ATTACHMENT A

California Environmental Quality Act Findings

Based upon substantial evidence in the record of this proceeding and pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act ("CEQA"), California Public Resources Code Sections 21000 et seq.; the Guidelines for Implementation of CEQA, 14 California Code of Regulations Sections 15000 et seq.; and Chapter 31 of the San Francisco Administrative Code, the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors makes and adopts the following findings of fact in support of the determination that the proposed Commuter Shuttle Program and Transportation Code amendments (herein after "Commuter Shuttle Program") are exempt from environmental review under the Class 1 and Class 8 categorical exemptions from CEQA:

1. Based on substantial evidence in the record, including the data, information, and analysis identified in these findings, the San Francisco Planning Department determined that the physical improvements proposed as part of the Commuter Shuttle Program is exempt from environmental review under Section 15301 of the CEQA Guidelines (Class 1), which exempts from environmental review minor alterations to existing highways and streets, sidewalks, gutters, bicycle and pedestrian trails, and similar facilities. Based on substantial evidence in the record, the proposed modifications to install minor improvements such as signage, boarding islands, and bus bulbs, are minor modifications of existing roadways, and are therefore exempt from environmental review under CEQA.

2. Based on substantial evidence in the record, including the data, information, and analysis identified in these findings, the San Francisco Planning Department determined that the Commuter Shuttle Program is exempt from environmental review under the Section 15308 of the CEQA Guidelines (Class 8), which exempts from environmental review actions taken by regulatory agencies, as authorized by state or local ordinance, to assure the maintenance, restoration, enhancement, or protection of the environment where the regulatory process involves procedures for protection of the environment. The record demonstrates that, in the absence of regulations governing commuter shuttle operations, those operations can lead to conflicts with Muni and with vehicular, bicycle, and pedestrian traffic and safety. The record also demonstrates that, if commuter shuttle operations were not available within the City, then 47% of shuttle riders would instead drive alone to work or school, leading to increased traffic congestion and air emissions throughout the region. The record further demonstrates that ongoing commuter shuttle operations that are controlled, monitored, and enforced through the Commuter Shuttle Program will enhance the environment. The Commuter Shuttle Program includes features that will enhance and protect the environment, such as fleet turnover requirements, restrictions on stopping outside of major and minor arterials, idling limits, and minor

roadway modifications that will improve vehicular, bicycle, and pedestrian safety, decrease conflicts between commuter shuttles and other transportation modes, and improve regional traffic congestion and air emissions. Accordingly, based on substantial evidence in the record, the Commuter Shuttle Program is an action taken by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency to assure the enhancement and protection of the environment, and does not result in construction activities or a relaxation of standards allowing environmental degradation.

3. Based on substantial evidence in the record, and the specific factual findings above, there is no reasonable possibility that the Commuter Shuttle Program will have a significant adverse effect on the environment due to unusual circumstances. Specifically, the Planning Department and the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors have determined that the Commuter Shuttle Program does not have any features distinguishing it from other projects in the Class 1 and Class 8 exemptions under CEQA, and the program will not have any significant environmental effects under CEQA. The physical changes that will occur as part of the program are minor in scale and number and do not involve environmentally sensitive locations. Further, the program does not present unusual circumstances because the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency regularly adjusts and adapts its traffic control regulations, and makes minor alterations to existing roadways, such as signage, bulbouts and boarding islands, for purposes of reducing vehicular conflicts, protecting bicyclists and pedestrians, and increasing the efficiency of existing roadway systems.

4. In the absence of a Commuter Shuttle Program, commuter shuttles could and would be expected to operate on non-arterial streets without commercial vehicle weight restrictions; and to load and unload passengers at near-side bus stops, white zones, vacant curb areas, or even in travel lanes on both arterial and non-arterial streets. These practices, which the Commuter Shuttle Program would regulate or prohibit, often result in delays to traffic and Muni service, and affect the safety of Muni patrons by requiring them to enter roadways to board Muni buses, and can affect the safety of both bicyclists and pedestrians. Key components of the Commuter Shuttle Program will reduce substantially the possibility and likelihood of these unregulated practices and effects, and there is substantial evidence in the record before this Board that there will be no significant adverse impacts to public transit or to bicyclist or pedestrian safety.

5. The Commuter Shuttle Program directs commuter shuttle activity of large commuter shuttle buses toward major and minor arterial streets as determined by the California Department of Transportation, and away from non-arterial streets in residential neighborhoods. Based on the data gathered by San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency staff during the Pilot Program, and analyzed by the San Francisco Planning

Department's Environmental Planning Division, and other information presented to this Board, there is substantial evidence in the record that the relatively minor increase in commuter shuttle activity on arterial streets and at arterial intersections compared to existing traffic will not substantially degrade traffic capacity or operations, and there will be no significant adverse impact on traffic operations on arterial roadways or at intersections.

6. As part of the Commuter Shuttle Program, certain commuter shuttles may utilize designated Muni bus stop zones for shuttle loading and unloading. Based on the data gathered by San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency staff during the Pilot Program, and analyzed by the San Francisco Planning Department's Environmental Planning Division, and other information presented to this Board, there is no significant impact on Muni operations.

7. Commuter shuttles share roadways in San Francisco with bicycles and pedestrians. The Commuter Shuttle Program will modify certain commuter shuttle stop lengths and locations on an ongoing basis, will add additional enforcement at high-activity locations, including the assignment of more traffic control officers, and will require program participants to certify that drivers have completed driver safety training consistent with the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency's Large Vehicle Urban Driving Safety Program. Based on the data gathered by San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency staff during the Pilot Program, and analyzed by the San Francisco Planning Department's Environmental Planning Division, and other information presented to this Board, there is substantial evidence in the record that there will be no significant adverse impacts to bicycle or pedestrian facilities from the Commuter Shuttle Program.

8. Based on substantial evidence in the record, the Commuter Shuttle Program will not result in significant adverse impacts to commercial loading.

9. At the direction of the San Francisco Planning Department, Ramboll Environ, an air quality expert consultant whose credentials are contained in the record, prepared an Air Quality Technical Report to assess regional criteria air pollutants and potential localized health risk impacts that might be associated with the Commuter Shuttle Program. Ramboll Environ analyzed likely emissions from commuter shuttles, and factored in the Commuter Shuttle Program requirement that all new commuter shuttles entering the Program have model year 2012 or equivalent engines, and that by 2020, all active commuter shuttles be no more than eight years old or equivalent, requiring fleet turnover on a rolling basis. Based on these Program requirements, as well as data gathered by San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency staff during the Pilot Program, Ramboll Environ determined that emissions of the criteria air pollutants reactive organic gases,

particulate matter, and carbon dioxide would decrease, while nitrogen oxide emissions would increase as a result of use of diesel-powered buses; the nitrogen oxide emissions, however, would be below the thresholds of significance propounded by the Bay Area Air Quality Management District, and accordingly, based on substantial evidence in the record, no significant criteria air pollutant impacts would occur.

10. Ramboll Environ also conducted a localized health risk assessment of toxic air contaminants, taking into account San Francisco's unique Air Pollutant Exposure Zones, where a lower threshold of significance is used than what is propounded by the Bay Area Air Quality Management District. Ramboll Environ modeled four representative local impact zones and determined that increases in lifetime cancer risk and shuttle-generated particulate matter emissions would be below these lower applicable thresholds of significance, and accordingly, based on substantial evidence in the record, no significant localized health risk impacts would occur.

11. The Commuter Shuttle Program could also add noise, both during construction of capital improvements and during operations; however, the Program would not result in environmental degradation. Because construction will be required to comply with the San Francisco Noise Ordinance, as well as the Public Works Code and other Department of Public Works regulations, and because it would be temporary, indirect construction noise impacts will be less than significant. The San Francisco Planning Department considered and relied on the noise analysis contained in the 2014 Transit Effectiveness Project Environmental Impact Report to estimate noise that could be generated by commuter shuttles, and the Planning Department determined that the minor amount of noise generated by commuter shuttles would be considered common and generally acceptable in an urban area, and therefore, based on substantial evidence in the record, the Commuter Shuttle Program will not cause a significant noise impact or environmental degradation.

12. Although some members of the public have asserted that the commuter shuttles contribute to increased housing costs and housing displacement, the Commuter Shuttle Program will not eliminate any housing units. Any physical impacts associated with increased housing costs would be related to the construction of replacement housing for displaced residents, or increased trip lengths and emissions for displaced residents. However, there is no demonstrable evidence of physical displacement of individuals from housing units attributable to commuter shuttles, and if such displacement were to occur as a result of the Commuter Shuttle Program, there is no basis to assess where such individuals would relocate and what their travel behavior would entail. Because there is no demonstrated causative link between shuttle use and housing demand or price, and there is no foreseeable displacement associated with the Program, analysis of any such

impacts would be speculative with regard to their scale and nature. Based on substantial evidence in the record, the Commuter Shuttle Program will not cause any significant adverse impacts related to or caused by housing displacement.

13. The Commuter Shuttle Program will not result in any changes in land use, urban design or long range views, cultural resources, biological resources, greenhouse gas emissions, wind, shadow, utilities and service systems, geology and soils, hydrology or water quality, mineral resources or agricultural and forest resources, and no new hazardous waste will be generated. In addition, Commuter Shuttle Program implementation may reduce already less-than-significant effects on emergency vehicle access by reducing congestion. Based on substantial evidence in the record, the Commuter Shuttle Program will not cause any significant adverse impacts or environmental degradation in these impact areas.