (Inbound)	11th St.	5th St.
27		Mission St. (Outbound)	4th St.	11th St.
28		Geary St.	Mason St.	Powell St.
29		Sacramento St.	Kearny St.	Larkin St.
30	3:00 PM-6:00 PM, Monday-Friday	Sutter St.	Sansome St.	Kearny St.
31	3:00 PM-7:00 PM, Monday-Friday	Bush St.	Montgomery St.	Battery St.
32		4th St.	Howard St.	Clementina

Section 2. Effective Date. This ordinance shall become effective 31 days after enactment. Enactment occurs when the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors approves this ordinance.

Section 3. Scope of Ordinance. In enacting this ordinance, the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors intends to amend only those words, phrases, paragraphs, subsections, sections, articles, numbers, letters, punctuation marks, charts, diagrams, or any other constituent parts of the Transportation Code that are

explicitly shown in this ordinance as additions or deletions in accordance with the "Note" that appears under the official title of the ordinance.

APPROVED AS TO FORM:  
DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney

By: \_\_\_\_\_  
JOHN I. KENNEDY  
Deputy City Attorney

I certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors at its meeting of June 2, 2015.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Secretary to the Board of Directors  
San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency